

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



JUNE 24, 2024

1                   **TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE**

2                                   **MONDAY, JUNE 24, 2024 9:30 AM**

3

4   **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR ATTENDING  
5 AND FOR PARTICIPATING IN THIS MEETING, AND ALSO THE  
6 COMMISSIONERS WHO ARE ATTENDING, WE WOULD LIKE FULL  
7 PARTICIPATION NO ONE'S CLOSED OUT OF THIS PROCESS. THE  
8 PROCESS WE'LL DO TODAY IS WE'LL HAVE ROLL CALL AND I'LL HAVE  
9 SOME OPENING COMMENTS THEN I'LL INTRODUCE OUR FACILITATOR  
10 TODAY AND THE PROCESS WE'RE GOING TO GO THROUGH SO EVERYONE  
11 WILL HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY. THE CHALLENGE IS, OF COURSE, FOR  
12 EVERYBODY TO PARTICIPATE THERE, ARE A LOT OF LESSONS LEARNED  
13 WITH 1031. AND I'LL HAVE THAT IN SOME OF MY COMMENTS. WILL  
14 CLERK TAKE ROLL.

15

16   **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** PEDROZA?

17

18   **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

19

20   **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT. ARANTES?

21

22   **JOHN ARANTES:** HERE.

23

24   **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** JOHN-BAPTISTE? MEMBER CANEPA?

25



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER CHAVEZ?

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** LAWRENCE IS ABSENT. LEON?

8

9 **MANNY LEON:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER LEVIN?

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER LINDSAY?

16

17 **JAMES LINDSAY:** PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MILEY? IS ABSENT. MEMBER

20 MOHTASHEMI?

21

22 **RAAYAN MOHTASHEMI:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER NOACK?

25



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER SPERING?

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER WU?

8

9 **ELLEN WU:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER WUNDERMAN?

12

13 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** CHAIR, WE DO HAVE A QUORUM AND WITH  
16 THAT QUORUM, WE DO HAVE TWO MEMBERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO  
17 INVOKE AB 2449.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. SO, WHO ARE THE TWO MEMBERS?

20

21 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THAT WOULD BE COMMISSIONER  
22 MOULTON-PETERS, AS WELL AS MEMBER MAHAN.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. I DON'T SEE HER ON MY SCREEN. DOES  
25 SHE HAVE TO RESTATE HER LOCATION?



JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THEY'RE NOT YET IN THE ZOOM SPACE,  
3 BUT WE DO EXPECT THEM MOMENTARILY. SO, WHEN THEY JOIN, I'LL  
4 LET YOU KNOW. THEN YOU CAN INVOKE THEM IN.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. VERY GOOD.

7

8 **MATT MAHAN:** CLERK, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU CAN HEAR ME; I'M ON  
9 THE CALL.

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THE MAYOR IS WITH US. GOOD TO HEAR  
12 FROM YOU, MATT.

13

14 **ALICIA LAWRENCE:** THIS IS ALISIA LAWRENCE FROM SENATOR WAHAB'S  
15 OFFICE. I'M ALSO ON THE CALL.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. OKAY. I'M GOING TO HAVE  
18 COMMENTS. AND STUART --

19

20 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** SORRY TO INTERRUPT, MR. CHAIR.  
21 THERE IS A SCRIPT THAT NEEDS TO BE READ FOR THE INVOCATION OF  
22 AB 2449 FOR MAYOR MAHAN. IF WE COULD DO THAT BEFORE YOU MOVE  
23 FORWARD. THAT WOULD BE FANTASTIC. THANK YOU.

24



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. A QUORUM IS PRESENT -- REMOTE  
2 COMMISSION STATES I'M REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE -- IS THAT IT?

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** YES.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. MATT, DO YOU WANT TO -- MAYOR MAHAN,  
7 DID YOU WANT TO REVEAL YOUR LOCATION.

8

9 **MATT MAHAN:** CHAIR, I'M SORRY. I DON'T HAVE THE SCRIPT IN FRONT  
10 OF ME. I APOLOGIZE. I THOUGHT, FOR THIS COMMITTEE, IT WAS NOT  
11 REQUIRED BECAUSE IT'S AD-HOC.

12

13 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGH THE CHAIR. ALL WE NEED TO KNOW, AS  
14 I'VE -- AND I BELIEVE I CAN STATE THIS BASED ON INFORMATION -  
15 - BELIEVE THAT YOU HAVE A BUSINESS NECESSITY REASON TO NEED TO  
16 INVOKE AB 2449, AND THAT YOU WILL BE PARTICIPATING REMOTELY.

17

18 **MATT MAHAN:** THAT'S CORRECT. DO YOU NEED ME TO RESTATE THAT?

19

20 **KATHLEEN KANE:** NO.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NO. DOES HE NEED TO DIVULGE HIS LOCATION  
23 OR? NO. OKAY. ALL RIGHT, MAYOR, YOU'RE ON BOARD, AND YOU'RE  
24 LEGAL TO VOTE AND PARTICIPATE. GOOD TO HAVE YOU WITH US  
25 TODAY. MY COMMENTS ARE GOING TO BE VERY SIMILAR TO WHEN CHAIR



JUNE 24, 2024

1 PEDROZA ASKED ME TO CHAIR THE COMMITTEE. AND SO, I FELT IT'S  
2 IMPORTANT SOME OF THESE ISSUES GET REPEATED. COVID BROUGHT  
3 US TOGETHER AND WE MET THE CHALLENGE WORKING WITH OUR FEDERAL  
4 PARTNERS. WE WERE ABLE TO SUSTAIN TRANSIT FOR SEVERAL YEARS  
5 TO MOVE THE FISCAL CLIFF INTO THE NEAR FUTURE. I CAN'T SAY  
6 ENOUGH ABOUT THE GOOD WORK THAT THE MTC COMMISSION HAS DONE,  
7 AND MTC STAFF HAS DONE OVER THE PAST FIVE YEARS. SO, A LOT OF  
8 WORK HAS BEEN DONE, THAT HAS HELPED STABILIZE THE CRISIS  
9 WE'RE IN. TODAY WE FACE A SIMILAR CHALLENGE, AND I'M  
10 CONFIDENT WORKING TOGETHER WE CAN BUILD TOGETHER A REGIONAL  
11 CONSENSUS, SIMILAR TO WHAT WE DID ON OTHER THE BLUE RIBBON  
12 RECOMMENDATIONS. WE ALSO EXPERIENCED HOW TRANSIT DEPENDENT  
13 RIDERS NEED PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND WHY I BRING UP THIS ISSUE UP  
14 IS TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS WILL BE IMPACTED THE MOST IF WE  
15 DON'T FIND A SOLUTION TO OUR FISCAL CLIFF MANY OF OUR  
16 OPERATORS FACE. WE NEED TO ESTABLISH A COLLECTIVE VISION OF  
17 PRIORITIES TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT FACES THE FUTURE  
18 OF TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. A LOT HAS CHANGED OVER THE PAST  
19 FOUR YEARS. ONE THING THAT HASN'T CHANGED IS BAY AREA TRANSIT  
20 FACES A CHALLENGING FUTURE THAT IN SOME CORRIDORS WILL BUILD  
21 INTO A FULL-ON CRISIS. AS I SEE IT, OUR JOB HERE IS TO COME  
22 UP WITH A SERIES OF RECOMMENDATIONS THAT CAN BE SUPPORTED BY  
23 THE FULL COMMISSION. AND I'M GRATEFUL TO HAVE THE  
24 PARTICIPATION AND SUPPORT OF MY COLLEAGUES, CHAIR PEDROZA AND  
25 VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. MOST IMPORTANTLY OUR WORK MUST ATTRACT



JUNE 24, 2024

1 SUPPORT BY MEMBERS OF THE STATE LEGISLATURE, AND ULTIMATELY,  
2 MOST IMPORTANTLY THE BAY AREA VOTERS WHO WILL BE THE DECISION  
3 MAKERS ON THIS ISSUE. IT'S A CRISIS THAT WON'T GO AWAY ON ITS  
4 OWN. THIS COMMITTEE HAS OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS A REGIONAL  
5 PROBLEM THAT WE CAN SUPPORT AND SEEK LEGISLATIVE ACTION. WE  
6 MUST ALSO RECOGNIZE THAT OUR POST-COVID EMPLOYMENT PATTERNS  
7 ARE HERE TO STAY AND CREATE A MUCH MORE DIFFICULT CHALLENGE  
8 FOR SOME OF THE AGENCIES AS OPPOSED TO OTHERS. ANY WORK WE DO  
9 HERE, HOWEVER, WILL ALMOST CERTAINLY NEED TO BE ACCOMPANIED  
10 BY ACTIONS FROM OTHERS AS WHAT COVID HAS BROUGHT IS MUCH  
11 BIGGER THAN ANY ONE OF US CAN TAKE. MANY AGENCIES HAVE  
12 RESPONDED TO REDUCED COMMUTER RIDERSHIP DEMAND IS DONE, AC  
13 TRANSIT HAS DONE TO ADJUST ITS SERVICE PROFILE, AND, ALSO,  
14 REDIRECT SERVICES TO ROUTES THAT SERVICE MORE OF ITS TRANSIT  
15 DEPENDENT CUSTOMERS. GOLDEN GATE HAS TAKEN MANY DIFFICULT  
16 SERVICE REDUCTIONS DECISIONS. IT HAS HUSBAND FEDERAL AND STATE  
17 FUNDS AND TOOK ACTION THAT ONLY IT CAN DO BY RAISING BRIDGE  
18 TOLLS TO SUPPORT TRANSIT SERVICES. A SPECIFIC EXAMPLE IS  
19 BART'S PRIOR BUSINESS MODEL ACUTELY DISRUPTED BY COVID, AND  
20 IT'S ALMOST CERTAIN THAT THIS DISRUPTION IS AS PERMANENT AS WE  
21 CAN SEE INTO THE FUTURE. AS A RESULT THIS COMMITTEE IS GOING  
22 TO DELVE DEEPLY INTO BART ISSUES AND THE DOMINOS WILL START TO  
23 FALL IF WE CAN'T FORGE CONSENSUS NEEDED TO NOT ONLY PASS  
24 LEGISLATION BUT THE EVEN HARDER TASK OF CONVINCING VOTERS TO  
25 PASS A MEASURE. AN EFFECTIVE IMPROVED PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM





JUNE 24, 2024

1 FOR THE BAY AREA IMPORTANT FOR ALL OF US. REGARDLESS OF WHERE  
2 YOU LIVE AND WORK, TRANSIT MATTERS TO ALL OF US. OUR POLLS  
3 SHOW, OVER THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS, THEY HAVE SHOW THAT BAY  
4 AREA VOTERS GET THIS, REGARDLESS OF HOW THEY TRAVEL. I'M  
5 ASKING THIS COMMISSION TO SET ASIDE THE ARGUMENTS OF THE  
6 RECENT PAST SO WE CAN ALL EMERGENCY AS PART OF A SOLUTION. I  
7 WANT TO REPEAT WHAT I SAID TO CHAIR PEDROZA WHEN I TOOK ON  
8 THIS CHAIRMANSHIP, IS THAT ANY SOLUTION THAT WE RECOMMEND  
9 CANNOT BE AT THE EXPENSE OF ANY COUNTY IN THIS REGION. THIS  
10 MEASURE NEEDS TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF AND TRANSPORTATION  
11 IMPROVEMENTS THAT VOTERS WANT. WE ARE NOT AMENDING SB1031.  
12 AND THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT. THIS IS A RESET AN IMPORTANT  
13 MOMENT TO HEAL DIVISIONS THAT EMERGED AND TO REASSURE OUR  
14 COLLEAGUES THROUGHOUT THE REGION THAT THEIR CONCERNS WERE  
15 HEARD AND ACTED UPON. THIS IS IN PART WHY WE'RE HERE TODAY. A  
16 BETTER TRANSPORTATION NETWORK IS GOING TO TAKE MORE MONEY FOR  
17 TRANSIT OPERATIONS, TO BE SURE. BUT WE HAVE TO KEEP OUR MINDS  
18 OPEN FOR OTHER PRIORITIES THAT VOTERS VALUE IN ORDER TO  
19 CREATE A MEASURE THAT'S WIDELY SUPPORTED. OUR JOB IS TO COME  
20 UP WITH A SOLUTION THAT WORKS FOR THE MEMBERS OF THIS SELECT  
21 COMMITTEE AND THE COMMISSION, THAT ALSO ATTRACTS SUPPORT BY  
22 MEMBERS OF STATE LEGISLATURE AND BAY AREA VOTERS. THERE IS A  
23 LOT OF WORK TO BE DONE AND NOT A LOT OF TIME TO DO IT. WE'RE  
24 ON A SHORT TIME FRAME. I CAN'T STRESS ENOUGH THAT THIS  
25 COMMITTEE NEEDS TO WORK TOGETHER. IT'S IMPORTANT THAT EACH



JUNE 24, 2024

1 COMMITTEE MEMBER EXPRESS THEIR INTEREST, CONCERNS, AND ANY  
2 OPTION YOU FEEL NEEDS TO BE CONSIDERED SHOULD BE BROUGHT  
3 FORWARD. WITH THAT SAID, NOW I WOULD LIKE TO INTRODUCE OUR  
4 FACILITATOR, STUART COHEN. NOW, STUART -- STUART GO BACK 27,  
5 28 YEARS. WE HAVE ASKED STUART TO FACILITATE THIS PROCESS, AND  
6 I THINK HE'S THE RIGHT PERSON TO HELP US FORGE A REGIONAL  
7 CONSENSUS. I FIRST MET STUART 27 YEARS AGO WHEN HE FOUNDED  
8 TRANSFORM AND LED A REGIONAL CAMPAIGN FOR MORE TRANSIT  
9 OPERATIONS FUNDING IN MTC'S REGION'S TRANSPORTATION PLAN.  
10 BUILT A STRONG BASE OF SUPPORT THAT INSTEAD OF ADOPTING THE  
11 PLAN ON TIME, WE VOTED TO DELAY IT AND WENT ON TO IDENTIFY  
12 FULL FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS. STUART WAS EXECUTIVE  
13 DIRECTOR OF TRANSFORM FOR OVER 22 YEARS. HE HAS A VAST  
14 EXPERIENCE WITH FUNDING MEASURES AND HAVING WORKED ON SEVERAL  
15 COUNTY SALES TAX MEASURES AND THE COMMITTEE THAT DEVELOPED  
16 RM2. HE IS A CONSENSUS BUILDER AND HAS CHAIRED COALITIONS OF  
17 ENVIRONMENTAL EQUITY AND HEALTH GROUPS AT THE STATE AND  
18 REGIONAL LEVEL. STUART IS ALSO -- HAS ALSO COLLABORATED  
19 CLOSELY WITH LABOR, ONCE COLEADING TRANSWORK, A COALITION OF  
20 TRANSIT LABOR UNIONS. FINALLY, STUART IS STRONG AT POLICY AND  
21 FRAMING THE ISSUES. I SPOKE WITH STUART AND WAS IMPRESSED WITH  
22 HIS KNOWLEDGE OF SB1031, AND KNOWLEDGE AND THE HEADWINDS WE  
23 RAN INTO. HIS KNOWLEDGE OF WHAT IT WILL TAKE TO GET  
24 LEGISLATIVE AND VOTER SUPPORT FOR THIS MEASURE IS THE  
25 EXPERIENCE WE'RE LOOKING FOR. I HOPE YOU ALL AGREE THAT WE'LL



JUNE 24, 2024

1 ALL BENEFIT FROM HAVING STUART FACILITATING THE SELECT  
2 COMMITTEE, AND I WANT TO WELCOME AND INTRODUCE STUART COHEN.  
3 THANK YOU, STUART.

4

5 **STUART COHEN:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING, COMMISSIONERS, AND  
6 MEMBERS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE. IT'S GREAT TO SEE MANY OF  
7 YOU, AND I REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR ENTRUSTING ME WITH  
8 THIS ROLE. IT IS AN HONOR, AN EXCITING CHALLENGE. AND AS  
9 CHAIR SPERING NOTED, WE NEED TO IDENTIFY A CONSENSUS FRAMEWORK  
10 SO WE CAN STAND TOGETHER AS A REGION, BOTH IN FRONT OF THE  
11 LEGISLATURE AND IN FRONT OF THE VOTERS IF THIS IS GOING TO  
12 WORK. A GLOWING EXAMPLE OF THE POWER OF CONSENSUS CAME OUT OF  
13 THE VERY FIRST FUNDING MEASURE I WAS A PART OF AND THAT WAS  
14 ALAMEDA MEASURE B IN 2000. NOW, THE ORIGINAL MEASURE B, IN  
15 1998, HAD OPPOSITION FROM SEVERAL ENVIRONMENTAL AND EQUITY  
16 GROUPS. AND IT LOST AT THE BALLOT WITH 58% OF THE VOTE. IT WAS  
17 NOT A PRESIDENTIAL YEAR. SO, MAYBE 3- OR 4% OF THAT, YOU KNOW,  
18 COULD HAVE BEEN ATTRIBUTED TO THAT, BUT STILL, A 9% LOSS WAS  
19 SIGNIFICANT. SO, TRANSFORM FACILITATED AN ENVIRONMENTAL AND  
20 EQUITY COALITION, BUILT BRIDGES WITH THE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
21 AND IN OVER SIX MONTH WE CRAFTED A MEASURE THAT HAD ADDITIONAL  
22 PUBLIC TRANSIT FUNDING IN IT FROM THE '98 MEASURE THAT WAS THE  
23 MAIN CHANGE BUT CRITICALLY BUILT CONSENSUS SUPPORT. TO THE  
24 VOTERS THAT MEASURE LOOKED ALMOST EXACTLY THE SAME. BUT NOW  
25 IT HAD NO ORGANIZED OPPOSITION TWO YEARS LATER I WANT TO DO A



JUNE 24, 2024

1 QUIZ TO START OFF DOES ANYONE REMEMBER THE MARGIN THAT MEASURE  
2 B GOT IN 2000 AT THE POLLS? NOBODY REMEMBERS? ALL RIGHT. IT'S  
3 OBSCURE. I REMEMBER, THIS WAS MY FIRST ONE, AND YOU ALWAYS  
4 REMEMBER YOUR FIRST MEASURE, AND IT GOT 81% AT THE POLLS, IT  
5 WENT UP BY 23% AND THE MAIN CHANGE WAS THERE HAD BEEN  
6 OPPOSITION. IT WAS A TRULY STRONG CONSENSUS. WE'RE GOING TO  
7 NEED THAT KIND OF CONSENSUS MOVING FORWARD TO MAKE THIS WORK.  
8 WITHOUT CONSENSUS TRANSIT AGENCIES WILL NEED TO START MAKING  
9 THEIR OWN PLANS QUICKLY TO FILL SOME OF THOSE SHORTFALLS. WE  
10 HAVE FOUR MONTHS TO PULL THIS TOGETHER. WE ARE STARTING WITH A  
11 CLEAN SLATE, STARTING WITH OPEN MINDS. THOSE OF US STAFFING  
12 THE COMMITTEE WILL WORK AS HARD AS POSSIBLE, TO HAVE NO  
13 SURPRISES. WE'RE GOING TO LAY OUT OPTIONS, CONFRONT TRADE-  
14 OFFS, AND BRING FORWARD ANY NEW IDEAS THAT COME TO US. WE'RE  
15 OPEN TO NEW IDEAS BECAUSE THE LAST ONE DIDN'T WORK PERFECTLY.  
16 SO, WE'RE ALSO GOING TO WORK TO HAVE A REALLY STRONG LEVEL OF  
17 TRANSPARENCY AND CLARITY IN THE PROCESS. AND IF YOU HAVE  
18 SUGGESTIONS ON HOW THE PROCESS CAN BE APPROVED, AS WE --  
19 IMPROVED, AS WE WORK THROUGH IT, PLEASE COME TO US. WE  
20 REALLY WANT TO MAKE THIS SOMETHING THAT EVERYBODY CAN BE PART  
21 OF AND UNDERSTAND. AND, SO, SO, I THINK THE IMPORTANT THING AS  
22 WE TALK ABOUT A BLANK SLATE IS WE'RE NOT STARTING FROM  
23 NOTHING. WE HAVE SOME INCREDIBLE FOUNDATION TO BUILD ON, FROM  
24 THE WORK OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION TASK FORCE WHICH HAS  
25 NOW LED TO ALL THE ONGOING WORK FROM THE COUNTY



JUNE 24, 2024

1 TRANSPORTATION COUNTY AUTHORITIES, TRANSIT OPERATORS, AND  
2 OTHER STAKEHOLDERS THAT ARE PUTTING THAT EFFORT IN AS PART OF  
3 THE REGIONAL NETWORK, MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE, AND OTHER WORK  
4 GROUPS. SO, THERE, IS SO MUCH GOOD WORK TO BUILD ON. WE HAVE  
5 THE POLLS THAT MTC AND OTHERS HAVE BEEN DOING RECENTLY. WE  
6 HAVE THE ENGAGEMENT RESULTS FROM PLANNED BAY AREA FROM LAST  
7 YEAR THAT ARE STILL ONGOING NOW, SO, THIS PROCESS IS REALLY  
8 EMBEDDED IN ALL OF THOSE PLANS. AND WE HAVE TO REMEMBER THAT  
9 THE PUBLIC DOESN'T WANT US TO JUST WANT STOP, YOU KNOW,  
10 SHORTFALLS FROM RUINING OUR SYSTEMS, THEY WANT A BETTER  
11 SYSTEM. AND IF WE CAN'T SHOW THEM THAT WE ARE GOING TO HAVE A  
12 BETTER SYSTEM WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET ANYWHERE THAT HAS TO BE  
13 PART OF THE CONVERSATION, AS WELL. SO FINAL THING I'LL SAY IS  
14 THAT WE REALLY WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ENGAGING THE  
15 LEGISLATORS, ALL OF THEM, FROM THE BAY AREA. WE'RE HAPPY TO  
16 HAVE RAAVAN AND ALISIA ATTENDING AS REPRESENTATIVES TODAY AND  
17 WELCOME OTHERS TO PARTICIPATE. AND WE'LL BE REACHING OUT TO  
18 THEM CLOSELY. SO, WITH THAT, LET'S RESTART THE RICH  
19 CONVERSATIONS THAT STOPPED A COUPLE OF WEEKS AGO, AND ON TO  
20 THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM, LET'S MOVE TO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM WHERE  
21 WE'LL DO SELECT COMMITTEE INTRODUCTIONS.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** EXCUSE ME, THROUGH THE CHAIR, IF I  
24 MAY? I JUST WANT TO MAKE YOU AWARE THAT COMMISSIONER MOULTON-  
25 PETERS HAS JOINED US, IF YOU WANTED TO --



JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** STEPHANIE, GOOD MORNING. SO, SHE DOESN'T  
3 NEED TO SAY ANYTHING ELSE? DO I NEED TO READ THIS?

4

5 **KATHLEEN KANE:** COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS, IN THIS CONTEXT  
6 YOU'RE ASKING TO PARTICIPATE VIA AB 2449; IS THAT RIGHT?

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES, I'M REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE  
9 REMOTELY UNDER AB 2449 BUSINESS NEED. THERE IS NONE PRESENT IN  
10 THE ROOM WITH ME.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. NEXT ON OUR AGENDA IS THE SELECT  
13 COMMITTEE INTRODUCTIONS. I WOULD LIKE TO, ADINA, START WITH  
14 YOU AND COME AROUND. IF EACH COMMITTEE MEMBER WITH INTRODUCE  
15 THEMSELVES AND TELL US WHAT YOUR EXPECTATION IS FOR THIS  
16 COMMITTEE AND WHAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO SEE US ACCOMPLISH?

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, ADINA LEVIN, COEXECUTIVE DIRECTOR WITH  
19 SEAMLESS BAY AREA, AND ALSO, SEPARATELY, THE CHAIR OF THE  
20 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP FOR THE  
21 NETWORK MANAGEMENT INITIATIVE CAN MTC AND TRANSIT AGENCIES.  
22 AND, YOU KNOW, AT SEAMLESS, WE ARE REALLY FOCUSED ON ACHIEVING  
23 A WORLD CLASS HIGH RIDERSHIP, EQUITABLE, AND ACCESSIBLE,  
24 CONVENIENT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, AND HAVING A REGIONAL  
25 FUNDING MEASURE HAS THE OPPORTUNITY NOT ONLY TO ADDRESS THE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 FISCAL CLIFF CRISIS, BUT TO ADDRESS IMPROVEMENTS THAT VOTERS  
2 CONSISTENTLY SAY THAT THEY WANT, AND THOSE ARE THINGS THAT,  
3 WITH A SEAMLESS HAT, WE STRONGLY SUPPORT AND SEPARATELY THE  
4 ADVISORY COMMITTEE HAS BEEN STRONGLY SUPPORTING AND  
5 DISCUSSION ELEVATED AND A LOT OF ISSUES THAT NEEDS TO BE  
6 ADDRESSED AND I'M HOPEFUL WITH THIS PROCESS WITH THE  
7 FACILITATION AND ALSO THE ENGAGEMENT OF PEOPLE NOT IN THIS  
8 ROOM BUT CLOSELY PAYING ATTENTION WILL ENABLE REACHING  
9 CONSENSUS TO ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF TRANSIT RIDERS AND THE  
10 REGION FOR OUR EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL AND ECONOMIC GOALS.  
11 THANKS.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** BEFORE WE GO TO THE NEXT, I WANT TO  
14 ANNOUNCE THAT FROM SENATOR CORTESE'S OFFICE, SUNSHINE  
15 BORELLI, AND ALSO MELISSA LENNOX FROM SENATOR MCGUIRE'S OFFICE  
16 ON THE LINE. THANK YOU.

17

18 **MANNY LEON:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. LEON WITH THE CALIFORNIA  
19 ALLIANCE FOR JOBS. I WOULD SAY THAT OUR EXPECTATION AND WHAT  
20 WE MAY WANT TO SEE COME OUT OF THIS GROUP IS A BALANCED  
21 MEASURE THAT TAKES ON ALL OF THE ABOVE APPROACH THAT WILL LIST  
22 ALL TRANSPORTATION RIDERS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. AND WE  
23 WANT TO SEE A SUCCESSFUL MEASURE. WE WANT TO SEE SOMETHING  
24 THAT WILL GET THROUGH THE FINISH LINE THAT WILL BENEFIT ALL  
25 IN THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.



JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, MANNY. ALICIA?

3

4 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I'M ALICIA JOHN-  
5 BAPTISTE, AND I AM THE CEO AT SPUR. I APPRECIATED THE INITIAL  
6 FRAMING THIS MORNING. ALL OF US UNDERSTAND THE ESSENTIAL  
7 ROLE THAT TRANSIT PLAYS TOWARDS MEETING OUR GOALS AS A REGION  
8 FOR A SUSTAINABLE, PROSPEROUS, AND EQUITABLE REGION. AND WE  
9 UNDERSTAND THE KIND OF EXISTENTIAL THREAT THAT MANY OF OUR  
10 SYSTEMS ARE FACING THE WAY THINGS HAVE EVOLVED OVER THE LAST  
11 FEW YEARS AND GIVEN THE CRITICAL IMPORTANCE OF UNDERSTANDING  
12 HOW TO SUSTAIN OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS OVER TIME, I DO REALLY  
13 APPRECIATE THE FOCUS ON KIND OF STARTING WITH A FRESH SLATE  
14 MAKING SURE THAT WE STAY FOCUSED ON THE ESSENTIAL GOALS  
15 THROUGH THIS MEASURE AND REALLY KEEPING AN EAR OUT TO WHAT IS  
16 GOING TO BE IN THE COLLECTIVE INTEREST, UNDERSTANDING THAT  
17 EACH OF THE PARTICIPANTS HERE HAS A, YOU KNOW, SLIGHTLY  
18 DIFFERENT SET OF NEEDS. AND I'LL BE INTERESTED TO SEE WHICH OF  
19 THOSE WE CAN MEET THROUGH, KIND OF, REGIONAL COOPERATION. SO,  
20 THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** JOHN, PRESIDENT OF BART CHAPTER SEIU1021 EXECUTIVE  
25 BOARD. I THINK IT'S SIMPLE WITH THE MEASURE WILL HELP WITH





JUNE 24, 2024

1 ECONOMICAL RECOVERY FOR THE BAY AREA PROTECT THE CLIMATE AND  
2 CREATE QUALITY OF LIFE FOR ALL PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION PATRON WE  
3 ALL HAVE THE SAME GOAL IT'S IMPORTANT TO LISTEN TO  
4 EVERYBODY, SB1031 WHERE EVERYBODY IS IN AGREEMENT VERSUS  
5 EVERYBODY BEING IN OPPOSITION. THANK YOU.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** JAMES LINDSAY. INTERNATIONAL VICE PRESIDENT OF THE  
8 AMALGAMATED TRANSIT UNION I REPRESENT 11 TRANSIT AGENCIES HERE  
9 IN THE BAY AREA. AND IN DOING SO, IT'S VERY IMPORTANT TO ME  
10 AND MY MEMBERS TO HAVE FUNDING.

11

12 **SUE NOACK:** I'M SUE NOACK, MTC COMMISSIONER, VICE MAYOR OF  
13 PLEASANT HILL. I SIT ON CCTA AND COUNTY CONNECTION BOARD  
14 INVOLVED IN MANY DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF TRANSPORTATION. I HAVE  
15 ONLY BEEN ON MTC, I DON'T KNOW, MAYBE A YEAR NOW. BUT SEE THIS  
16 IS SUCH AN IMPORTANT STEP FOR AGREEMENT ON GOALS FOR THE  
17 REGION, TRANSPORTATION WISE. WE HAVE A DIVERSE NINE COUNTIES.  
18 AND IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE'RE ABLE TO ADDRESS THE  
19 VARIETY OF NEEDS AMONGST THE COUNTIES, BUT, ALSO, STRENGTHEN  
20 THE ENTIRE REGION FROM A TRANSPORTATION PERSPECTIVE. SO,  
21 HOPEFULLY EVERYBODY CAN KEEP AN OPEN MIND AND KEEP THAT FOCUS.

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M DAVID CORTESE, ON THE  
24 SAN MATEO COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS. A COUPLE OF THINGS.  
25 THE FIRST THING I'M INTERESTED THIS IS REALLY UNDERSTANDING



JUNE 24, 2024

1 WHAT OUR CHALLENGES WERE WITH SB1031. I KNOW WE HAVE TO MOVE  
2 FORWARD. BUT WE HAVE TO MOVE FORWARD IN A WAY WHERE WE  
3 RECOGNIZE, SORT OF, THE CHALLENGES THAT WE HAD, AND THE  
4 OPPOSITION. I'M HOPING FOR UNIFORMITY. I'M HOPING THAT WE'RE  
5 ABLE TO REALLY COLLABORATE AMONGST OURSELVES TO REALLY FIND A  
6 REGIONAL SOLUTION THAT, AS COMMISSIONER NOACK HAD MENTIONED,  
7 THAT IS REALLY REGIONAL. SO, FROM THE NORTH BAY, DOWN TO THE  
8 SOUTH BAY. BUT I THINK IT'S JUST GOING TO BE CRITICALLY  
9 IMPORTANT. WE RECEIVED A LOT OF FEEDBACK ON THIS BILL. MY HOPE  
10 IS THAT WITH THAT FEEDBACK, WE'RE ABLE TO MOVE FORWARD AND  
11 ADDRESS THOSE ISSUES THAT WERE WITHIN THE BILL.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. OPERATOR PEDROZA CHAIR OF THE  
16 COMMISSION AND ALSO A NAPA COUNTY SUPERVISOR. MY INTERESTS ARE  
17 WELL DOCUMENTED I HAVE SPOKE A LOT. I HOPE WE CAN CONTINUE TO  
18 SHOW WHAT REGIONALISM CAN DO. I BELIEVE THIS IS A REGIONAL  
19 PROBLEM AND THIS IS A REGIONAL BODY THAT CAN COME TOGETHER AND  
20 SHOW WHAT A REGIONAL THINKING COULD DO. I'M OPTIMISTIC.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** JIM WE'RE GOING TO DO A DRUM ROLL FOR YOU?  
23 YOU'RE LAST.

24

25 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YES DRUM ROLL.



JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** CINDY CHAVEZ, MEMBER OF MTC AND I'M CHAIR OF  
3 THE VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AND SERVE ON THE COUNTIES  
4 BOARD OF SUPERVISORS AND I PREVIOUSLY SERVED ON THE CALTRAIN  
5 BOARD. I'M INTEREST AND UNDERSTANDING WHAT'S THE PROBLEM WE'RE  
6 TRYING TO SOLVE I'M NOT WHETTED TO A PIECE OF LEGISLATION I'M  
7 NOT SURE THAT'S THE WAY TO DO IT BUT I THINK WE'LL LEARN THAT  
8 THROUGH THE PROCESS. I'M GRATEFUL THAT JIM IS PLAYING A  
9 LEADERSHIP ROLE HERE.

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER WUNDERMAN

12

13 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I'M JIM W PRESIDENT AND CEO OF BAY AREA COUNCIL  
14 ORGANIZATION HAS BEEN HISTORICALLY INVOLVED IN MASS  
15 TRANSPORTATION PRETTY MUCH SINCE INCEPTION AND CREATION OF  
16 BART BACK IN THE 1950S AND VARIOUS TRANSPORTATION MEASURES  
17 WORKING FOR A NUMBER OF THOSE WORKING WITH STEWART AND ALICIA.  
18 JUST BEFORE THE PANDEMIC ROLE WHICH WAS INTENDED TO BE A 100  
19 BILLION DOLLAR MEASURE. SO, OUR IMPETUS HAS ALWAYS BEEN  
20 INVESTING IN THE REGION. AND AS MANNY SAID, IN A MULTI-  
21 FACETED WAY THAT'S ACTUALLY MEANINGFUL TO THE PUBLIC. I  
22 APPRECIATED STUART YOUR COMMENT ABOUT WE CAN'T JUST BE ASKING  
23 THE PUBLIC FOR MONEY WE HAVE TO OFFER SOMETHING BETTER WE  
24 HAVE TO SAVE THEM TIME WE HAVE TO ACTUALLY REDUCE EMISSIONS.  
25 SO WE HAVE TO ACCOMPLISH THINGS WHEN WE GO OUT TO THE PUBLIC



JUNE 24, 2024

1 AND ASK FOR THEIR SUPPORT. IT'S BEEN A DIFFICULT NUMBER OF  
2 YEARS. PEOPLE ARE VERY SET BACK BY HOW MUCH THE COST OF LIVING  
3 HAS GONE UP. I THINK IT'S A BIG FACTOR WHEN YOU GO OUT AND ASK  
4 PEOPLE FOR MONEY FOR SOMETHING, TO REALIZE MANY PEOPLE ARE  
5 ALREADY FEELING PUT UPON BY THE CIRCUMSTANCES IN LIFE. SO,  
6 LOOKING FORWARD TO REACHING THAT CONSENSUS. I THINK WE'RE  
7 HERE FOR THE HIGHER PURPOSE, AND I HOPE AND EXPECT WE'LL FIND  
8 A WAY THERE. THANK YOU.

9

10 **ELLEN WU:** GOOD MORNING. ELLEN W, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AT URBAN  
11 HABITAT AND ALSO A MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC  
12 TRANSPORTATION. AND WE, TOO, HAVE BEEN WORKING ON A REGIONAL  
13 MEASURE FOR MANY, MANY YEARS. SINCE 2017, AND HOPE TO SEE THIS  
14 AS A CULMINATION OF MANY YEARS OF WORK, AND FINALLY MOVING  
15 ENABLING LEGISLATION FORWARD TO PUT A REGIONAL MEASURE ON THE  
16 BALLOT. I DO WANT TO CO-- WHAT THE CHAIR AND FACILITATOR SAID  
17 IN TERMS OF CENTERING DEPENDENT RIDERS AND GIVING THEM WHAT  
18 THEY NEED IN THIS PROCESS. AND GIVEN THERE ARE PROBABLY SOME -  
19 - I KNOW EXPANDING THE COMMITTEE IS TOUGH AND MANAGING, BUT I  
20 THINK THERE ARE CRITICAL VOICES AT THE TABLE, PARTICULARLY  
21 TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS AND THOSE WHO ARE DISABLED WHO REALLY  
22 RELY ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I WANT TO POINT THAT OUT AND  
23 PUT THAT PLUG IN.

24

25 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.



JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. RAAYAN, MOHTASHEMI  
3 LEGISLATIVE AID OFFICE OF SENATOR WIENER IT'S A PLEASURE TO BE  
4 HERE TODAY SENATOR WIENER APPRECIATES THE INVITATION AND  
5 REPRESENTATION ON THE COMMITTEE AND EXTEND HIS GRATITUDE FOR  
6 THIS PROCESS WE HOPE THAT IT ACCOMPLISHES CONSENSUS THAT IS  
7 REALISTIC ABOUT THE FINANCIAL CONDITION OF EACH TRANSIT AGENCY  
8 BOTH IN THE CONTEXT OF MAJOR NEAR-TERM TRENDS OF REDUCED  
9 TRANSIT SERVICE ACROSS THE REGION AND IDEALLY WE'LL GET TO A  
10 SOLUTION THAT IS FLEXIBLE ENOUGH TO ACCOUNT FOR POTENTIAL  
11 CHANGING CIRCUMSTANCES IN THE NEAR-TERM, AND IDEALLY PROVIDE  
12 LONG-TERM STABILITY WHILE INVESTING IN A MYRIAD OF  
13 TRANSPORTATION PRIORITIES AND AN IMPROVED SYSTEM. SO, REALLY  
14 APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE PART OF THIS CONVERSATION.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SUE, DID YOU WANT TO?  
17 WHAT? OH

18

19 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** ARE YOU CALLING ON ME, JIM?

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YES. I'M SORRY.

22

23 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** JIM, THANK YOU FOR CHAIRING THIS  
24 COMMITTEE. I THINK YOU'RE GOING TO BE ONE OF OUR MAJOR SUCCESS  
25 FACTORS. FOR THE REST OF YOU, I'M STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS



JUNE 24, 2024

1 FROM MARIN COUNTY, I HAVE SERVED ON EVERY TRANSPORTATION BOARD  
2 IN THE NORTH BAY INCLUDING GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE DISTRICT RIGHT  
3 NOW AND CHAIRED OUR TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES FOR SIX YEARS.  
4 THIS IS OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO COME TOGETHER AND CENTER RIDERS  
5 IN THE WORK WE DO AND COME UP WITH A SOLUTION THAT WILL BE  
6 SUPPORTED BY ALL NINE COUNTIES. I BELIEVE WE CAN DO IT AND I'M  
7 COMMITTED TO THAT OUTCOME. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. MAYOR MAHAN?

10

11 **MATT MAHAN:** THANKS JIM. REALLY APPRECIATE YOU CHAIRING THE  
12 COMMITTEE HERE AND YOUR OPENING COMMENTS WERE RIGHT ON POINT,  
13 SAME WITH STUART'S. APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO PARTICIPATE.  
14 I'M GLAD WE'RE HITTING THE RESET BUTTON. I THINK THE PREVIOUS  
15 PROCESS HAD SOME CHALLENGES. I HAVE LAID THOSE OUT IN A COUPLE  
16 OF LETTERS TO MTC, WHICH I SERVE ON. SORRY FOR NOT BEING ABLE  
17 TO JOIN IN-PERSON TODAY. I WON'T SAY TOO MUCH HERE, BUT MY  
18 HOPE IS THAT WE -- THIS GROUP HERE GETS VERY CLEAR ON  
19 PRIORITIZING WHICH PROBLEMS ARE MOST IMPORTANT TO SOLVE AND  
20 PUTS THE MAP BEHIND THEM IN A VERY TRANSPARENT WAY AND HELPS  
21 US UNDERSTAND WHAT IS MOST CRITICAL TO SOLVE FOR THE VARIOUS  
22 TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE REGION, PARTICULARLY, I WOULD  
23 PERSONALLY PUT THE EMPHASIS ON OUR COLLECTIVE EFFORTS TO  
24 PROTECT BART AND CALTRAIN, UNDERSTANDING THAT WE WOULD BE  
25 RAISING REVENUE TO HELP ALL OF OUR LOCAL SYSTEMS THAT WOULD BE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 PART OF THE OVERALL SYSTEM AND ALSO BE REALISTIC ABOUT WHAT  
2 VOTERS NEED TO SEE IN THIS MEASURE TO SUPPORT IT, BUT LOOK  
3 FORWARD TO JUMPING IN AND PROBLEM SOLVING WITH YOU ALL AND  
4 GETTING TO A PLACE WHERE WE'RE ABLE TO DO SOMETHING JOINTLY  
5 HERE THAT PROTECTS OUR VITAL REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM. THANK  
6 YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, MAYOR. I'LL INTRODUCE MYSELF.  
9 JIM SPERING. I REPRESENT THE CITIES AND COUNTY OF SOLANO. AND  
10 YOU KNOW, I HOPE, AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS, THAT WE  
11 IDENTIFY THE FISCAL CLIFF, IDENTIFY WHAT THAT FUNDING AMOUNT  
12 IS, AND YOU KNOW, THE REGION IS VERY DIVERSE. WE HAVE NINE  
13 VERY UNIQUE COUNTIES, ALL, REALLY, CONTRIBUTE VERY UNIQUELY  
14 INTO THE REGION. WE GO FROM OPEN SPACE AND AGRICULTURE, ALL  
15 THE WAY DOWN TO SILICON VALLEY, AND EVERYTHING IN BETWEEN. SO,  
16 IT'S DIVERSE, AND THE NEEDS OF EACH COUNTY IS GOING TO BE A  
17 LITTLE DIFFERENT. AS WE PUT THIS MEASURE FORWARD WE HAVE TO  
18 KEEP IN MIND THAT WE HAVE TO PUT SOMETHING BEFORE THE VOTERS  
19 THAT THEY WILL SUPPORT IT'S NOT GOING TO BE JUST A SINGLE  
20 FOCUS. I DON'T THINK IT SHOULD BE. THAT'S THE CHALLENGE  
21 BEFORE THIS COMMITTEE IS HOW DO WE FIND THAT BALANCE AND IT'S  
22 SOMETHING THAT, AS MR. WUNDERMAN SAID, IT'S SOMETHING THAT  
23 IS GOING TO BENEFIT THE PEOPLE VOTING FOR THIS MEASURE. SO,  
24 WITH THAT, I DON'T KNOW IF ANYBODY HAS ANY OTHER COMMENTS.  
25 DID I MISS ANYBODY IN THE INTRODUCTIONS?



JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER, CHAIR SPERING, I THINK WE HAVE  
3 THE STAFF FOR MCGUIRE, SENATOR WAHAB, AS WELL, CORRECT?

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** AND ALSO CORTESE.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CORTESE.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WHO IS -- I DON'T HAVE ANYTHING IN FRONT  
10 OF ME ON THE SCREEN.

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** FINGER WE CAN GO TO ALISIA LAURENCE. SHE'S ON  
13 THE LINE FROM SENATOR WAHAB'S OFFICE.

14

15 **ALICIA LAWRENCE:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYBODY. ALICIA LAWRENCE. I  
16 REPRESENT THE OFFICE OF SENATOR WHAT AISHA WAHAB. WE  
17 APPRECIATE BEING ASKED TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS COMMITTEE.  
18 SENATOR WAHAB IS SPECIFICALLY A REPRESENTATIVE OF EAST BAY AND  
19 PORTIONS OF SOUTH BAY, REALLY IS COMMITTED TO CONSENSUS  
20 BUILDING AND ENSURING THAT HER CONSTITUENTS AND THEIR VOICES  
21 AND NEEDS ARE APPROPRIATELY REPRESENTED IN THIS PROCESS.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. AND WE HAVE -- I THINK  
24 REPRESENTATIVE, I INTRODUCED SUNSHINE, AND STAFF MEMBER  
25 MCGUIRE'S OFFICE.





JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **SUNSHINE BORELLI:** HI. GOOD MORNING. SUNSHINE BORELLI, SENATOR  
3 CORTESE'S OFFICE. HAPPY TO JOIN YOU THIS MORNING AND I'M  
4 HOPEFUL TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE INTENT OF WHAT THE GROUP WOULD  
5 LIKE TO ACCOMPLISH AND JUST HOW WE GET THERE. I APPRECIATE YOU  
6 HAVING ME.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, SUNSHINE. AND SENATOR  
9 MCGUIRE?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS MISA LENNOX FROM PRO TEMPORE MCGUIRE'S  
12 OFFICE. APPRECIATE YOU LETTING US LISTEN IN TO THE IMPORTANT  
13 CONTINUATION OF THIS IMPORTANT CONVERSATION TODAY.

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU MISHA. STAFF, THAT'S EVERYONE.  
16 WE'LL MOVE ON NOW TO ITEM FOUR, THIS IS THE TRANSIT FISCAL  
17 CLIFF, AND I BELIEVE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANDY FREMIER IS GOING  
18 TO INTRODUCE THIS ITEM.

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. I'LL BE BRIEF TO GET  
21 TO THE MEAT OF THE INFORMATION. I TOO STATE MY APPRECIATION  
22 FOR THE JOINT DECISION TO START FRESH WITH THE EFFORTS OF THE  
23 WORLD CLASS TRANSIT SYSTEM FOCUSED ON THE CUSTOMER I WOULD  
24 LIKE TO THANK THE LEGISLATIVE STAFF ATTENDING TODAY. WE INTEND  
25 TO BROADEN THE REACH TO STAY CONNECTED TO THE BAY AREA



JUNE 24, 2024

1 ASSEMBLY MEMBERS. I WANT TO THANK ALIX AND HER TEAM FOR  
2 PUTTING TOGETHER THIS BACKGROUND INFORMATION ON SHORT NOTICE.  
3 IT'S DESIGNED TO SET THE TABLE FOR FUTURE MEETINGS AND ALSO A  
4 THANKS TO STEWARD COHEN FOR HIS THOUGHTFUL CONSIDERATION OF A  
5 ROADMAP THAT QUICKLY GETS US INTO THE DECISION-MAKING MODE IN  
6 AUGUST. I ALSO WANT TO LET YOU KNOW THAT I AM CONVENING AN  
7 EXECUTIVE LEVEL COMMITTEE MADE OF TRANSIT OPERATOR GENERAL  
8 MANAGERS, AND THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS OF THE NINE COUNTY  
9 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES THIS AFTERNOON. THEY WILL BE BRIEFED  
10 ON TODAY'S DISCUSSION, AND ASKED TO CONTRIBUTE TO THE  
11 DEVELOPMENT OF ASSIGNMENT THAT COME FROM THE WORK THAT YOU ALL  
12 GIVE US. AND AS CHAIR SPERING MENTIONED, THIS REFRESH IS  
13 INTENDED TO BUILD ON THE LESSONS LEARNED IN THE PREVIOUS  
14 LEGISLATIVE PROCESS. WE SEE THE FIRST STEP IN THE NEW PROCESS  
15 IS TO GET REGIONAL CONSENSUS, BECAUSE WITHOUT IT, WE WON'T  
16 SUCCEED IN CONVINCING THE VOTERS TO VOTE FOR THIS MEASURE IN  
17 INFER. WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO ALIX.

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** GOOD MORNING SELECT COMMITTEE MEMBERS MY NAME  
20 IS ALIX BOCKELMAN, I'M THE CHIEF DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. IF  
21 THE TECH TEAM CAN LAUNCH THE SLIDE DECK? YOU'RE TOO GOOD  
22 [LAUGHTER] ALL RIGHT. TODAY I HOPE TO PROVIDE CONTEXT TO THE  
23 ACKNOWLEDGE DISCUSSION BY PROVIDING OVERVIEW OF THE FISCAL  
24 CRISIS FACING TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN THE BAY AREA. MUCH OF THIS  
25 INFORMATION HAS BEEN PRESENTED PREVIOUSLY. BUT I THINK IT



JUNE 24, 2024

1 HELPS TO GROUND THE DISCUSSION IN THE PROBLEM THAT WE'RE  
2 SEEKING TO SOLVE AND SOME OF THE REASONS WHY IT EXISTS. NEXT  
3 SLIDE. SO, IT'S HARD TO BELIEVE THAT IT'S BEEN FOUR YEARS  
4 SINCE THE START OF THE PANDEMIC. CURRENTLY, WE SEE THAT THERE  
5 HAS BEEN A SIGNIFICANT RETURN TO OFFICE WITH OVER HALF OF BAY  
6 AREA WORKERS IN THE OFFICE 2 TO 3 DAYS PER WEEK. WITH THE  
7 TREND TOWARDS THREE DAYS A WEEK, IN OFFICE GROWING. EMPLOYERS  
8 FULLY REMOTE HAVE SETTLED AT SHARE OF ABOUT 12%. ON THE OTHER  
9 END OF THE SPECTRUM, EMPLOYERS THAT HAVE RETURNED TO THE  
10 OFFICE ARE THE ONES TYPICALLY SEEING FIVE DAYS IN THE OFFICE  
11 ROUTINE AT JUST OVER 15%. NEXT SLIDE. TRANSIT RIDERSHIP  
12 CONTINUES TO BE CHALLENGING PEAK RIDERSHIP RECOVERY MONTHLY  
13 RIDERSHIP FOR APRIL 2024 IS AROUND 66% OF JANUARY 2020. BUT  
14 RIDERSHIP GROWTH SEEMS TO HAVE SLOWED PROBABLY RANKED TO  
15 PATTERNS OF BEING IN OFFICE SETTTLING. WITH 25 MILLION TRANSIT  
16 RIDES PER MONTH THE BAY AREA STILL RELIES SIGNIFICANTLY ON  
17 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION FOR MOBILITY BUT AT A LOWER LEVEL THAN  
18 PRE-PANDEMIC 40 PLUS MILLION RIDES. NEXT SLIDE. WE HAVE SEEN  
19 RIDERSHIP GROWTH RELATIVE TO PRE-PANDEMIC VARY ACROSS  
20 OPERATORS DEPENDING ON TYPE OF SERVICE PROVIDED AND RIDERSHIP  
21 DEMOGRAPHICS. GREEN BARS IN THE CHART ILLUSTRATE THAT MANY  
22 SYSTEMS MOSTLY BUS SYSTEMS HAVE RETURNED TO OVER 80% OF PRE-  
23 PANDEMIC RIDERSHIP. ANOTHER SET OF OPERATORS SHOWN WITH BLUE  
24 BARS HAVE BETWEEN 60 TO 70% OF 2019 RIDERSHIP. SEVERAL  
25 OPERATORS SHOWN IN RED ARE STILL BELOW 50% OF PRE-PANDEMIC



JUNE 24, 2024

1 RIDERSHIP LEVELS. IN THE NEXT SLIDE AND CONCERNS ARE FINANCIAL  
2 MODEL FOR TWO OF THOSE IN RED, BART AND CALTRAIN WERE VERY  
3 RELIANT ON FARE REVENUE. NEXT SLIDE. DRILLING A LITTLE  
4 DEEPER, THIS SLIDE SHOWS THAT OPERATORS THAT WERE MORE  
5 RELIANT ON FARES PRE-PANDEMIC, WITH A HIGH FAREBOX RECOVERY  
6 RATIO, HAVE SEEN A SLOWER RECOVERY IN RIDERSHIP, NOTABLY AS I  
7 JUST MENTIONED, I THINK AS SEVERAL HAVE MENTIONED TODAY, BART  
8 AND CALTRAIN. AS WE KNOW, THOSE OPERATORS PROVIDE A LOT OF  
9 COMMUTE BASED SERVICE WHICH REMAINS IMPACTED BY REMOTE WORK IN  
10 A POST-PANDEMIC BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE LARGEST SINGLE  
11 AFFECTED REVENUE SOURCE HAS BEEN FARE REVENUE. THIS SLIDE  
12 ILLUSTRATES THE RESULTING HOLE CREATED IN OPERATOR'S BUDGETS.  
13 YOU CAN SEE PRE-PANDEMIC FARE REVENUE COMPRISED 70% OF  
14 OPERATING BUDGETS FOR BART AND CALTRAIN. DESPITE THE SIZE OF  
15 THE FARE REVENUE BEING DIFFERENT IN SCALE BETWEEN THE TWO  
16 OPERATORS. BUS OPERATORS WERE ALSO HIT BY FARE REVENUE LOSSES.  
17 BUT NOT TO THE EXTENT THAT RAIL OPERATORS WERE. THERE HAS  
18 ALSO BEEN, AS WE ALL KNOW THERE HAS BEEN RELIEF PROVIDED BY  
19 NEW -- BY REVENUE SOURCES. FEDERAL RELIEF FUNDS AT 4.4 BILLION  
20 WERE SIGNIFICANT BUT ARE NOW RUNNING OUT. STATE FUNDS HAVE  
21 EXTENDED THE RUNWAY INTO FISCAL YEAR '26/'27 BUT IS ALSO ONE  
22 TIME. THERE ARE BRIGHT SPOTS IN TERMS OF NEW ONGOING REVENUE  
23 SOURCES MOST SIGNIFICANT BEING MEASURE RR THAT I THINK  
24 MEMBERSHIP OF YOU HELPED TO SUPPORT AND WAS APPROVED BY  
25 VOTERS IN NOVEMBER 2020 AND PROVIDES ROUGHLY 120 MILLION



JUNE 24, 2024

1 ANNUALLY TO SUPPORT CALTRAIN OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL. BRIDGE  
2 TOLLS THROUGH THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE DISTRICT RECENT ACTIONS  
3 AND VOTER ENACTED REGIONAL MEASURE THREE HAVE PROVIDED SOME  
4 ADDITIONAL OPERATING FUNDS FOR SPECIFIC OPERATORS AND TYPES OF  
5 SERVICE. NEXT SLIDE. ON THE COST SIDE OF THE EQUATION WE CAN  
6 SEE THAT BOTH COST PER REVENUE VEHICLE HOUR AND VEHICLE MILE  
7 HAS INCREASED AT FASTER PACE THAN INFLATION WITH SOME  
8 OPERATORS WELL ABOVE REGIONAL AVERAGE GROWTH AND OVERALL  
9 INFLATION RATE. THESE TRENDS EXISTED BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, AND  
10 UNFORTUNATELY, THEY HAVE PERSISTED. NEXT SLIDE. SO, ALL THESE  
11 CIRCUMSTANCES HAVE BROUGHT US TO WHERE WE ARE TODAY, WITH A  
12 SIGNIFICANT REGIONAL OPERATING SHORTFALL PROJECTED OVER THE  
13 NEXT MANY YEARS. FIVE-YEAR TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALLS RANGE  
14 FROM 2 TO 2.7 BILLION, DEPENDING ON VARIOUS ASSUMPTIONS ON  
15 SERVICE LEVELS, INFLATION, VACANCY RATES, AND THE LIKE. FOR  
16 SENATE BILL 125, MTC STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS ASSUME 2022  
17 SERVICE LEVELS. SEVERAL LARGE OPERATORS HAVE ALREADY RESTORED  
18 SERVICE BEYOND FISCAL YEAR 2022 LEVELS. ALL IN, THE IDENTIFIED  
19 ANNUAL SHORTFALLS ARE APPROXIMATELY 600 MILLION USING MTC'S  
20 STANDARDIZED ASSUMPTIONS. NEXT SLIDE. THE TWO PIE CHARTS  
21 DEPICTED IN THIS SLIDE, THEY DEPICT OVERALL PRE AND POST-  
22 PANDEMIC TRANSIT OPERATING REVENUE MIX. A COUPLE OF THINGS TO  
23 POINT OUT HERE INCLUDE THE FACT THAT OPERATING COSTS GREW BY  
24 AROUND 4%, 4% ANNUALLY, OVER THIS FOUR YEAR PERIOD. GOING  
25 INTO THE PANDEMIC, THE REGION AT A SYSTEM OF OPERATING COST



JUNE 24, 2024

1 OF 3.5 BILLION, TODAY OPERATING COST FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE  
2 BAY AREA IS 4.3 BILLION. FARE REVENUE, SHOWN IN THE GREEN  
3 SLICE, DECREASED BY 440 MILLION OR ABOUT 45% OVERALL. AND  
4 FEDERAL COVID RELIEF FUNDS GREW BY 1200 PERCENT, AND,  
5 THANKFULLY, HAS ALLOWED SERVICE TO BE SUSTAINED. RELIANCE ON  
6 TDA AND STA FUNDING ALSO INCREASED ABOUT 30% OVER THIS TIME  
7 PERIOD. ONE ITEM THAT IS MASKED IN THE PURPLE SLICE, COUNTY  
8 LOCAL FUNDS, IS THAT THE SAN FRANCISCO GENERAL FUND AND  
9 RELATED SAN FRANCISCO ONLY REVENUE SOURCES HAVE BEEN HARD-HIT  
10 BY THE PANDEMIC AND WORK-FROM-HOME. SO SIZABLE CONTRIBUTIONS  
11 THAT SFMTA RELIED ON PREVIOUSLY FROM SAN FRANCISCO SOURCES,  
12 HAVE GONE AWAY. NEXT SLIDE. SO, EACH OPERATOR'S FUNDING MIX  
13 FOR OPERATIONS RESULTS IN DIFFERENT VULNERABILITIES. HERE WE  
14 HAVE TWO EXAMPLES, ONE FOR BART, AND ONE FOR THE VALLEY  
15 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AGENCY. I DON'T KNOW WHICH -- SORRY.  
16 [LAUGHTER] BART WAS LARGELY FUNDED THROUGH FARES PRE-PANDEMIC,  
17 AND WITH THE DROP IN RIDERSHIP NOW RELIES ON FEDERAL  
18 ASSISTANCE TO CLOSE THE GAP. VTA, WHICH IS LARGELY SALES TAX  
19 FUNDED HAS DONE BETTER, AND HAS BEEN ABLE TO RETAIN SOME  
20 FEDERAL COVID RELIEF FUNDS FOR LATER USE. HOWEVER VTA'S  
21 REVENUE MODEL IS SUSCEPTIBLE TO ECONOMIC RECESSION. I WANT TO  
22 NOTE THIS IS GIVING A FLAVOR OF SHOWING TWO OPERATORS KIND OF  
23 AT EXTREMES BUT IN YOUR PACKET ATTACHED YOU HAVE A WELCOME  
24 PACKET, YOU HAVE DETAIL FOR LARGE OPERATORS YOU CAN LOOK AT  
25 MORE IN DETAIL BY OPERATOR. I HOPE THE WHIRL WIND TOUR OF



JUNE 24, 2024

1 TRANSIT OPERATING BUDGETS ASK HELPFUL AS YOU LAUNCH YOUR WORK.

2 THANK YOU

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ALIX, HOW DO YOU SEE US ESTABLISHING WHAT

5 IS THE REAL SHORTFALL? AND WHAT -- WHAT WILL BE OUR TARGET

6 WHAT WE SHOULD RAISE? YOU KNOW? I'M NOT SURE IF WE PROVIDED

7 ALL OF THE SHORTFALL WITHOUT CONDITIONS. I'M NOT SURE THAT

8 WE'LL GET SOME OF THESE RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE BLUE RIBBON.

9 AND, SO, HOW DOES THIS COMMITTEE DEVELOP WHAT THAT NUMBER IS

10 FOR THE FISCAL CLIFF?

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** WOW, THAT CERTAINLY ISN'T A SOFTBALL

13 QUESTION, CHAIR SPERING [LAUGHTER] I THINK WHAT I TRIED TO

14 SHOW YOU WERE A FEW DIFFERENT WAYS OF LOOKING AT IT. I THINK

15 ONE OF THE THINGS THAT FOR CERTAIN HAS CHANGED A LOT IN THE

16 POST-PANDEMIC WORLD AS NOTED IS KIND OF THE RETURN TO WORK AND

17 HOW MUCH WE RELY ON -- AND HOW MANY DAYS A WEEK, I GUESS, WE

18 RELY ON OUR BACKBONE RAIL SYSTEMS. LOOKING AT FARE REVENUE

19 AND, SORT OF, THE BIG LOSS THERE IS SUMMER AN IMPORTANT PART

20 OF THE EQUATION. I THINK LOOKING AT HOW THE OVERALL

21 SHORTFALL, AS I MENTIONED, IS AN IMPORTANT CONTEXT, AS WELL,

22 BECAUSE THAT IS WHERE WE ARE, BUT ALSO THINKING ABOUT WHERE

23 THERE MAY BE OPPORTUNITIES FOR SOME OF THE GAPS THERE TO BE

24 CLOSED OVER TIME. SO, ONE OF THE THINGS I MENTIONED IS, YOU

25 KNOW, SAN FRANCISCO IS HARD-HIT RIGHT NOW. PERHAPS IN THE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 FUTURE, I THINK WE ALL HOPE -- AND WE DO SEE SIGNS OF SAN  
2 FRANCISCO REBOUNDED, SO NOT REALLY ANSWERING YOUR QUESTION  
3 SPECIFICALLY, BUT I THINK WE CAN COME BACK AND SHOW YOU AGAIN  
4 SOME SPECIFIC NUMBERS AS I TRIED DO HERE AND YOU ALL CAN TALK  
5 ABOUT THE PROS AND CONS OF EXACTLY THE HOLE THAT WE'RE  
6 TRYING TO FILL.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. AND ONE LAST QUESTION. AND THEN I'LL  
9 GO TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS. HOW DO WE LEVERAGE THIS MONEY TO GET  
10 -- TO IMPLEMENT THE RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE BLUE RIBBON? THIS  
11 TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN. THE THING THAT THE VOTERS IN  
12 THE POLLS WE HAVE TAKEN, WHAT THEY'RE LOOKING FOR. HOW DO YOU  
13 SEE THIS MEASURE HELPING TO FACILITATE THAT PIECE. YOU HEARD  
14 FROM THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS WE HAVE TO MAKE IT A WORLD CLASS  
15 SYSTEM A BETTER SYSTEM HOW DO WE IMPLEMENT THAT PART OF IT.

16

17 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CHAIR, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANDY FREMIER, I  
18 TENDS TO THINK ABOUT THE WHOLE SPECTRUM IF YOU LOOK AT  
19 SHORTFALL SOMEWHERE BETWEEN 600 TO 7,050 MILLION VERSUS  
20 FAREBOX REVENUE THAT'S MISSING IN THE \$450 MILLION RANGE THOSE  
21 NUMBERS REPRESENT WHAT IT TAKES TO GET BACK TO NORMAL AND TO  
22 YOUR POINT A LOT OF THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION WORK IS IN  
23 ADDITION TO THAT. I THINK SOME OF THOSE INVESTMENTS MAYBE IT'S  
24 TIGHTER SCHEDULES, REQUIRE MORE OPERATING COST WHICH MIGHT  
25 NOT BRING RIDERS BACK IMMEDIATELY BUT EVENTUALLY WOULD OVER





JUNE 24, 2024

1 TIME AND ADDRESS SOME OF THE QUESTIONS WE HAVE OVER THE  
2 SEAMLESS DESIRES OF THE WORLD CLASS SYSTEM. IN ADDITION,  
3 REMEMBER, WE HAVE PUT FORWARD NUMBERS THAT ARE NOT FUNDED YET  
4 IN THINGS LIKE WAYFINDING AND MAPPING THAT WILL REQUIRE  
5 ADDITIONAL INVESTMENT. SO, I THINK THE CHALLENGE FOR US IS  
6 THAT IT IS A BIG HOLE, AND YOU KIND OF NEED TO DECIDE WHAT ARE  
7 THE -- WHAT ARE THE AREAS ARE INTEREST THAT ARE WORTH  
8 INVESTING IN, I THINK, TO MOVE FORWARD, I THINK THAT'S WHAT'S  
9 GOING TO HAVE TO COME OUT OF DISCUSSIONS TODAY, AND OVER THE  
10 COURSE OF THE SUMMER.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. TO MY COLLEAGUE CINDY CHAVEZ AND  
13 I'LL GO AROUND THE ROOM.

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. ONE THING I THINK WOULD BE IMPORTANT  
16 FOR FOLKS TO UNDERSTAND IS REALLY THE LEVELS OF SERVICE BEING  
17 PROVIDED BEFORE COVID AND AFTER COVID. AND, COLLEAGUES, THE  
18 REASON I'M MENTIONING THIS IS THAT ONE OF THE REASONS THAT VTA  
19 HAS NO-NO PLACE LEFT TO GO BUT GROW IS THAT WE'RE OFFERING THE  
20 SAME LEVEL OF SERVICE THAT WE DID IN THE 1990S. IN PART  
21 BECAUSE THE CRISIS OF FAREBOX RECOVERY IS A NEWER CRISIS FOR  
22 THE LARGER AGENCIES. MEANING THAT FOR THE SMALLER AGENCIES,  
23 AS THEY WERE DECLINING, WE DIDN'T REALLY HAVE MUCH OF A  
24 REGIONAL RESPONSE, WHICH MEANS THEY ALL KIND OF WENT DOWN THE  
25 DRAIN, AND I THINK THAT'S WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO AVOID WITH



JUNE 24, 2024

1 THESE LARGER PROVIDERS. BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT BECAUSE AS  
2 WE THINK ABOUT THE SYSTEM REGIONALLY IF WE, IN FACT, WANT IT  
3 TO MOVE PEOPLE WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO THINK ABOUT IT  
4 COLLECTIVELY AND NOT JUST WITH THOSE THAT ARE HAVING A FAREBOX  
5 RECOVERY PROBLEM RIGHT NOW. THE SECOND ISSUE THAT I WOULD LIKE  
6 TO JUST RAISE, AND, REALLY, THIS IS MORE OF A QUESTION FOR OUR  
7 CHAIR, WHICH IS THAT, I -- I DO -- VERY INTERESTED IN FOCUSING  
8 ON WHAT PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE AND WHAT ORDER WE'RE  
9 TRYING TO SOLVE THEM. ONE THING THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR ME,  
10 THROUGH YOU, IS BETTER TO UNDERSTAND NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
11 APPROACHES OR STRATEGIES, ARE THERE ONE OR TWO OR THREE THAT  
12 YOU'RE -- THAT YOU'RE PARTICULARLY INTERESTED IN? BECAUSE  
13 WHENEVER YOU SAY IT, I THINK ABOUT THE DOCUMENT, WHICH IS  
14 TALLER THAN ME. SO, ANYWAY, THAT'S WHY I WOULD BE INTERESTED  
15 IN UNDERSTANDING THAT.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND I'M HOPING WE HEAR FROM COMMITTEE  
18 MEMBERS WHAT'S IMPORTANT. YOU HAVE THE WAYFINDING, FARE  
19 COORDINATION.

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** TRANSIT PRIORITY.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** TRANSIT PRIORITY. AND THERE IS A FOURTH  
24 ONE. I DON'T REMEMBER.

25



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CLIPPER INVESTMENTS AND BAY PASS.

2

3 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH. AND, SO, THOSE WOULD BE -- AND THAT  
4 REALLY BENEFITS ALL SYSTEMS IN THE REGION. SO, THAT WOULD BE  
5 THE PURPOSE OF THAT. BUT WHAT I WOULD HOPE THIS COMMITTEE  
6 WOULD DO IS HAVE A DISCUSSION ABOUT -- YOU KNOW IF WE'RE GOING  
7 TO TALK ABOUT FARE LOSS, YOU KNOW THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE CAN  
8 REALLY MEASURE. I MEAN, WE KNOW WHAT THAT IS. SO THAT'S -- BUT  
9 ALL THE OTHER NUMBERS, I DON'T KNOW THAT THIS MEASURE SHOULD  
10 BE FUNDING ALL OF THESE WISH LISTS THAT ALL THE TRANSIT  
11 OPERATORS HAVE. I THINK WE HAVE TO DEAL WITH THE FISCAL CLIFF.  
12 HOW DO WE SOLVE THAT PROBLEM AND BUILD ON THAT AND GET THE  
13 TRANSFORMATIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE BLUE RIBBON  
14 INCORPORATED INTO THIS PROCESS. SO. AND I'M HOPING THE  
15 COMMITTEE CAN HAVE SOME DISCUSSION AROUND THAT. AND, SO. BUT,  
16 YOU KNOW, FOR ME, AND, YOU KNOW, MAYBE SOMEBODY ELSE CAN  
17 COMMENT -- I REALLY THINK THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN  
18 RECOMMENDATIONS HAVE TO BE INCORPORATED INTO THIS PROCESS. I  
19 MEAN, WE DON'T GET THAT WORLD CLASS SYSTEM THAT WE'RE ALL  
20 TALKING ABOUT. YOU KNOW? WE CAN'T JUST GENERATE MONEY FOR THE  
21 REVENUE FISCAL CLIFF AND NOT HAVE ANY CHANGES. THE PEOPLE WE  
22 POLLED, THEY WANT CHANGES. AND YOU KNOW, WE WOULD BE FALLING  
23 WAY SHORT IF WE DON'T DO IT. THIS IS PROBABLY -- FOR  
24 EVERYBODY IN THIS ROOM, THIS IS PROBABLY GOING TO BE THE ONLY  
25 OPPORTUNITY YOU HAVE TO REALLY CHANGE TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA.



JUNE 24, 2024

1 THIS MEASURE COULD BE THAT TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION THAT'S  
2 GOING TO BE TAKEN IN THE BAY AREA. SO, I HOPE WE CAN MAKE  
3 THOSE CONNECTIONS. AND, SO. I'LL GO THIS WAY. TURN ON YOUR  
4 LIGHT IF YOU WANT TO SPEAK.

5

6 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. THANK YOU. SO,  
7 ON THIS QUESTION OF COSTING, I THINK THIS IS A REALITY  
8 IMPORTANT QUESTION. TO ME, THERE IS A COUPLE OF ELEMENTS AND I  
9 AM SURE MTC STAFF CAN HELP US WITH THIS, BUT THERE IS THE  
10 QUESTION OF WHAT IS THE SERVICE LEVEL THAT'S REQUIRED IN ORDER  
11 FOR PEOPLE TO ACTUALLY CHOOSE TRANSIT. BECAUSE IN SOME CASES,  
12 WE'RE CUTTING BELOW LEVEL OF SERVICE AT THAT ESSENTIALLY JUST  
13 -- IT PUTS OUR TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS IN A DIFFICULT  
14 POSITION BECAUSE THEIR CHOICES ARE POOR BUT ANYBODY THAT HAS  
15 ALTERNATIVE TO DRIVE IS NOT GOING TO ACTUALLY CHOOSE TRANSIT.  
16 SO THINKING WHAT IS THE PROBLEM WE'RE SOLVING TO ME IT WOULD  
17 BE GETTING OUR SYSTEMS TO A LEVEL AT WHICH SERVICE COULD BE  
18 OFFERED SUCH THAT PEOPLE CHOOSE TRANSIT. SO THAT'S KIND OF ONE  
19 DATA INPUT THAT WOULD BE INTERESTING FOR US TO UNDERSTAND.  
20 THE OTHER IS TO LOOK AT KIND OF WHAT THE GOALS OF PLANNED BAY  
21 AREA REQUIRE IN TERMS OF TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. I KNOW THAT THERE  
22 ARE SOME ASSUMPTIONS IN PLANNED BAY AREA AROUND RECENT  
23 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, BUT REST ON SOLUTIONS THAT ARE VERY  
24 POLITICALLY CHALLENGING. LIKE ROAD PRICING. AND, SO, AS WE  
25 THINKING ABOUT HOW WE'RE ACTUALLY GOING TO MEET OUR



JUNE 24, 2024

1 SUSTAINABILITY GOALS, OUR CLIMATE GOALS AS A REGION, TRANSIT  
2 BECOMES AN EVEN MORE IMPORTANT COMPONENT. SO UNDERSTANDING  
3 KIND OF THE ROLE OF PLANNED BAY AREA, TO HELP US UNDERSTAND  
4 AGAIN WHAT THIS KIND OF THERE IS THAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR. I  
5 WOULD ASSUME THAT ALSO MTC HAS DATA AROUND KIND OF A  
6 GENERALIZED COST OF THE ACTION PLAN AND I THINK HAVING SOME  
7 PRIORITIZATION AROUND THE COMPONENT PIECES OF THE ACTION PLAN  
8 AGAIN TIED TO MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE ACTUALLY MEETING OUR  
9 PLANNED BAY AREA GOALS AND NOT PUTTING FUNDING AT RISK WOULD  
10 MAKE SENSE AS WELL. AND I'M HOPING THIS DOESN'T HAVE TO BE  
11 RIGHT NOW -- BUT I'M HOPING THAT WE CAN GET AN UNDERSTANDING  
12 ALSO FROM THE FACILITATOR AND FROM STAFF, HOW THE WORK OF  
13 THIS COMMITTEE, THIS COMMITTEE, THE SELECT COMMITTEE, IS GOING  
14 TO INTERSECT WITH THE OPERATOR'S EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE. BECAUSE  
15 THESE ARE NEEDING TO MEET UP ALONG THE WAY AND IT WASN'T  
16 CLEAR TO ME HOW THAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN BUT CERTAINLY  
17 DEVELOPING INPUTS WOULD REST ON ENGAGEMENT FROM THE OPERATORS.  
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE A QUESTION/COMMENT. THINKING OF OUT-YEARS  
21 HERE, AND LOOKING AT THE NUMBERS -- I KNOW THIS IS A BIG TASK  
22 THANK YOU FOR PUTTING THIS TOGETHER -- THE ALLIANCE HOSTED AN  
23 EVENT LAST WEEK WITH THE SECRETARY OF TRANSPORTATION, THE  
24 CHAIRS, AND TRANSIT INDUSTRY, AS WELL AS OUR INDUSTRY LEADERS  
25 ON THE FUTURE OF TRANSPORTATION. SO MY QUESTION AND THEN



JUNE 24, 2024

1 COMMENT IS, DO THESE NUMBERS ACCOUNT FOR POTENTIAL DOWN FALLS  
2 AND STATE FUNDING AS WE MOVE TOWARDS ELECTRIFICATION OR  
3 ZERO-EMISSIONS FOR STATE FUNDING BECAUSE DIESEL IS THE PRIMARY  
4 STATE SOURCE. WHEN WE LOOK AT THIS, ARE WE LOOKING AT FIVE-  
5 YEAR PERSPECTIVE WITH THIS DEFICIT OR POTENTIALLY 5 TO 10  
6 YEARS? BECAUSE WE MAY HAVE A BIGGER ISSUE IF WE'RE GOING TO GO  
7 OUT AND ASK FOR THE VOTERS THAT'S MY QUESTION AND THEN I HAVE  
8 COMPLAINT.

9

10 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I DON'T BELIEVE -- THIS JUST GOES OUT FOR THE  
11 FIVE YEARS -- SO, I DO NOT BELIEVE THIS INCLUDES LOOKING AT  
12 THE ELECTRIFICATION SO WE CAN COME BACK AND CONFIRM.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** SURE AND I THINK IT'S MORE TO CONSIDER THAT IF WE'RE  
15 GOING TO GO TO THE VOTERS AND ASKING FOR A MEASURE, WHEN WE  
16 KNOW COST OF LIVING IS INCREASED AND WE KNOW RESIDENTS OF THE  
17 BAY AREA ARE FEELING THE PRESSURES, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE TO  
18 ACCOUNT FOR WHAT WE'RE GOING TO ASK FOR AND WHAT MAY BE COMING  
19 IN THE FUTURE. THAT BEING SAID IN THE SPIRIT OF THE ALL OF THE  
20 ABOVE APPROACH IT'S NOT JUST ON SALES TAX ON DIESEL IT'S GAS  
21 TAX AS WELL. 0-EMISSIONS STATE MOVES TO ZERO MISSIONS YOU SEE  
22 GAS TAX AS WELL, AND FUNDING AND INFRASTRUCTURE AND RAIL AND  
23 TRANSIT SYSTEMS USE AS WELL SO THAT'S PART TO CONSIDER AS  
24 THINGS ARE MOVING FORWARD.

25



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GOOD POINT. COMING AROUND. SUE?

2

3 **SUE NOACK:** I JUST -- MY GENERAL THOUGHT WAS WHAT HOLE SHOULD  
4 WE BE FILLING FIRST AS A WHOLE, COME 2026. IN AND IN CONTEXT  
5 OF LONG-TERM, IF WE WANT TRANSFORMATION AND TRAVEL PATTERNS  
6 TO STAY MORE IN WHERE THEY ARE TODAY, HOW IS THAT MONEY GOING  
7 TO BE ALLOCATED TO ACHIEVE THOSE GOALS? AND I THINK THOSE  
8 TWO THINGS ARE REALLY IMPORTANT. THE SHORT-TERM WHOLE NEEDS  
9 TO REALLY -- THIS IS A SHORT TERM CAP IN ORDER TO GET US TO  
10 WHERE WE NEED TO BE IN TRANSFORMATION AND STABILIZING  
11 TRANSPORTATION PATTERNS AND ADDRESSING THOSE WITH THIS MEASURE  
12 DOWN THE ROAD. THAT'S GOING TO BE IMPORTANT TO POINT OUT TO  
13 VOTERS FOR THEM TO SEE TRANSFORMATION TAKING PLACE THAN JUST  
14 PLUGGING A HOLE AND THINGS ARE GOING TO GO THE SAME.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** DAVID?

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. ONE OF THE THINGS I WOULD  
19 LIKE TO UNDERSTAND BETTER FROM STAFF, AND MAYBE WE CAN HAVE  
20 PRESENTATIONS BY THE DIFFERENT OPERATORS? BUT WITH THE  
21 DOWNTURN IN RIDERSHIP HOW IS TRANSIT AGENCIES MADE  
22 ADJUSTMENTS. WHAT WAS PUT BEFORE US OBVIOUSLY WAS THIS ISSUE  
23 AROUND 12% WORK-FROM-HOME. I'M JUST CURIOUS, AND I WOULD LIKE  
24 TO SEE, THROUGH THE CHAIR, IF WE CAN HAVE THE ABILITY TO HAVE  
25 EACH OF THE OPERATORS PRESENT TO US ON, YOU KNOW, THE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 ADJUSTMENTS THAT THEY HAVE MADE NOW. AND WHAT THE ADJUSTMENTS  
2 MAY BE IN THE FUTURE. I THINK THAT'S REALLY CRITICAL IN HOW WE  
3 MOVE FORWARD. YOU KNOW, SECONDLY, I DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT,  
4 AS WE MOVE FORWARD, THAT WE NEED A STRONG NETWORK MANAGER  
5 COMPONENT TO THIS. AND I CAN'T REITERATE WHAT CHAIR SPERING  
6 SAID, IF WE DON'T HAVE THAT CRITICAL PIECE MOVING FORWARD, I  
7 THINK IT'S GOING TO BE EXTRAORDINARILY CHALLENGING. I THINK  
8 IT'S A MOMENT IN TIME THAT WE'LL PROBABLY NEVER HAVE AGAIN.  
9 BUT I THINK A STRONG NETWORK MANAGEMENT SYSTEM IS REALLY  
10 IMPORTANT AS WE WORK THROUGH. I THINK WE HAVE -- AND CORRECT  
11 ME IF I AM WRONG, I THINK WE HAVE ABOUT 27 DIFFERENT TRANSIT  
12 AGENCIES. IS THAT CORRECT?

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YES.

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** SO, BUT I JUST THINK, AGAIN, I THINK IT'S  
17 IMPERATIVE AND I'LL CLOSE WITH THIS, THAT THE OPERATORS COME  
18 BEFORE THE SELECT COMMITTEE AND TALK ABOUT THE ADJUSTMENTS  
19 THEY MADE, AND WHAT THE ADJUSTMENTS LOOK LIKE IN THE FUTURE.  
20 BECAUSE I THINK ON THEIR END THERE HAS TO BE A PLAN. SO WITH  
21 THAT, I THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING.

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. WHEN I LOOK AT  
24 WHAT'S PRESENTED, IT DOES ADDRESS THE PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO  
25 SOLVE. ONE IS THE FISCAL CLIFF. I THINK THE QUESTION IS HOW





JUNE 24, 2024

1 MUCH DO WE FILL THE BUCKET WITH. I THINK THAT'S A QUESTION  
2 THAT WE CAN DISCUSS AND HAVE CONVERSATIONS ON. BUT IN THAT I'M  
3 ALSO INTERESTED IN SEEING AND HEARING ABOUT THE EFFICIENCIES  
4 OF THE OPERATORS. I'M NOT INTERESTED IN GOING BACK TO NORMAL.  
5 I'M INTERESTED IN CREATING A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT'S FORWARD-  
6 LOOKING, THAT'S INNOVATIVE. WE OFTEN LOOK AT HOW OTHER REGIONS  
7 ARE DOING WE GO TO THESE OTHER REGIONS AND COMPARE HOW THEY'RE  
8 DOING THINGS DIFFERENTLY. WELL, THIS IS OUR MOMENT TO DOING  
9 THINGS DIFFERENTLY AS WELL. PART OF THIS IS ADDRESSING THE  
10 FISCAL CLIFF SO WE KNOW THE PUBLIC HAS A TRANSIT SYSTEM TO  
11 RIDE. AND THE OTHER COMPONENT COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ WAS ALLUDING  
12 TO AS WELL, IS WHAT ARE THE FORWARD FACING INITIATIVES THAT WE  
13 WANT TO TAKE ON AND HOW DO WE DO THAT? THERE IS A STICKER  
14 PRICE TO THOSE INITIATIVES AND I'M INTERESTED IN ADVANCING AND  
15 CONTINUING THE WORK WE HAVE EMBARKED ON, BUT I LOOK AT THOSE  
16 TWO AREAS. I WANT TO BE CLEAR I'M NOT INTERESTED IN GOING BACK  
17 TO BUSINESS AS IT WAS BEFORE, FUNDAMENTALLY CHANGING BUILDING  
18 OFF WHAT WE WERE DOING WELL, BUT ACKNOWLEDGING THAT IT'S NOT  
19 JUST NEW MONEY THIS WE'RE GOING TO KEEP PROVIDING IT'S  
20 INITIATIVES AND OUTCOMES THAT WE HAVE TO SEE. THANK YOU,  
21 CHAIR.

22

23 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** THANK YOU. SO, I WANT TO MAKE A COUPLE OF,  
24 MAYBE, SEEMINGLY UNRELATED POINTS. FIRST ONE IS, I HAVE SAT  
25 ON ALL THESE DIFFERENT TASK FORCES, AND THERE HAS BEEN A LOT



JUNE 24, 2024

1 OF PRODUCT OF CONVERSATION, BUT SO FAR, NOT A HUGE AMOUNT OF  
2 RESULTS. AND I APPRECIATE MY COLLEAGUES, I THINK, TO A PERSON  
3 SAYING THINGS HAVE TO STRUCTURALLY BE DIFFERENT AND WE HAVE  
4 TO SHOW REAL CHANGE IF WE EXPECT TO BE ABLE TO GO FORWARD, AND  
5 IT'S ALSO THE RIGHT THING TO DO. NOT INCLUDED IN THE  
6 CONVERSATION MUCH IN THE TASK FORCE, AS I HAVE TRIED TO RAISE  
7 IT IS THE ISSUE AROUND SAFETY AND THE RIDER EXPERIENCE. AND  
8 YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S A REALLY IMPORTANT FACTOR. IT'S A  
9 SIGNIFICANT, MORE THAN MATERIAL REDUCTION IN DEMAND, SO IF  
10 YOU'RE A COMPANY, AND YOU LOSE HALF YOUR RIDERS, LOSE HALF  
11 YOUR CUSTOMERS, PROBABLY THE STOCK MARKET WOULD DING YOU  
12 PRETTY GOOD FOR THAT, RIGHT? AND I THINK WE HAVE TO REALLY --  
13 I THINK IT'S INCUMBENT UPON US TO REALLY DELVE INTO WHAT'S  
14 HAPPENING. I THINK ASSUMPTIONS ARE BEING MADE ABOUT THE NATURE  
15 OF CIRCUMSTANCES THAT SHOULDN'T BE JUST EASILY ASSUMED. I  
16 KNOW I DON'T KNOW WHERE WE ARE. I'M CONFUSED BY THE  
17 CIRCUMSTANCES HERE. I -- I COME HERE, I SEE THIS BEAUTIFUL  
18 CITY, AND THIS INCREDIBLE STUFF WE HAVE INVESTED IN, AND I  
19 LOOK DOWN THE STREET AND THERE AIN'T NOBODY THERE. NOW, THIS  
20 IS HAPPENING IN CITIES, BUT IT'S ESPECIALLY HAPPENING HERE IN  
21 OUR CITY, SAN FRANCISCO, WHERE THE TRANSIT SYSTEM HAS BEEN  
22 KIND OF AIMED, AND IT'S HAPPENING IN THE REST OF THE REGION,  
23 TOO, MORE THAN IT IS AROUND THE REST OF THE COUNTRY. SO WE  
24 HAVE BEEN AT SOVEREIGN THE BOTTOM END OF THIS. AND, YOU KNOW,  
25 WE DID A POLL AT BAY AREA COUNCIL. I DON'T KNOW MAYBE IT WAS A



JUNE 24, 2024

1 YEAR AGO, MORE THAN A YEAR AGO, FOCUSED ON BART,  
2 PARTICULARLY, AND WHAT WE FOUND WAS THAT RIDERS WERE  
3 AVOIDING BART, BECAUSE THEY WERE AFRAID TO RIDE IT. THEY  
4 DIDN'T WANT TO HAVE THE KIND OF EXPERIENCE THEY ASSUME THEY  
5 WOULD HAVE, WHEN THEY RODE IT, AND I GET THAT ANECDOTALLY FROM  
6 PEOPLE TODAY, AND I GET IT WHEN I ASK MYSELF, BECAUSE I RIDE  
7 IT, AND THE EXPERIENCES I HAVE TODAY. DESPITE THE FACT THAT  
8 BART HAS MADE INVESTMENTS. I APPRECIATE MR. POWERS IS HERE,  
9 AND HE RODE US ALL ON THE COMMITTEE A GOOD SUMMATION OF  
10 EVERYTHING THAT AFFECTS BART AND BART IS TRYING TO DO, AND I  
11 DEEPLY APPRECIATE ALL OF THAT. BUT I THINK THE SAFETY AND  
12 EXPERIENCE FACTOR IS HUGE HERE. IT'S JUST NOT A SIDE ISSUE.  
13 IT'S SOMETHING WE REALLY HAVE TO GET INTO, AS TO, YOU KNOW,  
14 BECAUSE PEOPLE DON'T FEEL SAFE, OR THEY DON'T LIKE IT, THEY'RE  
15 GOING TO FIND A WAY -- THEY'RE GOING TO FIND THAT AS A REASON  
16 TO STAY HOME. OR THEY'RE GOING TO FIND AN ALTERNATE WAY OF  
17 GOING. TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IS -- IT'S LESS THAN ONE OUT OF TEN  
18 TRIPS IN THE REGION. PEOPLE ARE NOT USING TRANSIT. THEY USED  
19 TO USE IT MORE. IT USED TO BE AT 1.13% OF TRIPS, IT'S DOWN IN  
20 THE 8% CATEGORY. YOU KNOW? THAT'S A HUGE DROP. BUT IT ALWAYS  
21 WAS LOW. WE ALWAYS WANTED TO MAKE IT MORE AND WE HAVEN'T  
22 SUCCEEDED IN DOING THAT. THE VOTERS ARE PEOPLE WHO ARE CAR  
23 DEPENDENT. 80 TO 90 PERCENT OF TRIPS ARE PEOPLE DRIVING SINGLE  
24 OCCUPANT VEHICLE OR CARPOOL. SO WE HAVE TO ADDRESS THEIR NEEDS  
25 AS WELL AND THEIR EXPECTATIONS AND FOR A LOT OF PEOPLE TRANSIT



JUNE 24, 2024

1 JUST ISN'T THE SOLUTION. I KNOW WE WOULD LIKE IT TO BE, BUT  
2 IT'S NOT. SO WE HAVE TO TAKE THAT INTO CONSIDERATION. MORE  
3 COMPLEX THAN THAT IS IT'S NOT JUST TRANSIT. IT'S WHERE  
4 TRANSIT GOES. THIS CITY IS SUFFERING A REPUTATIONAL  
5 NIGHTMARE. IT'S A NIGHTMARE THE WAY THAT SAN FRANCISCO IS  
6 BEING PERCEIVED. THE CITY WAS THE TOP OF THE HILL, GOLD  
7 MOUNTAIN, YOU KNOW, LOOKED TO AROUND THE WORLD AS THE GREATEST  
8 PLACE TO TRAVEL AND COME TO. EVERYBODY WANTED TO COME HERE.  
9 EVERYBODY WANTED TO WORK HERE, IT IS A PLACE TO AVOID. AND  
10 THAT'S NOT JUST FOR PEOPLE AROUND THE COUNTRY AND AROUND THE  
11 WORLD WHO HAVE MADE THIS THE RECOVERED TRAVEL DESTINATION  
12 ALSO THE PEOPLE WHO LIVE IN THE SUBURBAN AREAS WHO USED TO  
13 LIKE TO COME TO RECREATE AND ENTERTAINED AND GO TO STUFF GO TO  
14 RESTAURANTS AND VARIOUS KINDS OF ACTIVITIES ARE REALLY HAD  
15 HESITANT ABOUT DOING IT WHEN THERE ISN'T -- THEY DON'T TAKE  
16 TRANSIT YOU KNOW? THEY STAY HOME. SO WE CAN'T SOLVE THAT IN  
17 THIS ROOM, BECAUSE WE'RE NOT IN CHARGE OF THAT, BUT WE HAVE TO  
18 TAKE IT INTO ACCOUNT. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE US NEXT TRY TO  
19 MEASURE THIS, SEE HOW MUCH OF A FACTOR THIS IS. YOU SAID,  
20 CHAIR SPERING, THAT, YOU KNOW -- AND THE BAY AREA COUNCIL  
21 POLLING ON RETURN TO WORK THAT ALIX SHOWED IN THE SLIDE, BEARS  
22 THIS OUT THAT, WE BASICALLY OUR RETURN TO WORK IS KIND OF  
23 TOPPED OUT. WE'RE NOT REALLY LOOKING -- WE DON'T REALLY KNOW  
24 THAT THAT HAS TO BE TRUE BECAUSE IT'S NOT TRUE IN OTHER  
25 PLACES. SO ARE PEOPLE NOT -- WHICH IS THE CHICKEN HERE?



JUNE 24, 2024

1 WHICH IS THING HERE, PEOPLE LIKE STAYING HOME AND SITTING ON  
2 THE COUNTER WITH THE LAPTOP MAYBE I THINK IT'S A CALL. BUT IN  
3 CASES RATHER JUST NOT COME TO EXPERIENCE WHETHER IT'S THE  
4 TRANSIT OR WHAT HAPPENS WHEN THEY COME OFF TRANSIT. AS BOB AND  
5 I EXPERIENCED THE OTHER DAY, HE GOT OFF AND SAID LOOK AT THE  
6 STATION IT'S CLEAN, THE TRAIN IT'S PRETTY CLEAN AND THEN WE  
7 CAME OUT OF THE TRAIN AND IT DIDN'T LOOK SO CLEAN. SO THAT'S  
8 FIRST EXPERIENCE. RIGHT? IT'S A COMPLEX SET OF VARIABLES THAT  
9 HAVE TO BE EXAMINED HERE AND LOOK AT IT IN TOTALITY AT LEAVE  
10 THE AS WE'RE GETTING STARTED. THERE ARE SOME THINGS WE COULD  
11 DO BUT IT'S CERTAINLY -- IF WE CHOOSE TO IGNORE WHY PEOPLE ARE  
12 STAYING OFF AND JUST ASSUME THEY ARE, AND IT'S JUST A NEW WAY  
13 PEOPLE WORK, IT IS AND PROBABLY NOT GOING TO GET BACK TO WHERE  
14 THINGS WERE, BUT I THINK THERE IS AN UPSIDE TO TRYING TO SOLVE  
15 THE EXPERIENCE THAT PEOPLE ARE HAVING, IN GENERAL. AND WE  
16 BETTER ATTEND TO IT IN THE REGION. OUR ORGANIZATION IS NOT A  
17 TRANSIT ADVOCATE. YOU KNOW, WE THINK OF EVERYTHING WE'RE  
18 WORKING ON ALL OF THESE DIFFERENT ISSUES AND IT'S VERY  
19 VESTING. I'M GOING TO TRY TO STAY FOCUSED ON THE BIGGER  
20 PICTURE HERE AS I SIT HERE, THINK ABOUT THE WAY PEOPLE GET  
21 AROUND AND REMEMBER MOST PEOPLE ARE DEPENDING ON A CAR TRANSIT  
22 TRIP, HOW DO WE MAKE THAT BETTER, AS WE WERE DOING IN  
23 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE, WORKING ON IT FASTER AS WE HAVE DONE  
24 ON A LOT OF DIFFERENT COUNTY MEASURES OVER THE COURSE, ABOUT  
25 THE EXPERIENCE OF DIFFERENT PEOPLE USING THE SYSTEM AND THE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 PROMISE THAT WE COULD MAKE TO MAKE IT BETTER. I WOULD URGE,  
2 YOU KNOW, WE GET TO A NUMBER, I DON'T KNOW IF IT'S 15 MINUTES,  
3 BUT LET'S SAVE EVERYBODY 15 MINUTES ON THEIR COMMUTE. LIKE,  
4 LET'S COME OUT OF HERE AND SAY, EVERYBODY 15 MINUTES, YOU'RE  
5 GOING TO GET TO WHEREVER YOU'RE GOING 15 MINUTES FASTER. I'LL  
6 VOTE THE FOR THAT.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. [LAUGHTER] YEAH.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, JIM. GOOD COMMENTS. I THINK  
11 THAT'S A BIG PIECE OF WHAT WE'RE DOING.

12

13 **ELLEN WU:** I AGREE IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT THE BIG PICTURE AND  
14 FOCUSING BE ON THE FISCAL CLIFF, AND NOT JUST THE FAREBOX  
15 DEFICIT BECAUSE THINGS HAVE CHANGED AND WE CAN'T -- AS EASY AS  
16 IT WOULD BE TO PLUG THAT HOLE WE HAVE TO LOOK AT THE CHANGES  
17 THAT HAVE NAPPED OUR RIDERSHIP AND ADDRESS THOSE. AND ONE  
18 THING FOR SURE IS THAT THERE ARE PEOPLE WHO ARE STILL RIDING  
19 TRANSIT. THE TRANSIT DEPENDENT PEOPLE, AND WE CANNOT LOSE  
20 THEM. RIGHT? WE HAVE ALREADY LOST A SEGMENT OF THE POPULATION  
21 WHO ARE COMMUTING, WHO ARE SCARED, WHATEVER THE REASON. BUT  
22 THERE ARE STILL PEOPLE WHO DONE ON TRANSIT, AND WE NEED TO  
23 MAKE THE TRANSIT WORK FOR THEM. AND IF WE FOCUS ON WORKING --  
24 MAKING SURE IT WORKS FOR THEM, IT WILL WORK FOR EVERYONE. THIS  
25 IDEA OF, LIKE, GOING BROADER, AND REACHING MORE PEOPLE AND



JUNE 24, 2024

1 GETTING PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR CAR, THAT IS A TALL -- I'M FROM  
2 THE SUBURBS, I KNOW WHAT A TALL ORDER THAT IS, RIGHT? BUT  
3 REALLY FOCUSING ON NOT LOSING THE FOLKS WHO ARE DEPENDING ON  
4 TRANSIT NOW AND MAKING SURE THAT WE FIX THE STRUCTURAL  
5 CHALLENGES THAT ALL THE OPERATORS HAVE HAD IN TERMS OF  
6 OPERATION DOLLARS, IS, I THINK, REALLY, REALLY CRITICAL. AND  
7 THAT'S WHERE -- AND THAT'S CENTERING THE PEOPLE WE TALK ABOUT  
8 CENTERING.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** SO, HOW CAN WE ACHIEVE TRANSFORMATION WITHOUT  
11 INVESTING? THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. WHAT WILL BE THE OUTCOME  
12 FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA IF WE DON'T INVEST AND  
13 IMPROVE IN THE CURRENT SYSTEMS AND REDUCE AND CHOOSE TO  
14 REDUCE SERVICE TO SAVE THE SYSTEMS. WE MUST UNDERSTAND WHY  
15 RIDERSHIP HAS DROPPED PUBLIC TRANSIT ALWAYS CAN CHANGE THAT  
16 SOCIAL BEHAVIOR, RIGHT? THAT'S ONE OF THE PROBLEMS WE FACE YOU  
17 HAVE THE WORKERS CLEAN THE STATIONS CLEAN THE TRAINS SOMEONE  
18 WALKS THIS IS EATING THROWS THE GARBAGE ON THE FLOOR THE NEXT  
19 PERSON THAT WALKS IN THINKS PUBLIC TRANSIT IS DIRTY BART IS  
20 DIRTY. THAT'S THE PROBLEM SOCIETY, PROBLEM IS THE CITIES AND  
21 COUNTIES THAT DO NOT DO THEIR JOB CAUSING PEOPLE TO THEN GO TO  
22 THE PUBLIC TRANSIT, RIDE THE BUSES, RIDE BART, USE THE BART  
23 STATIONS AS A PLACE TO SURVIVE WHEN IT'S HOT OUT THERE OR  
24 WHEN IT'S COLD. IT'S A PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN THE TRANSIT  
25 SYSTEMS AND THE CITIES. EVERYBODY GOT TO PUT IN AND WE GOT TO



JUNE 24, 2024

1 KEEP GOING FORWARD AND FIGHTING THE CHALLENGE UNTIL WE WIN.  
2 UNTIL PEOPLE DECIDE TO COME BACK TO SAN FRANCISCO TO WORK, TO  
3 ENJOY. WE JUST CAN'T GIVE UP. SOMETIMES YOU JUST GOT TO  
4 INVEST, PUSH, PUSH, FEELS LIKE YOU'RE NOT GETTING NOWHERE, BUT  
5 EVENTUALLY THINGS CHANGE. IT DOESN'T HELP WHEN THE MEDIA DOES  
6 BAD ARTICLES ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSIT EVERYBODY GETS ON THE TRAIN  
7 AND THE BUS IS LOOKING FOR THE BAD THINGS. RIGHT? SO WE NEED  
8 TO CHANGE THAT, ALSO, WHERE THE MEDIA STARTS TALKING ABOUT  
9 POSITIVE RECOVERY IN THE CITY SO PEOPLE START LOOKING FOR THE  
10 POSITIVE THINGS AND BE WILLING TO INVEST. THANK YOU, CHAIR.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. STEPHANIE? DO YOU WANT TO? I  
13 SEE YOUR HAND UP.

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** STEPHANIE AND THEN I'LL COME BACK TO YOU.  
18 I DIDN'T SEE YOUR LIGHT.

19

20 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I'LL BE BRIEF. I THINK WE NEED TO  
21 PRIORITIZE ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF FIRST. AND I'M GOING  
22 TO AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUES, COMMISSIONER PEDROZA, THAT WE  
23 HAVE ALSO GOT TO LOOK FOR EFFICIENCY WITH THE OPERATORS. IN  
24 NORTH BAY I'M GOING TO BE LOOKING AT ALL THE OPERATORS TO  
25 FIGURE OUT TOGETHER WHERE CAN THEY BE MORE EFFICIENT IN





JUNE 24, 2024

1 DELIVERING SERVICE THAT CUSTOMERS WANT. AND I THINK IT WILL  
2 TAKE BELT TIGHTENING IN SOME AREAS FOR CHANGE AND SOME BELT  
3 TIGHTENING IN OTHER AREAS. TRANSFORMATION IS WORTH LOOKING AT  
4 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND UPDATING THAT. ONE OF THE  
5 THINGS I OBSERVED ABOUT THE PROCESS THIS YEAR IN THE  
6 LEGISLATURE IS WE TRIED TO PUT A LOT INTO A BILL AND DO IT ALL  
7 AT ONCE, AND I THINK CHANGE TAKES TIME AND IT WOULD BE HELPFUL  
8 FOR OUR FACILITATOR TO HELP USING IF OUT THOSE THINGS THAT CAN  
9 HAPPEN IN THE NEXT 1 TO 3 YEARS AND FIVE AND MORE TO LOOK  
10 CLOSELY AT MANAGEMENT TO GET TRANSFORMATION. THOSE ARE MY  
11 THOUGHTS AND MY OWN PRIORITIES. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, STEPHANIE. ADINA?

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, BUILDING ON SOME THINGS THAT OTHERS HAVE  
16 SAID. SO, IN TERMS OF ACHIEVING -- NOT -- REGROWING RIDERSHIP  
17 AND INCREASING THE USE OF TRANSIT, IF YOU LOOK AT PLACES IN  
18 NORTH AMERICA AND AROUND THE WORLD THAT WERE MORE RESILIENT TO  
19 COVID, THERE WERE PLACES THAT -- IN THE BAY AREA, OUR PUBLIC  
20 TRANSIT SYSTEM HAD BEEN VERY HEAVILY FOCUSED TOWARD THE 9 TO 5  
21 WHITE COLLAR COMMUTERS AND ARGUABLY THEN THAT WAS AN OVER-  
22 FOCUS AND THERE WERE PEOPLE WHO HAD A WORKING CLASS JOBS WHO  
23 WERE WORKING AT A RESTAURANT OR SERVICE, OR HOSPITAL, WHO COME  
24 IN EARLIER AND LEAVE LATER AND WORK ON THE WEEKEND, WHO  
25 WEREN'T BEING SERVED BY THE SYSTEM BEFORE COVID AND WE REALLY



JUNE 24, 2024

1 SAW WHO WAS DEPENDING ON TRANSIT DURING COVID AND CONTINUING  
2 TO USE TRANSIT IN THE DEPTH OF THE PANDEMIC REGIONS THAT DID  
3 HAVE A SERVICE ORIENTED TOWARDS A GREATER VARIETY OF RIDERS  
4 AND VARIETY OF TRIPS WERE MORE RESILIENT TO COVID TO BEGIN  
5 WITH AND THAT IS A LESSON NOT JUST TO RETURN TO STATUS QUO  
6 ANTI-FOR OUR REGION, AND I WANT TO MENTION THAT WITH THE ON  
7 TEAM BEING PART OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION  
8 COALITION WHICH IS SUPPORTING MEETING NEEDS OF PEOPLE WHO  
9 DEPEND ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION THE BAY AREA. 2/3 OF WORKING  
10 LOW-INCOME PEOPLE DRIVE BECAUSE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION MAYBE  
11 BECAUSE OF DRIVING A TRUCK AND CARRYING STUFF BUT ALSO PEOPLE  
12 LIVE FAR AWAY FROM WHERE THEY'RE WORKING TRANSIT DOESN'T WORK  
13 SO THAT OFFERS OPPORTUNITIES TO MEET THE NEED OF PEOPLE THAT  
14 THIS SYSTEM WANT WORKING FOR BEFORE SO IT'S NOT JUST STATUS  
15 QUO ANTE. AND SPEAKING OF PEOPLE WHO DEPEND ON TRANSIT WANTED  
16 TO ECHO WHAT ELLEN SAID, IN TERMS OF HAVING REPRESENTATION,  
17 THE SENIOR POPULATION IS GROWING INCREDIBLY QUICKLY AND  
18 REPRESENTING PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND SENIORS THAT HAVE  
19 FUNDAMENTAL NEEDS OF DEPENDING ON TRANSIT, YOU KNOW, WOULD BE  
20 HELPFUL TO REPRESENT IN THIS PROCESS. SPEAKING TO THE ISSUE  
21 OF THE STATE FUNDING, THERE ARE TWO DIFFERENT PROCESSES GOING  
22 ON RIGHT NOW AT THE STATE LEVEL, SB1121 PROCESS, WHICH I THINK  
23 THAT WAS MENTIONED, AND SB125 PROCESS FOLLOWING UP TO LAST  
24 YEAR'S BUDGET DEAL, BOTH LOOKING AT WHAT IS THE ROLE OF THE  
25 STATE IS PLAYING WITH REGARD TO THE CHANGE FROM THE GAS TAX



JUNE 24, 2024

1 AND HOW TO SUPPORT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND ALL OF TRANSIT.  
2 AND I THINK THAT WE, IN THE BAY AREA, SHOULD BE THINKING ABOUT  
3 WHAT WE ARE DOING IN THE CONTEXT OF WHAT ALSO IS GOING ON AT  
4 THE STATE. AND IN THE LONGER RUN AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL. BUT WE  
5 NEED TO DO OUR OWN THING. WE NEED TO HELP OURSELVES. WE'RE NOT  
6 GOING TO GET ANY MORE HELP FROM THE STATE UNLESS WE HELP  
7 OURSELVES. WILL SO WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT THAT, BUT THE FOCUS  
8 OF THIS IS ABOUT WHAT CAN WE BE DOING TO HELP OURSELVES  
9 LASTLY. I THINK I HEARD A COUPLE OF PEOPLE MENTIONING THIS  
10 IS OUR LAST CHANCE. AND YOU KNOW, BASED ON LOOKING AT SOME  
11 OTHER EXAMPLES, I REALLY DON'T THINK THAT IS THE CASE IF WE DO  
12 TAKE THIS REALLY CRISIS AND OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE THE  
13 SYSTEM. YOU KNOW, THE LESSON FROM SWITZERLAND WAS THAT THEY  
14 DID SOME THINGS TO, LIKE, ADDRESS PROBLEMS THAT INCREASED  
15 PUBLIC CONFIDENCE IN THE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, AND  
16 THAT ALLOWED FOR FURTHER WAVES OF INVESTMENT. SO, HAD YOU  
17 INCREASED RIDERSHIP, INCREASED CONFIDENCE, INCREASE  
18 INVESTMENT. SO LOOKING AT WHAT WE NEED TO DO IMMEDIATELY, THAT  
19 WILL SET US UP FOR IMPROVEMENTS LATER. AND THEN, SORRY, LAST  
20 THING, WHICH IS THAT IN TERMS OF SUPPORTING A LARGE SHARE OF  
21 THE POPULATION, LARGER THAN PEOPLE WHO USE TRANSIT, WE ALSO  
22 NEED TO KEEP OUR CLIMATE GOALS IN MIND. THANKS.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS. THE  
25 ONE THING I DON'T WANT THIS COMMITTEE TO LOSE SIGHT, IS THE 50



JUNE 24, 2024

1 DECISION WE NEED TO MAKE OR BUILD CONSENSUS IS, DO WE THINK WE  
2 SHOULD ADDRESS THIS FISCAL CLIFF. AND NOT WHAT IS A FUNDING  
3 SOURCE, OR WHAT THE MECHANISMS CAN BE, IT CAN BE A LOT OF  
4 DIFFERENT THINGS, BUT THE QUESTION, I THINK, IT'S GOING TO BE  
5 VERY IMPORTANT AS WE START MOVING FORWARD, IS THAT ARE WE ALL  
6 IN AGREEMENT OF ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF AND ALL THE THINGS  
7 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HOW THIS THING IS PACKAGED AND ADDRESS  
8 SOME OF THOSE THINGS. I WANT EVERYBODY TO BE THINKING ABOUT  
9 THAT, DO YOU THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WE'RE ADDRESSING THIS FISCAL  
10 CLIFF AND WE CAN TALK ABOUT HOW TO DEAL WITH IT OR WHAT THAT  
11 FUNDING SOURCE MIGHT BE, THAT WOULD BE STEP TWO. AND NOT  
12 SEEING ANY OTHER COMMITTEE COMMENTS. STUART, ARE YOU READY TO  
13 RESPOND TO ALL THE THINGS THAT YOU HAVE HEARD? [LAUGHTER]

14

15 **STUART COHEN:** YES. ACTUALLY, THIS IS A GREAT ENRICHED  
16 DISCUSSION AND SEGUES NICELY INTO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM, WHICH  
17 IS KIND OF TAKING THE TEMPERATURE OF THE ROOM. AND WE ARE VERY  
18 EARLY IN THE PROCESS, BUT WE WOULD LIKE TO TAKE THIS  
19 TEMPERATURE, AND WE'LL DO THAT WITH SOME LIVE POLLING, ON A  
20 FEW JUST VERY HIGH-LEVEL QUESTIONS. AND I WANT TO MAKE IT  
21 CLEAR, THIS IS NOT A VOTE. THERE ARE NO DECISIONS BEING MADE.  
22 IT'S REALLY JUST A WAY TO FOSTER FURTHER DISCUSSION. ALL OF  
23 THESE TOPICS WILL COME BACK AT FUTURE MEETINGS. SO, COMMITTEE  
24 MEMBERS PLEASE TAKE OUT EITHER A PERSONAL DEVICE LIKE A PHONE  
25 OR TABLET. PHONES ARE VERY EASY, OR IF YOU HAVE A YOU



JUNE 24, 2024

1 COMPUTER, LAPTOP SET UP, YOU SEE THE INSTRUCTIONS ON THE  
2 DESK IN FRONT OF YOU, IF YOU HAVE A PHONE OR TABLET, IS A  
3 CODE YOU CAN SCAN THAT QR CODE IT WILL TAKE YOU INTO A SITE  
4 CALLED MENTEE WHICH IS A REALLY GREAT LITTLE SURVEY SITE. SO  
5 I'LL GIVE YOU A MOMENT TO CHECK IN. AND YOU COULD CLICK THE  
6 THUMB'S UP BUTTON THERE AND JOIN ONCE YOU ARE IN. WE'LL GET TO  
7 SEE LITTLE GREEN THUMBS POPPING UP AS YOU JOIN, SO YOU WILL  
8 KNOW HOW MANY PEOPLE HAVE COME IN. GREAT. DOES ANYBODY NEED  
9 ANY HELP WITH THIS?

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WELL, I CLICKING ON THE THUMB'S UP AND  
12 IT'S NOT TAKING ME ANYWHERE.

13

14 **STUART COHEN:** IT DOESN'T TAKE YOU ANYWHERE YET.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THAT SOUNDS GREAT. WE HAVE TEN IN THERE, AND MAYBE A  
17 COUPLE MORE.

18

19 **STUART COHEN:** SO, ALL RIGHT. WHY DON'T WE MOVE ON TO -- DOES  
20 ANYBODY NEED ANY HELP WITH THIS OTHERWISE? GREAT. OKAY.

21 [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE]

22

23 **STUART COHEN:** WHAT'S THAT? NO. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT QUESTION.  
24 WE'LL ACTUALLY OPEN UP THE POLL. SO THOSE ON THE PHONE, YOU  
25 WILL SEE -- [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE]



JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **STUART COHEN:** YEAH. WE COULD SHOW THE WI-FI TOO? THANK YOU.  
3 AND YOU WILL BE ABLE TO CATCH UP WITH US, JIM. SO THIS IS THE  
4 FIRST QUESTION. RANKING THESE GOALS IN ORDER OF IMPORTANCE AS  
5 WE DEVELOP A TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. AND IT WILL BE -- THERE  
6 WILL BE SHORTHAND ON YOUR QUESTIONS, BUT FIRST IS SUSTAINING  
7 AND IMPROVING TRANSIT BY ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF,  
8 SUPPORTING RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS, INCLUDING FREQUENT  
9 SERVICE AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION  
10 ACTION. STRENGTHENING NETWORK MANAGEMENT. AND I WOULD ASSUME  
11 THAT WE HAVE NEW FUNDING FOR IMPLEMENTATION AND THEN FUNDING  
12 ITEMS BEYOND TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND FOCUSED TRANSIT  
13 IMPROVEMENTS. THE EASY WAY TO DO, THIS IT'S GOING TO BE A  
14 RANKING AND YOU CAN CLICK ON WHICHEVER ANSWER YOU THINK  
15 SHOULD BE FIRST IT WILL RISE TO THE TOP THEN CLICK ON WHAT YOU  
16 THINK SHOULD BE SECOND, IT WILL RISE TO THE TOP. AND --  
17 [INDISCERNIBLE] YOU HAVE TO GO TO THE NEXT -- YEAH. SO, NOW  
18 YOU SHOULD BE ABLE TO DO THAT. GO AHEAD AND CLICK ON THOSE.  
19 AND THEN ONCE THEY'RE ALL UP THERE, ONCE THE FOUR ARE UP  
20 THERE, YOU WILL BE ABLE TO MOVE THEM AROUND. SO, WE'LL GIVE  
21 YOU A MINUTE WITH THAT. IF ANYBODY HAS ANY QUESTIONS.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

24

25 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES. JUST DRAG --



JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. OKAY. OKAY.

3

4 **STUART COHEN:** WE'LL GET TO WATCH THIS IN REALTIME AS THE  
5 RESPONSES COME IN. AND -- OKAY. GOOD. WE HAVE PRETTY MUCH  
6 EVERYBODY HAS RESPONDED. AND WE DO SEE THAT FISCAL CLIFF AND  
7 RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS ARE GETTING KIND OF THE STRONGEST  
8 SUPPORT, STRENGTHENING NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS THIRD, AND THEN  
9 PROVIDING FUNDS, YOU KNOW, BEYOND TRANSIT OPERATIONS, IN THOSE  
10 KIND OF RIDER-FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS. AND NOW IT LOOKS LIKE  
11 EVERYBODY IS IN. AND, SO, CHAIR SPERING, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT  
12 PROVIDES YOU WITH ANY INFORMATION. JUST LIVE POLLING. BUT  
13 THAT IS SOME INFORMATION FOR YOU. AND, SO, LET'S GO ON TO THE  
14 NEXT QUESTION. OKAY. THIS IS A BIG ONE THAT'S BEEN DISCUSSED.  
15 WHAT GEOGRAPHIC SCALE SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHEN APPROACHING  
16 THIS PROBLEM? AND YOU ONLY GET TO CHOOSE ONE OF THESE, 3 TO 9  
17 COUNTIES, AS WE MOVE FORWARD AND ARE COMING UP WITH  
18 PERMUTATIONS, 5 TO 9, OR JUST LIMITED TO ONLY LOOKING AT NINE  
19 COUNTY SCENARIOS. THAT'S KIND OF THE WORK AHEAD OF US. ALL  
20 RIGHT. WELL, WE HAVE ALL THE RESPONSES.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** STUART, I HAVE A POINT OF QUESTION, FOR  
23 CLARIFICATION PURPOSES. WHEN WE SAY APPROACHING THIS PROBLEM,  
24 ARE WE SAYING A REGIONAL MEASURE FOR THE BAY AREA? OR ARE WE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 SAYING ADDRESSING THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF? WHAT'S THIS  
2 PROBLEM?

3

4 **STUART COHEN:** IT'S AN EXCELLENT QUESTION. I WAS HOPING NOBODY  
5 WAS GOING TO ASK IT. [LAUGHTER]

6

7 **SPEAKER:** SORRY FOR ANYMORE WHO VOTED ALREADY.

8

9 **STUART COHEN:** IT'S THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF TRANSPORTATION  
10 PERSPECTIVE, I WOULD SAY WHAT WE COME UP WITH THE SOLUTION,  
11 NOT THE PROBLEM. THAT'S INTERESTING INFORMATION LET'S MOVE ON  
12 TO THE FINAL QUESTION. THIS IS ONE OF THE VALUES. WHAT  
13 CONCERNS DO YOU HAVE IF THE BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES FALL OFF  
14 THE FISCAL CLIFF? AND ON THIS ONE YOU ARE GOING TO BE ABLE TO  
15 GIVE A 1 TO 5 RANKING FROM NOT CONCERNED IS A ONE, HIGHLY  
16 CONCERNED IS A FIVE. AND YOU WILL BE ABLE TO GIVE ANYTHING IN  
17 BETWEEN. THIS IS MORE GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS, MORE TRAFFIC  
18 CONGESTION, DAMAGE TO THE REGIONAL ECONOMY AND JOB LOSSES,  
19 IMPACTS ON TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS, AND THAT WOULD INCLUDE  
20 THINGS LIKE REDUCED ACCESS TO JOBS, HIGHER TRANSPORTATION  
21 COSTS, ET CETERA, AND POTENTIAL CUTS TO OTHER TRANSIT  
22 PROJECTS OR SERVICES TO COVER THESE OPERATING SHORTFALLS. THE  
23 FUN THING ABOUT THIS ONE IS YOU WILL GET TO SEE THE AVERAGES,  
24 SO THOSE LITTLE CIRCLES CONTAIN WHAT THE AVERAGE RESPONSE IS  
25 FOR THAT QUESTION. AND THEN KIND OF A LIGHTER COLOR THAT YOU





JUNE 24, 2024

1 CAN SEE THESE GRAPHS, YOU CAN KIND OF SEE WHERE PEOPLE ARE  
2 VOTING. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, ON GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, HAVE  
3 SOME ONES AND TWOS, AND FIVES. AND, YEAH, YOU GET TO SEE WHERE  
4 THOSE RESPONSES COME IN. AND, SO, WE HAVE MOST VOTING. AND,  
5 SO, WHAT WE'RE SEEING IS THAT KIND OF DAMAGE THE REGIONAL  
6 ECONOMY, VERY, VERY IMPORTANT, IMPACT ON TRANSIT DEPENDENT  
7 RIDERS, ALSO VERY IMPORTANT. BOTH OF THOSE HAVE A FAIR AMOUNT  
8 OF FIVES. TRAFFIC CONGESTION, WHICH HAS -- JIM WUNDERMAN HAD  
9 SAID AFFECTS MANY PEOPLE WHO ARE LEAVING THEIR HOME ON A GIVEN  
10 DAY. IS THERE FOLLOWED BY POTENTIAL CUTS TO OTHER  
11 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS BECAUSE WE MIGHT FIND OTHER WAYS TO  
12 COVER THE SHORTFALLS, CUTTING INTO THOSE. AND FINALLY  
13 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. SO, VERY INTERESTING RESULTS. AND  
14 JUST WANTED TO GIVE A MOMENT. IF ANYBODY HAD ANY OBSERVATIONS  
15 ON THOSE. THIS IS AGAIN JUST KIND OF INITIAL EARLY  
16 TEMPERATURE TAKING, BUT VERY INTERESTING RESULTING. SO, WITH  
17 THAT, WHY DON'T WE MOVE ON TO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM WHICH IS  
18 GOING TO BE LOOKING AHEAD TO THE PATH FORWARD. AND CHAIR  
19 SPERING, WOULD YOU LIKE TO MAKE ANY REMARKS ON THAT?

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ON?

22

23 **STUART COHEN:** AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX, THAT WOULD BE FORGING  
24 A PATH TOWARDS A SOLUTION.

25



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** NO. NO. FINE -- UH --

2

3 **STUART COHEN:** OTHERWISE I CAN TAKE PEOPLE THROUGH THE TIMELINE

4 AND --

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH, NO, I HAVE MADE MY COMMENT.

7

8 **STUART COHEN:** OKAY.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** BUT THE OTHER PIECE OF THIS, AND I THINK  
11 JIM WUNDERMAN TOUCHED ON IT, IS THAT, YOU KNOW, IF YOU LOOK AT  
12 THE SMALL BUSINESSES, A LOT OF THEM HERE, RIGHT HERE IN SAN  
13 FRANCISCO, AND YOU KNOW, I'M SEEING UP IN MY AREA, THAT ARE  
14 AROUND THESE TRANSIT HUBS, THEY ARE NOT SUCCEEDING AS THEY  
15 HAVE BEEN IN THE PAST. AND, SO, AND THESE ARE -- A LOT OF  
16 THESE ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT WORKERS THAT WE'RE CONCERNED  
17 ABOUT. THIS DOESN'T ONLY IMPACT THEIR ABILITY TO MOVE, IT  
18 STARTS TO IMPACT THEIR INCOME, AND THEIR JOB. AND, SO, I THINK  
19 THAT'S A BIG PIECE OF THIS. BUT, THE -- AND YOU KNOW, ALL THE  
20 THINGS MR. WUNDERMAN WAS TALKING ABOUT, ALL THE BAD THINGS  
21 WE'RE SEEING, IF TRANSIT FAILS, IT'S GOING TO BE A HELL OF A  
22 LOT WORSE. I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE SAY STARTING POINT WHERE  
23 WE START ADDRESSING ALL THESE ISSUES. THE PARTNERS, CITIES  
24 AND COUNTIES ARE GOING TO HAVE TO STEP UP AND DEAL WITH THE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 ISSUES YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. TRANSIT DIDN'T SOLVE A LOT OF  
2 THESE ISSUES THAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** IF I COULD COMMENT TO THAT, CHAIR.

5

6 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I AGREE WITH YOU. IT'S JUST THAT IT'S GOING TO  
7 BE REALLY HARD TO SELL THE VOTERS ON NOT MAKING SOMETHING  
8 WORSE. I DON'T KNOW OF ANY HISTORY OF BEING ABLE TO DO THAT.  
9 SO, I REALLY THINK WE GOT TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO MAKE IT BETTER.  
10 AND THAT'S WHERE WE REALLY NEED TO FOCUS. AND IT'S HARD TO DO  
11 IT IN THE FACE OF A LOOMING FISCAL DISASTER HERE. BUT I REALLY  
12 URGE EVERYBODY TO KIND OF KEEP THE FOCUS ON THAT. AND IF WE DO  
13 IT, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE DONE THIS BEFORE. STUART SAID HOW IT  
14 WAS DONE WITH MEASURE B BEFORE. YOU KNOW, YOU COME UP WITH  
15 SOMETHING THAT EVERYBODY CAN KIND OF BUY INTO. AND IT'S GOT  
16 IMPROVEMENTS IN EVERY WALK OF LIFE. AND THIS AFFECTS  
17 EVERYBODY. WE ALL MOVE AROUND. THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM IS  
18 UBIQUITOUS. AND YOU KNOW, WE CAN MAKE -- WE KNOW WE CAN MAKE  
19 THE SYSTEM BETTER. THE WORK YOU DID LEADING THE -- YOU KNOW,  
20 THAT -- THAT -- THAT BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE PROVES THERE IS  
21 OPPORTUNITY HERE FOR IMPROVEMENT. AND NOW IT'S TIME TO KIND OF  
22 GO FORWARD AND FIGURE OUT HOW A MEASURE CAN SOLVE FOR THAT AS  
23 WELL AS MAKE SURE THAT THE PEOPLE WHO DEPEND ON TRANSIT EVERY  
24 DAY ARE NOT LEFT OUT OR FORGOTTEN. WE HAVE TO SERVE THOSE  
25 PEOPLE. BUT, YOU KNOW, I WOULD SAY FOR THE TRANSIT DEPENDENT



JUNE 24, 2024

1 FOLKS IT'S NOT THAT GOOD NOW PEOPLE STANDING AROUND WAITING  
2 FOR SOMETHING TO HAPPEN ISN'T THE BEST. LET'S MAKE IT BETTER.  
3 IF I NEED TRANSIT TO GET AROUND LET'S MAKE MY DAILY EXPERIENCE  
4 MORE RELIABLE, SAFER, BETTER, FRIENDLIER, ALL THOSE KINDS OF  
5 THINGS. LET'S COME UP WITH SOMETHING HERE THAT WE CAN REALLY  
6 SELL TO THE BAY AREA. AND IT SEEMED LIKE PEOPLE, AT LEAVE THE  
7 IN THIS GROUP, WANT TO SELL IT TO ALL NINE COUNTIES. I WAS ONE  
8 OF THOSE PEOPLE, I WILL DISCLOSE.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I WAS ONE OF THEM TOO. BUT SOLANO  
11 COUNTY'S NEEDS ARE MUCH DIFFERENT THAN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO  
12 OR SANTA CLARA. AND SO THAT WAS IN MY OPENING COMMENTS, THAT  
13 DIVERSITY HAS TO BE IN THIS MEASURE. PEOPLE SAY NO HIGHWAY  
14 IMPROVEMENTS, BUT YOU KNOW, IN SOLANO COUNTY, WE'RE DEALING  
15 WITH INTERCHANGES THAT WERE BUILT IN THE '50'S. THEY'RE  
16 DANGEROUS, THEY DON'T WORK, AND THEY NEED TO BE IMPROVED.  
17 AND THOSE IMPROVEMENTS HELP TRANSIT. SO THAT'S WHY I KEEP  
18 SAYING, LET'S ALL KEEP AN OPEN MIND. IF WE'RE GOING TO AGREE  
19 TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT'S ONE, THEN ADDITIONAL  
20 REVENUES THAT'S AVAILABLE, HOW DO THEY GET SPENT, THE  
21 TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN AND HOW THAT MEETS THE NEEDS OF  
22 THE BAY AREA COUNTIES. SO I THINK THAT'S WHAT'S IMPORTANT.  
23 STUART BACK TO YOU.

24



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **STUART COHEN:** IN THE PACKET THERE IS A ONE PAGE TIMELINE, AND  
2 THIS IS OUR, AT LEAVE THE DRAFT PATH FORWARD. WE HAVE GOT TO  
3 GET TO WORK QUICKLY BUT ALSO ENSURE WE'RE LISTENING TO  
4 EVERYONE IN THE REGION AS WE DO THIS WORK. AND SO TO THAT END,  
5 LET ME TELL YOU A FEW THINGS THAT WILL BE HAPPENING AND WALK  
6 YOU THROUGH THE TIMELINE. FIRST WE'LL SET UP A SPACE ON THE  
7 MTC WEB SITE FOR COMMENTS AND QUERIES FROM THE PUBLIC FROM  
8 PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT ON THIS COMMITTEE SO EVERYBODY CAN ENGAGE  
9 IN A REALTIME, NOT JUST MONTHLY MEETINGS. AS THE EXECUTIVE  
10 DIRECTOR MENTIONED HE'LL BE CONVENING EXECUTIVE  
11 REPRESENTATIVES OF THE TRANSIT AND COUNTY TRANSPORTATION  
12 AGENCIES AND THE EXECUTIVE GROUP MEETINGS ARE OPEN TO THE  
13 PUBLIC THE FIRST MEETING IS SCHEDULED FOR 2:30 TODAY, OR  
14 DIRECTLY AFTER THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD NOW THIS EXECUTIVE  
15 GROUP INDIVIDUAL AN ADVISORY ROLE PROVIDING A CRITICAL  
16 INPUT. ALICIA BROUGHT THIS UP. HOW WE'RE GOING TO LISTEN TO  
17 THEM THAT'S GOING BE MONTHLY IN CLOSE TIMING TO THESE  
18 MEETINGS OF COURSE THEY'LL HAVE ACCESS INFORMATION  
19 CONSTANTLY. THAT'S IMPORTANT TO INPUT IN THIS PROCESS. WE'LL  
20 BE TRACKING PUBLIC INPUT HAPPENING RELATED TO THE PLANS,  
21 PLANNED BAY AREA WITHIN UPDATED RIGHT NOW IS IMPORTANT  
22 INFORMATION AND GETTING INPUT ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL  
23 AND A HOST OF OTHER TASK FORCE SO WE'LL DOING THIS IN A  
24 VACUUM. THAT CONTEXT IS CRITICAL. WE'LL STAY IN TOUCH WITH  
25 STATE LEGISLATORS. WE'RE SO APPRECIATIVE HAVING THEIR STAFF



JUNE 24, 2024

1 HERE TODAY. WITH THAT, LET ME REVIEW TIMELINE OF THE NEXT FOUR  
2 MEETINGS IN OUR PACKET. AT OUR NEXT MEETING, WE'LL REVIEW THE  
3 MATH IN THE MEASURE POTENTIAL REVENUE SOURCES TO MORE FUNDING  
4 NEEDED OUTSIDE TRANSIT SHORTFALLS MENTIONED TODAY. WE'RE  
5 GOING TO GROUND OURSELVES IN POLLS. I SPENT A LOT OF TIME  
6 TALKING ABOUT POLLS WITH MANY OF YOU AND WE CAN'T IGNORE THOSE  
7 AS WE MOVE FORWARD. MEETING NUMBER THREE IN AUGUST, JUST  
8 BECAUSE WE NEED TO FOR THE -- IT'S A FIVE MEETING PROCESS,  
9 WE'LL BE PUTTING FORWARD A PROPOSED FRAMEWORK FOR MULTIPLE  
10 OPTIONS FOR THE COMMITTEE TO DISCUSS AND REFINE. THE  
11 FRAMEWORKS WILL COVER THINGS LIKE THE GEOGRAPHIC SCOPE, THE  
12 REVENUE SOURCES, OPTIONS, ESTIMATED AMOUNTS THAT WILL COME  
13 FROM THOSE, ELIGIBLE EXPENDITURES, POLICY PROVISIONS. BE  
14 READY FOR A LOT OF INFORMATION, POTENTIALLY A LOT OF  
15 PERMUTATIONS. AT MEETING NUMBER FOUR IN SEPTEMBER WE'LL  
16 CONFRONT TRADEOFFS. WE MIGHT HAVE ONE FRAMEWORK THAT'S REALLY  
17 EMERGED THAT PEOPLE ARE RALLYING AROUND. IF THAT'S THE CASE AT  
18 THAT MEETING, WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO DISCUSS THE FRAMEWORK,  
19 REFINE POLICY PROVISIONS. ONE THING MENTIONED TODAY BY  
20 COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS, THERE COULD BE A TEMPORAL  
21 COMPONENT WHERE WE ADDRESS THE DIFFERENT NEEDS OVER THE LIFE  
22 OF THE MEASURE ESPECIALLY THE KIND OF MID-TERM NEEDS. THAT'S  
23 COMPLEX MULTIPLE FRAMEWORKS, MULTIPLE TIME FRAMES FOR EACH,  
24 BUT THE LEVEL OF NUANCE THAT WE'LL HAVE TO ADDRESS TO FIND  
25 COMMONALITIES HERE, THERE IS A LOT OF WORK TO PUT THOSE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 COMMONALITIES TOGETHER. I BELIEVE THEY EXIST, AND WE'RE GOING  
2 TO DIVE DOES THAT NUANCE. THERE MIGHT BE MORE THAN ONE OPTION.  
3 WHAT HAPPENS AT THAT MEETING IS A BIT DIFFERENT WE'LL HAVE TO  
4 UNDERSTAND THE IMPACTS OF DIFFERENT MEASURES, WE'LL HAVE TO  
5 CONSIDER VARYING VIABILITY THAT WE WOULD PROJECT IN  
6 LEGISLATURE AND WITH THE VOTERS. AND AT THAT MEETING WE'LL  
7 CHOOSE A PREFERRED DRAFT TO MOVE FORWARD WITH TO REFINE FOR  
8 CONSIDERATION AT THE FINAL MEETING. SO THEN, FINALLY, IN  
9 OCTOBER, THE FINAL STEP WOULD BE, YOU KNOW, ENDORSING OR  
10 IMPROVING THE FRAMEWORK. AND AS CHAIR SPERING HAS BEEN VERY  
11 CLEAR ABOUT, WE'RE LOOKING FOR CONSENSUS SUPPORT THAT  
12 EVERYBODY CAN GET BEHIND. IT WON'T MEAN THAT SOME PEOPLE  
13 DON'T HAVE RESERVATIONS. I THINK A LOT OF YOU HAVE WORK ON  
14 CONSENSUS PROCESS. IT DOESN'T MEAN IT'S YOUR DREAM SCENARIO,  
15 IF YOU WERE ABLE TO JUST WRITE IT YOURSELVES. BUT IT MEANS  
16 THAT EVERYBODY AROUND THAT THIS IS GOING TO MOVE THE REGION  
17 FORWARD ON ALL THE THINGS JUST TALK ABOUT AND ARE ABLE TO  
18 ENDORSE IT. SO, IF THERE ARE QUESTIONS OR SUGGESTIONS ABOUT  
19 THE TIMELINE, OTHER SUGGESTIONS ABOUT, YOU KNOW, HOW WE MIGHT  
20 IMPROVE THE PROCESS, GET PUBLIC INPUT, WE WOULD LOVE TO HEAR  
21 THOSE. AND YOU COULD -- CAN YOU SAY THOSE NOW, YOU CAN COME TO  
22 US AFTER THE MEETING, AND IF THERE WEREN'T ANY OTHER  
23 COMMENTS, THEN WE WOULD BE ABLE TO MOVE ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT.  
24



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THE ONE THING I WANT TO EMPHASIZE  
2 FOR THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS IS THAT IF YOU HAVE A SPECIFIC  
3 OPTION, YOU WANT CONSIDERED BETWEEN NOW AND OUR NEXT MEETING,  
4 YOU HAVE GOT TO GET IT TO STAFF. AND I KNOW WHEN WE TALKED TO  
5 MAYOR MAHAN AND SUPERVISOR CHAIR CHAVEZ, THEY HAD SOME  
6 CONCEPTS THAT NEED TO BE CONSIDERED, SO DID SOME OF THE OTHER  
7 MTC COMMISSIONERS. I WOULD UNDERAGE ALL THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS  
8 F YOU HAVE AN OPTION THAT SAYS THREE COUNTIES ONLY, ANALYZE  
9 THAT. HAVE ONE THAT SAYS FIVE COUNTIES, ALL COUNTIES; GIVE US  
10 WHAT SCENARIO YOU WOULD LIKE, WHAT OPTION YOU WOULD LIKE  
11 ANALYZED. THAT'S GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT BECAUSE THEN WE  
12 CAN SEE WHAT SOME OF THE SHORTFALLS OF SOME OF THESE PROPOSALS  
13 HAPPENS TO BE. BEFORE WE GO TO PUBLIC COMMENTS -- AND THIS  
14 JUST KIND OF A CONSENSUS, DOES ANYBODY OBJECT, OR FEEL  
15 STRONGLY THAT ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF ISN'T OUR FIRST  
16 PRIORITY. I'M NOT LOOKING FOR AN ENDORSEMENT WHAT THE FUNDING  
17 MECHANISM IS, OR HOW THE MONEY MIGHT BE DISTRIBUTED, BUT ARE  
18 WE ALL IN AGREEMENT THAT ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF IS  
19 IMPORTANT?

20

21 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I DON'T THINK I AGREE WITH IT.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY.

24





JUNE 24, 2024

1 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I THINK IT ADDRESS -- I PERSONALLY BELIEVE  
2 THAT WE NEED TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF, BUT I THINK IF WE  
3 WANT TO SUCCEED, WE NEED TO COME UP WITH A SYSTEMS APPROACH  
4 THAT THE PUBLIC CAN AGREE TO. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, WE ARE --  
5 YOU KNOW, WE ARE -- THIS GROUP IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE  
6 PUBLIC. THIS IS A SPECIAL INTEREST GROUP OF PEOPLE WHO REALLY  
7 LIKE TRANSIT AND ARE THINKING ABOUT THIS ALL THE TIME, AND  
8 THE PEOPLE OUT THERE, THEY'RE NOT THINKING ABOUT, THIS THEY'RE  
9 GOING TO THE SUPERMARKET AND DOUBLE PAYING WHAT THEY PAID A  
10 COUPLE OF YEARS AGO. THEY'RE HAVING A DIFFERENT EXPERIENCE.  
11 AND I THINK WE NEED TO APPROACH THIS IN A WAY THAT THEY CAN --  
12 THAT THEY CAN APPRECIATE THIS, IN THEIR OWN TERMS IN THEIR OWN  
13 LIFE, WHAT THEY GET. THAT'S MY VIEW OF IT. I KNOW THERE ARE  
14 PROBABLY THOSE THAT DON'T AGREE WITH IT.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I AGREE WITH WHAT YOU'RE SAYING, JIM. BUT  
17 THE SEQUENCE, FOR US TO BE TALKING ABOUT ALL THESE OTHER  
18 THINGS, TO ADDRESS THAT, THE MONEY PROVIDED BY THE FISCAL  
19 CLIFF, OF ITS GOING TO BE CONDITIONED AND IT HAS TO BE. IF  
20 ALL OF US ARE EXPECTING TRANSFORMATIONAL CHANGE IT'S GOT TO  
21 BE CONTINUED OR WE GET NOTHING. WE'RE RIGHT WHERE WE ARE. BUT  
22 IF WE DON'T AGREE THAT WE HAVE TO DEAL WITH THE FISCAL CLIFF,  
23 WE NEED TO KNOW THAT UP FRONT. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S GOING TO  
24 BE A BIG PIECE OF HOW WE MOVE FORWARD.

25



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. THE QUESTION, I WANT TO  
2 MAKE SURE WE UNDERSTAND CORRECTLY, IT'S ADDRESSING LITTLE  
3 THE FISCAL CLIFF IN CONJUNCTION WITH WHAT WE HEARD TODAY THIS  
4 IS STEP ONE.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THAT'S CORRECT WITHOUT A FUNDING SOURCE TO  
7 DEAL WITH THIS PROBLEM WE CAN SIT HERE AND TALK ABOUT THESE  
8 THINGS ALL DAY LONG AND NOTHING IS GOING TO HAPPEN BECAUSE  
9 THERE IS NO WAY TO EFFECT THAT CHANGE. THE FISCAL CLIFF IS ON  
10 THE HORIZON WE CAN'T DENY THAT. AND I DON'T THINK WE HAVE THE  
11 LUXURY OF SAYING WE'RE NOT GOING TO ADDRESS IT OR NOT AT LEAVE  
12 THE TRY TO FIND IT. THE CONSEQUENCES OF US NOT FINDING A  
13 FUNDING SOURCE OR AT LEAVE THE ADDRESSING THE ISSUE IS GOING  
14 TO AFFECT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, WE'RE ALREADY FACING ISSUES  
15 WITH LOOKING AT CHANGES WITH LOWER RIDERSHIP, REVENUES, MEAN  
16 THIS AFFECTS A LOT OF THINGS THE CORE OF THE PROBLEM IS  
17 TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE TO BE FISCALLY HEALTHY IN ORDER TO  
18 IMPLEMENT THE THINGS THAT WE'RE ASKING FOR. JIM, THERE IS  
19 PLENTY OF TIME TO SAY NO IF WE SAY FISCAL CLIFF IS IMPORTANT  
20 WE'RE ADDRESSING CONDITIONS. I THINK IT'S MEANINGFUL  
21 DISCUSSION WITHOUT BEING AN AGREEMENT THAT WE HAVE TO ADDRESS  
22 THE FISCAL CLIFF. [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE]

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I THINK THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS  
25 THE VERY ISSUES YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. THE REASON WHY I ASK IF



JUNE 24, 2024

1 THERE IS CONSENSUS THAT WE'RE ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT  
2 LEADS INTO ALL THE OTHER THINGS YOU'RE TRYING TO DO AND IT'S  
3 IMPORTANT IN THE DECISION THAT NEEDS TO BE MADE EARLY IN THIS  
4 PROCESS.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** MR. CHAIR?

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GO AHEAD MANNY.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** APPRECIATE THE TIME. WE ALIGN -- THE ALLIANCE ALIGNS  
11 WITH WHAT MR. WUNDERMAN AT BAY AREA COUNCIL IN ACCORDANCE WITH  
12 WHAT HE SAID. AND AGAIN I DON'T WANT TO OPEN UP A LONG DEBATE  
13 AND MAYBE THERE IS COMMITMENT TO TALK ABOUT THIS LATER. BUT  
14 THE QUESTION I HAD BEFORE WE COMMIT TO ADDRESSING THE FISCAL  
15 CLIFF IS WHAT DOES ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF MEAN. SO WE  
16 HAVE BEEN VERY CLEAR OVER THE LAST SEVERAL MONTHS THAT TRANSIT  
17 IS IMPORTANT. WE'RE NOT SAYING THAT TRANSIT IS NOT IMPORTANT.  
18 WE'RE NOT SAYING THAT TRANSIT NEEDS ASSISTANCE OR HELP BUT ONE  
19 OF THE THINGS THAT HAS COME UP OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS AS  
20 THIS PROCESS HAS BEEN MOVING ALONG IS A COMPLETE COVERAGE OF  
21 WHAT'S NEEDED? OR IS IT ASSISTANCE PLUS REFORMS, PLUS CHANGES,  
22 PLUS TRANSFORMATION? ET CETERA, ET CETERA. SO, I COULDN'T  
23 ANSWER THAT QUESTION FROM THE ALLIANCE'S PERSPECTIVE UNTIL WE  
24 KNOW EXACTLY WHAT ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF MEANS.

25



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THAT WAS KIND OF MY OPENING COMMENTS. WE  
2 NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE EXPECTATION IS. IT MAY NOT BE THE  
3 NUMBER THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE GIVING US IT MAY BE A  
4 COMBINATION OR REFORMS OR MAKE CHANGES. IT'S DIFFICULT TO HAVE  
5 THAT CONVERSATION IF THERE IS NOT FUNDING SOURCE OR  
6 MECHANISM TO IMPLEMENT THE THINGS WE'RE ASKING FOR. DON'T  
7 MISUNDERSTAND WHAT I'M SAYING. YOU'RE NOT ENDORSING ANY  
8 FUNDING MECHANISM BUT IT'S THIS FRAMEWORK THAT WE'RE GOING TO  
9 TRY TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT'S WHAT I'M SAYING. NO ONE  
10 IS GETTING LOCKED IN. NONE OF THE SUGGESTIONS I'M HEARING  
11 AROUND THIS TABLE, I AGREE WITH A LOT OF THOSE COMMENTS THOSE  
12 CHANGES HAVE TO TAKE PLACE. BUT OTHER COMMENTS? YES? SUE? OR  
13 DAVID, AND THEN SUE.

14

15 **DAVID CANEPA:** I THINK THERE HAVE BEEN A LOT OF GOOD POINTS  
16 BROUGHT UP. I THINK WHEN I LOOK, AND I REMEMBER THE POLL  
17 VIVIDLY. I THINK IT WAS 90% OF PEOPLE -- AND I MIGHT BE WRONG  
18 ON THIS -- THEY TAKE THEIR CARS, THEY DON'T USE PUBLIC  
19 TRANSPORTATION. IF WE WANT A SUCCESSFUL BALLOT MEASURE, WE  
20 REALLY NEED TO FIND BALANCE. MY QUESTION MOVING FORWARD IS, AS  
21 A COUNTY, THERE WERE SOME COUNTIES THAT WERE NOT SUPPORTIVE  
22 OF THIS. SO, WHAT ARE WE DOING AROUND A RETURN TO SOURCE? HOW  
23 ARE WE ADDRESSING THOSE ISSUES? HOW ARE WE ADDRESSING THE  
24 ISSUE OF CALTRAIN CONSOLIDATION AND COORDINATION? IF WE'RE  
25 REALLY GOING TO FIND A PATH MOVING FORWARD, THERE IS REALLY



JUNE 24, 2024

1 GOING TO HAVE TO BE GREAT COMPROMISE. WHAT I'M CONCERNED  
2 ABOUT, MR. CHAIR IS, YOU KNOW, WE'RE DOING ALL OF THIS, THIS  
3 WORK, AND WE'RE -- WE MAY LAND AT THE SAME PLACE. AND I DON'T  
4 WANT TO LAND AT THE SAME PLACE. I WANT TO ADDRESS  
5 COMMISSIONERS CONCERNS FROM THE VARIOUS REGIONS. I WANT TO  
6 MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE ALL BAY AREA COUNTIES INVOLVED. AND,  
7 SO, I THINK FOR ME AND FROM OTHERS -- OTHER CONVERSATIONS WITH  
8 OTHER COMMISSIONERS, WHILE WE RECOGNIZE THAT SOME OF OUR  
9 TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE HAVING CHALLENGES AND WE WANT TO FIX  
10 THOSE. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THE RETURN TO SOURCE IS  
11 EMPHASIZED. AND WE'RE REALLY GOING TO HAVE TO BRING SENATORS  
12 WHO ARE NOT SUPPORTIVE ALONG. I THINK A BALANCED APPROACH,  
13 CAPITAL AND INFRASTRUCTURE HAS TO BE A PART OF THIS IF WE'RE  
14 GOING TO MAKE THIS BILL SUCCESSFUL. I'M COMMITTED ON THE  
15 INFRASTRUCTURE PIECE. I'M ALSO COMMITTED TO THE FISCAL CLIFF  
16 PIECE BUT I THINK WE NEED TO GET AHEAD OF THESE ISSUES THAT  
17 STOP THE BILL FROM MOVING FORWARD, INITIALLY. IF WE DON'T  
18 ADDRESS THAT RIGHT AWAY, I DO BELIEVE THAT WE'RE ON THIS IT --  
19 THIS PATH OF HOPEFULLY IT'S NOT DOING THE SAME THING, BUT I  
20 REALLY DO THINK THAT WE REALLY THINK ABOUT ADDRESSING WHY THE  
21 BILL WAS PAUSED. AND, REALLY, GET OUT AHEAD OF IT. AND I DO  
22 THINK WE CAN FIND A SOLUTION. BUT IF WE DON'T ADDRESS THE  
23 ISSUES ON CAPITAL AND INFRASTRUCTURE, AS WELL AS THE FISCAL  
24 CLIFF, I FIND THAT TO BE, SORT OF -- IT'S SAID INSANITY IS  
25 DOING THE SAME THING OVER AND OVER. I DON'T I DON'T THINK



JUNE 24, 2024

1 WE'RE MOVING IN THAT DIRECTION BUT I THINK WE NEED TO ADDRESS  
2 PEOPLE'S CONCERN TO MOVE FORWARD.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SUE?

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** PRIORITY NEEDS TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF DOESN'T  
7 NECESSARILY MEAN THE ENTIRE DOLLAR AMOUNT FOCUS ON FISCAL  
8 CLIFF IS THE BROADER QUESTION BUT WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT  
9 THE VOTER'S PERSPECTIVE IS ON ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF  
10 BECAUSE I THINK IN ORDER TO GET SOMETHING DONE HERE AND GET  
11 THE VOTERS TO PASS WE REALLY NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE  
12 VOTER'S PERSPECTIVE IS TO ADDRESSING THE FISCAL CLIFF. YOU  
13 KNOW? I WAS TALKING TO SOME NEIGHBORS THE OTHER DAY AND SAID  
14 SOMETHING, AND THEIR TWO QUICK THINGS TO POINT OUT WERE THE  
15 HIGH SPEED TRAIN GOING DOWN THE CENTRAL VALLEY WHICH IS  
16 IRRELEVANT TO US, BUT THEY SEE THESE MASSIVE PROJECTS IN THE  
17 BILLIONS THAT THEY WEREN'T SUPPORTIVE OF GOING TO  
18 TRANSPORTATION. SO THEY TIE THEM ALL TOGETHER. THEY DON'T  
19 SEPARATE THESE THINGS OUT AND SAY THIS IS MTC'S WORLD AND THIS  
20 IS THE REST OF THE WORLD. WE REALLY HAVE TO UNDERSTAND WHAT  
21 THE REST OF THE WORLD'S INTEREST IS AS WE TALKS ABOUT THE  
22 FISCAL CLIFF. THAT'S IMPORTANT, AS WE MOVE FORWARD ON THIS  
23 BUT I WHOLEHEARTEDLY AGREE THAT HAS GOT TO BE OUR PRIORITY.

24



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** IS STAFF GOING TO BRING FORWARD SOME OF  
2 THE POLLING THAT'S BEEN DONE IN THE PAST? AND WHERE THE VOTERS  
3 ARE THESE ISSUES?

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** CERTAINLY. WE COULD PROVIDE INFORMATION AFTER  
6 THIS MEETING TO ALL OF THE MEMBERS OF THE POLLING THAT WAS  
7 DONE IN FALL OF 2023. I THINK IT WOULD BE INSTRUCTIVE BASED ON  
8 THIS CONVERSATION.

9

10 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND, YOU KNOW, IT -- WE'RE STUCK ON THIS  
11 FISCAL CLIFF, BUT WHAT THE REAL ISSUE IS, IS A FUNDING SOURCE  
12 TO EFFECT CHANGE. THAT REALLY IS WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT.

13

14 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE  
15 PUBLIC THINKS ABOUT FISCAL CLIFFS. BECAUSE I HAVE A FEELING  
16 PUBLIC DOESN'T GIVE A HANK ABOUT FISCAL GLITCHES. I THINK  
17 THEY WANT SERVICE, RELIABILITY, I THINK THEY WANT THINGS --  
18 I'M WORRIED ABOUT THE NOMENCLATURE. THE BART REPORT THAT BOB  
19 SENT US SAYS THAT BART HAS BEEN RELYING IN HIS HISTORY ON  
20 FARES FOR 2/3 OR MORE OF ITS OPERATING -- TO ME, IT'S  
21 OPERATIONS, AND IT DOESN'T HAVE -- THOSE FUNDS AREN'T  
22 AVAILABLE ANYMORE. AND THAT THAT NUMBER IS BASICALLY  
23 INCONSISTENT WITH TRANSIT NORMS. SO WHAT HE'S SUGGESTING IS  
24 WHY DON'T WE GET NORMAL AND START EXPECTING SUPPORT FOR  
25 PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR OPERATIONS THAT IS MORE IN LINE WITH WHAT



JUNE 24, 2024

1 OTHER AGENCIES ARE EXPECT IN OTHER PLACES. THAT DOESN'T SEEM  
2 REAL WEIRD TO ME. WE HAVE DONE A LOT OF MEASURES WE HAVE BEEN  
3 SUCCESSFUL WITH A LOT OF THESE MEASURES, WE HAVE HIT 2/3 MOST  
4 OF IT WAS FOR PROJECTS AND CAPITAL, BUT ALSO INCLUDED OTHER  
5 ASPECTS WE HAVE BEEN LIGHT ON SUPPORTING OPERATIONS WE HAVE  
6 GOTTEN IN THERE A LITTLE BIT ON REGIONAL MEASURE THREE, WE HAD  
7 SOME MONEY FOR OPERATIONS, DIDN'T GET 2/3 BUT DIDN'T NEED IT,  
8 SO SAID THE CALIFORNIA SUPREME COURT. SO TO THEIR CREDIT. I  
9 THINK WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO SAY, YOU KNOW, RATHER -- AND MAYBE  
10 TEST THIS OUT, IS THE PUBLIC INTERESTED IN SOLVING A FISCAL  
11 CLIFF? OR DO THEY THINK WE NEED MUFF TO IMPROVE OUR  
12 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT THE INCLUDES OPERATING REVENUES?  
13 WHICH TO ME SOUNDS LIKE SOMETHING THEY MIGHT WANT TO GET  
14 INVOLVED WITH, RIGHT? SO THAT WOULD BE A BIG PROBLEM SOLVER  
15 FOR US, RIGHT? AND I THINK IT WOULD BE THE RIGHT DIRECTION FOR  
16 US TO GO IF WE CAN GET THERE. THEN, WE'RE NOT LOOKING AT THE  
17 FUTURE OF COMING BACK IN A FEW YEARS AND HAVING TO DO THIS  
18 AGAIN, AND SO FORTH. SO, I -- I WOULD LOVE -- I AM INTERESTED  
19 TO SEE THE WORK THAT WAS DONE IN THE FALL OF '23, ON THE  
20 POLLING. BUT I'M GUESSING YOU DIDN'T -- YOU KNOW, MEASURE  
21 FISCAL CLIFF SOLVING VERSUS SUPPORT FOR OPERATIONS WITH  
22 OTHER, YOU KNOW, TRANSPORTATION BENEFITS. SO, I WOULD STRONGLY  
23 URGE US, IS THERE A WAY? I DON'T KNOW IF IT CAN BE DONE WITH  
24 PUBLIC FUNDS? OR BEING WE DO ANOTHER -- YOU KNOW, GIVEN WHERE  
25 WE ARE, LIKE, RIGHT NOW, AFTER POST 1031, COULD WE DO A POLL





JUNE 24, 2024

1 AND FIND OUT WHERE THE PUBLIC STANDS ON THIS STUFF? I WOULD BE  
2 REALLY INTERESTED IN NOT GUESSING WHAT -- WHERE THE PUBLIC'S  
3 HEAD IS AT. AND IT BEING HELP FRAME IT.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND STAFF CAN ANSWER WE DON'T HAVE THE  
6 LUCK OF DOING NOTHING. YOU MAY GET A POLL THAT SAYS THEY WANT  
7 X, Y, OR Z, OR THEY DON'T SUPPORT THE FISCAL CLIFF, I JUST  
8 DON'T UNDERSTAND HOW WE WALK AWAY AND SAY WE'RE NOT CONCERNED  
9 ABOUT THIS ISSUE. IN SOME CAPACITY IT THESE TO BE ADDRESSED.  
10 MAYBE THE DECISION MAYBE DON'T ADDRESS IT. WHICH I WOULD BE  
11 VERY SURPRISED. BUT IF WE DON'T IDENTIFY THE GOAL OF DEALING  
12 WITH THE FINANCIAL SHORTFALL THESE TRANSIT OPERATORS FACE, I  
13 MEAN, A LOT OF THINGS ARE GOING TO CHANGE. IT IMPACTS OUR  
14 ECONOMY, IT IMPACTS A LOT OF PEOPLE. AND YOU KNOW, IT'S -- AND  
15 I HAVE SAID THIS MANY TIMES, ALL OF US IN THIS ROOM, THE HIGH  
16 PRICE OF GAS, FOOD, INSURANCE, ALL THESE THINGS, ALL OF US,  
17 IT'S AN ANNOYANCE. A LOT OF THESE PEOPLE, THESE ARE LIFE  
18 CHANGING DECISIONS THEY'RE HAVING TO MAKE. AND I THINK WE  
19 HAVE OBLIGATION OF A SYSTEM THAT HELPS MEET THAT NEED. JIM, I  
20 DON'T SEE ANYTHING WE'RE DOING THAT DOESN'T ADDRESS THE ISSUE  
21 YOU'RE RAISING AND I THINK IT HAS TO BE PART OF THE  
22 DISCUSSION. [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE]

23



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY AND THAT'S WHY I SAID MAYBE WE  
2 SHOULD BE TALKING ABOUT A FUNDING SOURCE TO EFFECT CHANGE  
3 THAT'S WHAT WE SHOULD BE TALKING ABOUT.

4

5 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CHAIR SPERING, I AGREE WITH WHAT JIM IS  
6 SAYING. BUT I DON'T THINK IT'S THE FISCAL CLIFF. I THINK IT'S  
7 THE OUTCOME WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE. OUTCOME IS THE SYSTEM  
8 THAT WORK TODAY AND INTO THE FUTURE THAT'S INNOVATIVE AND MORE  
9 EFFICIENT. WE HAVE ASKED RIDERS MANY POLLS SHOW OUTCOMES WHAT  
10 THEY WANT, THE QUESTION I LOOK AT IS HAVING FUNDING TO  
11 EFFECTUATE THAT CHANGE. THE CHALLENGE IS GETTING THERE. WHAT  
12 I SEE IN THE OUTLINE YOU HAVE LAID OUT CHAIR IS A PROCESS  
13 WHERE WE'RE GOING TO ASK QUESTIONS TO WHAT MANNY SHARED, IT'S  
14 THE FISCAL CLIFF, HOW, WHAT, AND WHEN. AND I THINK OUTLINE  
15 DOES THAT FOR US. TODAY I SEE IT AS A TEMPERATURE GAUGE, I'M  
16 TWO THUMBS UP BUT NOW WE NEED TO HAVE THE CONVERSATION IN THE  
17 DETAILS OF WHAT IT LOOKS LIKE.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ALICIA?

20

21 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** I APPRECIATE THE QUESTION, AND  
22 PERSPECTIVE THAT YOU HAVE BEEN PROVIDING. FROM MY POINT OF  
23 VIEW IF WE ARE GOING TO SIT HERE AND SAY WE'RE NOT GOING TO  
24 ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF THEN I THINK WE'RE ALSO SAYING WE'RE  
25 NEITHER COMFORTABLE WITH SIGNIFICANT SERVICE CUTS AND WHAT



JUNE 24, 2024

1 THAT MEANS BOTH TO ECONOMIC ACTIVITY SOCIAL EQUITY  
2 ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABLE, OR ARE WE COMFORTABLE WITH THE  
3 RELEVANT OPERATORS TO GO IT ALONE AND TO TRY TO RUN THEIR OWN  
4 SOLUTIONS. WHICH MAY OR MAY NOT BE SOMETHING THAT THIS BODY  
5 ACTUALLY WANTS TO SUPPORT. TO ME GIVEN THE COMPLEXITY OF THE  
6 ISSUE, THE NUMBER OF DIFFERENT INTERESTS THAT SIT AROUND THIS  
7 TABLE, THE NUMBER OF COMPLETELY LEGITIMATE CONCERNS THAT SIT  
8 AROUND THIS TABLE WHAT MAKES SENSE TO ME IS TO START WITH THE  
9 QUESTION OF WHAT IS THE SIZE OF THE PROBLEM THAT WE'RE LOOKING  
10 TO SOLVE BASED ON ALL OF THE THINGS THAT PEOPLE HAVE RAISED  
11 TODAY. AND THEN A SECONDARY QUESTION WHICH IS, WHAT DO WE WANT  
12 A REGIONAL MEASURE TO DO ABOUT THAT. BECAUSE A REGIONAL  
13 MEASURE MAY NOT BE SOMETHING THAT WEEP WANT TO CONSTRUCT IN  
14 SUCH A WAY TO SOLVE EVERY SINGLE THING THAT EVERY COUNTY OR  
15 CITY OR AGENCY HAS ON THE TABLE. BUT TO KIND OF TAKE THEM  
16 STEP-BY-STEP, TO ME, WOULD MAKE SENSE, AND WOULD ALLOW US TO  
17 HAVE KIND OF A RATIONAL CONVERSATION MOVING FORWARD. BECAUSE  
18 THERE IS SO MUCH SPECULATION INVOLVED IN THIS PROCESS. AND WE  
19 HAVE SIGNIFICANT RISK OF REALLY GETTING AHEAD OF OURSELVES. I  
20 ALSO TRUST THE CAPACITY OF THE LEADERS IN THIS ROOM AND THE  
21 LEADERS WHO AREN'T IN THIS ROOM TO REALLY ACT AS STEWARDS FOR  
22 THE REGION, TO ACT AS STEWARDS FOR THEIR CONSTITUENTS, TO HELP  
23 PEOPLE UNDERSTAND WHAT IT IS THAT AN INVESTMENT OF THIS  
24 NATURE ACCOMPLISHES. WE CAN USE THE LANGUAGES THAT MAKES THE  
25 MOST SENSE TO PEOPLE AS LONG AS IT IS TRUE. I DON'T THINK WE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 NEED TO GET TOO HUNG UP ON TERMINOLOGY OUT OF THE GATE. BUT  
2 WOULD REALLY RECOMMEND THAT WE KIND OF TAKE THIS AS A -- YOU  
3 KNOW, A STIPULATE BY STEP PROCESS, AND LET OURSELVES MAKE THE  
4 DECISIONS THAT ARE AVAILABLE TO US AT THE RIGHT TIMES.  
5 THANKS.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. VERY WELL PUT. JOHN?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I WOULD SAY WE SHOULD DO AN  
10 ANALYSIS ON 9, 5 IN THREE COUNTIES. LET'S BE READY. IF THINGS  
11 AIN'T LOOKING GOOD FOR NINE, LET'S GO TO FIVE. IF NOT GOOD, GO  
12 TO THREE. LET'S NOT WAIT AND THEN TRY TO FIGURE OUT WHAT IT  
13 LOOKS LIKE. LET'S PRESENT ALL THE INFORMATION AND GO FROM  
14 THERE.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YOU HEARD ONE OF YOUR FIRST OPTIONS.  
17 [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU, JOHN. APPRECIATE THAT. ANY COMMENTS?

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** JUST BRIEFLY. I DON'T THINK THAT THIS BODY WILL  
20 BE IN THE BUSINESS OF WORDSMITHS. BUT I DO THINK THAT THE  
21 IMPORTANCE AND THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN JUST PLUGGING A HOLE  
22 AND THEN PUTTING IN OPERATING FUNDING WHICH SEEMS LIKE POURING  
23 SOMETHING INTO A HOLE, VERSUS SOMETHING THAT THE MTC'S  
24 PLANNED BAY AREA IS LOOKING AT IS SAYING, WHAT SHARE OF  
25 HOUSEHOLDS ARE GOING TO BE WITHIN A HALF A MILE OF FAST AND



JUNE 24, 2024

1 FREQUENT TRANSIT. IN OTHER WORDS, WHAT'S THE BENEFIT THAT'S  
2 ACKNOWLEDGE TO MEAN PEOPLE IN THE REGION, SO THERE IS A WAY TO  
3 FRAME THINGS. AND WHAT MTC'S NUMBERS HAVE THAT I HAVE SEEN IS  
4 ONE OVERALL NUMBER. BUT IF WE CAN ALSO BE COMMUNICATING TO  
5 PEOPLE, YOU KNOW, HOW MUCH IS YOUR COMMUNITY'S ACCESS TO FAST  
6 AND FREQUENT, AND CONVENIENT, WELL CONNECTED AFFORDABLE  
7 TRANSIT. IT'S STILL FRAMING IN OPERATING FUNDING BUT IT'S  
8 FRAMING IT IN TERMS OF WHAT'S THE BENEFIT OF IT COMING TO YOUR  
9 COMMUNITIES.

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I DON'T SEE ANY PEOPLE ONLINE. DOES  
12 ANYBODY HAVE THEIR HAND UP THAT STAFF CAN SEE?

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE DO HAVE A WRITTEN SUBMITTED  
15 COMMENT, PUBLIC COMMENT, AS WELL AS FOUR IN THE BOARDROOM. AND  
16 THREE ON ZOOM.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YEAH, WHAT I WAS REFERRING TO IS  
19 COMMITTEE MEMBERS. I DON'T SEE ANY OF THEM, IF ANY OF THEM  
20 HAVE THEIR HAND. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE I'M NOT --

21

22 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** NO. YOU DIDN'T MISS ANYONE. NO  
23 COMMISSIONERS.

24



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** BEFORE I GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT, I WANT TO  
2 SAY, I WOULD NOT SUPPORT ANY FUNDING SOURCE THAT ISN'T  
3 CONDITIONED ON THE CHANGES THAT JIM YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT, ON  
4 TRANSIT. AND LAST THING I'LL SAY, THEN I'LL GO TO THE PUBLIC,  
5 NOT LONG AGO A LOT OF THE ADVOCATES SAID GET GAS UP TO \$5 A  
6 GALLON AND EVERYBODY WILL RIDE TRANSIT. GUESS WHAT? IT'S GONE  
7 TO ALMOST \$6 A GALLON AND RIDERSHIP HAS NOT INCREASED. THAT'S  
8 NOT GOING TO BE THE SOLUTION. SO IT HAS TO BE. I THINK A LOT  
9 OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, A  
10 LOT OF THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS DON'T TAKE A LOT OF MONEY, JUST  
11 COORDINATION BETWEEN THE OPERATORS. A LOT OF THINGS THEY CAN  
12 DO WITHOUT THE BIG THERE AMOUNT BUT WE HAVE TO REQUEST THAT  
13 AND REQUIRE IT. SO WITH THAT, LET'S GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** DID RECEIVE ONE PUBLIC COMMENT FROM  
16 DAN REDDING WITH OPERATING ENGINEERS LOCAL THREE, WHICH WE'LL  
17 PROVIDE TO YOU. WE HAVE FOUR IN THE BOARDROOM POOLE PROVIDING  
18 PUBLIC COMMENT AS WELL AS THREE IN THE ZOOM SPACE. HOW MUCH  
19 TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I'LL GIVE THEM TWO MINUTES.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** AND WARREN CUSHMAN, IF YOU WOULD  
24 LIKE TO APPROACH THE PODIUM?

25



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** I'M GOING TO PRESS THE BUTTON. ARE YOU READY?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. WARREN CUSHMAN WITH  
6 COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING IN HAYWARD. WE ARE  
7 AN INDEPENDENT LIVING CENTER BASED IN EAST BAY. I WANT TO  
8 START BY SAYING THAT I HAVE SPOKEN TO A NUMBER OF MY  
9 COLLEAGUES IN THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY WHO WERE DISAPPOINTED  
10 THAT NO ONE WITH A DISABILITY, AT LEAVE THE THAT WE KNOW OF,  
11 IS SERVING ON THIS COMMITTEE. I KNOW THERE WERE SOME FOLKS WHO  
12 WERE HOPING TO CARRY THAT VOICE FORWARD. SO, WE WILL HAVE TO -  
13 - WE'LL HAVE TO STEP BACK AND FIGURE OUT OUR WAYS TO CONNECT.  
14 I ALSO WANTED TO SAY THAT WITH REGARD TO PEOPLE WITH  
15 DISABILITY, ONE OF THE MAJOR NEEDS IS PARATRANSIT. AND THEN  
16 THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THERE ARE SOME  
17 IMPORTANT RECOMMENDATIONS AROUND PARATRANSIT. WHICH THE MTC  
18 COMMITTEES WILL BE HEARING SHORTLY. THAT NEED IS VERY  
19 IMPORTANT. AND IT'S TIED TO FIXED ROUTE. THE SO, ONE DOESN'T  
20 EXIST WITHOUT THE OTHER. AND I HOPE THAT THIS COMMITTEE WILL  
21 THINK OF PARATRANSIT, AS WELL AS OTHER DISABILITY RELATED  
22 NEEDS IN THE FUTURE. AND, FINALLY, I, FOR ONE, SEE THE  
23 OPPORTUNITY OF THIS COMMITTEE AS A FRESH START. I CERTAINLY  
24 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THERE WERE FOLKS THAT HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT  
25 RETURN TO SOURCE AND SOME OTHER PIECES THAT WERE NOT MET, IN



JUNE 24, 2024

1 THE LAST ITERATION OF THIS DISCUSSION, BUT I WOULD URGE AND  
2 HOPE THAT EVERY MEMBER OF THIS COMMITTEE WILL START FRESH AND  
3 THINK OF NEW WAYS TO PUT WON'T SELF-IN ANOTHER'S SHREWS. I  
4 THINK THAT'S REALLY PERSONALITY AND I HOPE THAT IS WHAT  
5 HAPPENS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** NEXT, WE'LL HAVE BOB ALAN  
10 FOLLOWED BY LAUREL PAGEANT.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. BOB ALAN URBAN  
13 HABITAT. THANKS FOR TAKING UP THIS REALLY PERSONALITY TASK. I  
14 WOULD, JUST A FEW SUGGESTIONS, NOT TRYING TO SOLVE EVERYTHING.  
15 I HEAR A LOT OF THE CONCERNS EVERYONE HAS. WHAT I ALSO  
16 ALREADY HAVE FROM A LOT OF YOU WITH THE BILL LAST TIME WAS TOO  
17 BIG, TOO COMPLEX, TOO MANY PIECES. I THINK TO GET TO THE KIND  
18 OF TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT CHAIR SPERING TALKED ABOUT TO  
19 GET TO THAT PLACE, WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO SOLVE THE FISCAL  
20 CLIFF. I AGREE MR. WUNDERMAN, I TEACH PUBLIC POLICY, I WISH  
21 EVERYONE TALKED ABOUT THE FISCAL CLIFF, PEOPLE TALK ABOUT NOT  
22 BEING ABLE TO GET TO THE GROCERY STORE, WE NEED A CAMPAIGN  
23 THAT'S POSITIVE AND PROACTIVE AND I APPRECIATE CHAIR SPERING  
24 THE FOCUS ON THE PROBLEM WE NEED TO SOLVE IN FRONT OF US. WE  
25 CAN'T GET TO OUTCOMES AND IT WON'T MATTER IF WE DON'T HAVE





JUNE 24, 2024

1 PERFORMING SYSTEM IF WE DON'T HAVE ADEQUATE SERVICE. ALSO WANT  
2 TO SAY, PART OF THIS HAS BEEN A LONG-TERM STRUCTURAL ISSUE.  
3 WE HAVE BEEN AT MTC TALKING ABOUT THIS WHETHER NATIONALLY OR  
4 STATE HIGHWAYS, IN CALIFORNIA REGION, IN TERMS OF BALANCE WITH  
5 TRANSPORTATION, TO MR. WUNDERMAN'S POINT THE REASON PEOPLE  
6 DON'T TAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT IS DOESN'T COME OFTEN ENOUGH AND  
7 THOSE ARE NOT POPULAR, HONESTLY WE DON'T LIKE WHAT PEOPLE SAY  
8 IN THE POLLING. YOU HAVE A TOUGH JOB OF LEADING. AND WE NEED A  
9 POLL, BUT WE CAN'T JUST POLL AND SAY WELL, THEY DON'T WANT TO  
10 DO X, THEY WANT TO DO Y. WE HAVE TO CAMPAIGN TO WIN TO GIVE  
11 PEOPLE SOMETHING TO VOTE FOR AND TO MR. WUNDERMAN'S COMMENTS  
12 ABOUT COST OF LIVING I HOPE THAT'S SOMETHING WE FACTOR IN WHEN  
13 WE THINK ABOUT WHO SHOULD PAY FOR THIS MEASURE. WE NEED A  
14 BALANCED APPROACH, FUNDING WITH SALES TAX, GIVEN THE CURRENT  
15 CLIMATE WE SHOULD BE THOUGHTFUL AND DELIBERATE HOW WE DO THAT  
16 AND WHO PAYS. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HELLO, LAUREN FROM PUBLIC ADVOCATES. THANKS FOR  
21 JUMPING INTO THIS SO QUICKLY. I WANTED TO MENTION ON THIS  
22 QUESTION OF FRAMING AROUND FISCAL CLIFF. IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
23 BRING UP SERVICE LEVELS. THERE HAVE BEEN LEVELS THAT WE NEED  
24 TO INVEST IN AND NOT JUST FOCUS THE EFFORT ON ADDRESSING THE  
25 LACK OF FARE REVENUE RETURN ON BART AND CALTRAIN. AND ON THAT



JUNE 24, 2024

1 NOTE, IT'S CLEAR THAT WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT A LARGER MEASURE  
2 MORE THAN A BILLION DOLLARS AND I'M NOT SURE THERE HAS BEEN  
3 POLLING ON A LARGER MEASURE. I THINK WE SHOULD FOCUS A  
4 COORDINATION AROUND POLLING IF WE DON'T HAVE POLLING ON  
5 OPTIONS THAT ARE GOING TO BE NEEDED. ON THE PROGRESS OF  
6 REVENUE SOURCES IT WOULD BE GREAT AT THE NEXT MEETING TO SEE  
7 MATH ON SQUARE FOOT ON PARCEL TAX LEVELS BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T  
8 SEEN THAT BROKEN OUT YET WE SEE HIGH-LEVEL NUMBER OF PARCEL  
9 TAX. AND THINKING ABOUT COST OF LIVING IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
10 CONNECT THAT TO WHY WE SEE THE COST OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS  
11 GOING UP. WHY, IF YOU TALK ABOUT COST EFFICIENCIES MUCH  
12 TRANSIT YOU HAVE TO REMEMBER THAT TRANSIT OPERATIONS IS ALSO  
13 COST OF LIVING INCREASES FOR WORKERS THEY ALSO LIVE IF OUR  
14 COMMUNITY AND HAVE TO PAY MORE AT THE GROCERY STORE. WE CAN'T  
15 IMAGINE THAT THE COST OF PROVIDING TRANSIT SERVICE IS GOING  
16 TO STAY FLAT. AND FINALLY FOR TRANSPARENCY SAKE IT WOULD BE  
17 USEFUL IF YOU DID MORE POLLING TO RELEASE QUESTIONS IN ADVANCE  
18 TO MAKE THEM MORE ACCESSIBLE. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** OUR LAST SPEAKER IN THE BOARDROOM  
23 WILL BE ALETA DUPREE AND THEN WE HAVE SOME ZOOM SPACE HANDS  
24 UP.

25



JUNE 24, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, AND GOOD MORNING, CHAIR JIM SPERING AND  
2 MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER FOR TEAM  
3 FOLDS. I'M PROBABLY ONE OF A FEW PEOPLE WHO SPEAK WHO IS NOT  
4 WORKING. I LOVE A GOOD PUBLIC MEETING. I CAN'T CALL MYSELF AN  
5 EXPERT, BUT I SHARE WITH YOU MY EXPERIENCES OF WHICH THIS  
6 MORNING I USED BART AND EMERY GO ROUND, WHICH IS IN MY  
7 TOOLBOX. BUT I ASK THAT WE NOT BE IN A VACUUM, BECAUSE  
8 LATELY I HAVE BEEN HIGHLY MINDFUL OF THE TENSION GOING ON IN  
9 NEW YORK OVER CONGESTION PRICING. THE FUTURE OF THE LEGENDARY  
10 AND HISTORIC NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY IS IN QUESTION. HOW CAN WE  
11 HAVE A SENSE OF URGENCY HERE IN OUR BELOVED BAY AREA? I DON'T  
12 HAVE LONG EXPERIENCE IN THE BAY AREA, BUT I LIVED THROUGH THE  
13 DAYS OF THE SUBWAY BEING COVERED WITH GRAFFITI, AND MANY OF  
14 THE STATIONS HAD BROKEN LIGHTS. AND IT WAS A VERY HIGH CRIME  
15 RATE. AND WHEN YOU DID HAVE AIR CONDITIONING ON SUBWAY CARS,  
16 IT OFTEN DIDN'T WORK, AND IT GOES ON AND ON. IT TOOK STRONG  
17 LEADERSHIP TO GET PAST THAT, AND BUT NOW THE FUTURE IS IN  
18 QUESTION ONCE AGAIN. HOW DO WE PREVENT SUCH AN ISSUE FROM  
19 HAPPENING HERE. YOU CAN CALL IT A FISCAL CLIFF, YOU CAN CALL  
20 IT AN OUTCOME, BUT ONE WAY OR ANOTHER, WE NEED TO HAVE THE  
21 MONEY. IT DOESN'T COST VERY MUCH FOR ME TO PAY FOR TRANSIT  
22 THROUGH SALES TAXES, BECAUSE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT FRACTIONS OF  
23 A CENT ON THE DOLLAR OF MY SPENDING. IT DOESN'T COST ME MUCH.  
24 I CHOOSE TO LIVE WITHOUT A CAR, AND TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT TO  
25 ME. THANK YOU.



JUNE 24, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** OUR FIRST SPEAKER IN THE ZOOM SPACE WILL BE WENDI  
3 KALLINS, FOLLOWED BY CHRISTINE FITZGERALD. YOU HAVE TWO  
4 MINUTES.

5

6 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING AND EVERYONE FOR COMING  
7 TOGETHER AND SEEING IF WE CAN SOLVE THIS PROBLEM. I'M ON  
8 CITIZEN'S ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR MTC AND ALSO ON THE CUSTOMER  
9 ADVISORY COMMITTEE. I THINK FILLING THE GAP FOR THE FISCAL  
10 CLIFF SHOULD ENCOMPASS MORE THAN JUST THE ASSIGNING FUNDING.  
11 THE KEY IS GETTING MORE RIDERSHIP IN ORDER TO RAISE REVENUE  
12 ESPECIALLY FOR AGENCIES THAT DEPEND ON FARE REVENUE I THINK  
13 SCHEDULING IS REALLY KEY SO THAT TRANSFER FROM REGIONAL TO  
14 LOCAL TRANSIT IS AN A SMOOTH TRANSITION. I LIKE WHAT ELLEN W  
15 FROM URBAN HABITAT SAID IF WE FOCUS ON TRANSIT DEPENDENT WE  
16 WILL FIND THAT WE'RE STARTING TO MAKE THOSE CONNECTIONS WE'RE  
17 NOT JUST FOR THEM BUT FOR EVERYONE. AND ADINA LEVIN TALKED  
18 ABOUT FOCUSING ON A VARIETY OF USERS GETTING AWAY FROM FOCUS  
19 ON COMMUTE AND GOING INTO ALL USERS AND ALL TIMES. THAT -- SO  
20 WHEN WE'RE LOOKING AT NIGHT TIME OFFERINGS, PEOPLE CAN ENJOY  
21 THE URBAN AREAS IN THE EVENING AND BE ABLE TO GET BACK HOME  
22 AND SO COULD THOSE WHO ARE ON TRANSIT DEPENDENT SO TRANSIT  
23 NEEDS TO BE FREQUENT IN ORDER TO BE MORE CONVENIENT AND EASIER  
24 TO USE. I WOULD SAY FOCUSING ON FUNDING AND INVESTMENT MAKING  
25 TRANSIT MORE SEAMLESS AND MAKING IT MORE FREQUENT WILL



JUNE 24, 2024

1 ACTUALLY INCREASE THOSE FARE REVENUES AND ADDRESS THE FISCAL  
2 CLIFF AT THE SAME TIME. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE  
5 CHRISTINE FOLLOWED BY HOWARD WONG.

6

7 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** CAN YOU HEAR ME.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YES.

10

11 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING AND TO  
12 EVERYBODY AROUND THE TABLE. I AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUE WARREN  
13 CUSHMAN. I AM A MEMBER OF THE INDEPENDENT LIVING CENTER  
14 SILICON VALLEY, SILICON VALLEY INDEPENDENT LIVING, PROUD TO  
15 SERVE. I ALSO SERVE ON SEVERAL COMMITTEES MTC POLICY ADVISORY  
16 COUNCIL AND CHAIR OF THE EQUITY AND ACCESS COMMITTEE BUT JUST  
17 FOR THE RECORD RIGHT NOW I'M SPEAKING AS AN ADVOCATE FOR  
18 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. IT'S GOOD THAT EVERYBODY'S AROUND  
19 THE TABLE BUT THERE IS SAY SIGNIFICANT BODY OF PEOPLE THAT IS  
20 NOT THERE AT THE TABLE IT REALLY DOES NEED TO BE INCLUDED IN  
21 EVERY CONVERSATION. HAVING A WORLD CLASS TRANSIT SYSTEMS  
22 MEANS THERE NEEDS TO BE WORLD CLASS CONNECTIONS, RESOURCES AND  
23 FUNDING IN ORDER TO DO ALL OF THIS. HAVING SAID THAT, I  
24 UNDERSTAND THERE IS A MAJOR -- A MAJOR PUZZLE TO BE SOLVED.  
25 AND, CERTAINLY, LOOKING AT ALL THE DIFFERENT PIECES SHOULD BE



JUNE 24, 2024

1 DONE. HOWEVER, LET'S NOT LOSE SIGHT OF THE END GAME. WHAT IS  
2 SUPPOSED TO HAPPEN AT THE END OF ALL THIS? AND THAT IS TO  
3 MAKE SURE THAT EVERYBODY THAT NEEDS TRANSIT AND THAT IS  
4 TRANSIT 20 HAS TRANSIT WHEREVER THEY NEED TO GO AND THAT'S  
5 TRYING TO MAKE TRANSIT FROM HERE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY TO SAN  
6 FRANCISCO SAYING IT'S A BIG CHALLENGE. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE  
7 EVERYBODY AROUND THE TABLE TAKE A DEEP BREATH, LOOK AT THE  
8 PUZZLE FIGURE OUT THE PUZZLE.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** HOWARD WONG.

11

12 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL SOME  
13 INITIAL THOUGHTS IT'S IMPORTANT DIVISION OF A REGIONAL  
14 MOBILITY NETWORK 24 HOURS A DAY SEVEN DAYS A WEEK BENEFITTING  
15 EVERYONE'S LIVES AFFORDABILITY GETTING AROUND ANYWHERE EASILY,  
16 PLUS CHOICES FOR MOBILITY, CAN COST TIME AND DAILY HEADACHES,  
17 ENVISION HIGH TRANSIT MODE SHARES LIKE OTHER PARTS OF THE  
18 WORLD INCREASE OUR REGIONAL TRANSIT MODE SHARE FROM 5%, 25%,  
19 40% SO THAT VISION BECOMES THE FRAMEWORK FOR HOW DOLLARS ARE  
20 SPENT SO THAT BECOMES THE ESSENCE OF THE REGIONAL  
21 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE DIVISION SEPARATE DOLLARS AND FUNDING  
22 FROM GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE FOR FUNDING ALLOCATIONS. THE  
23 REGIONAL MEASURE CAN ESTABLISH A NINE COUNTY AND REGIONAL  
24 DECISION-MAKING PROCESS SO AGAIN THE REGIONAL MOBILITY VISION  
25 LEADS TO A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE WHICH CONTAINS ONE LEGAL



JUNE 24, 2024

1 LANGUAGE OF THE SETTING DIVISION AND TWO LEGAL LANGUAGE FOR  
2 DECISION-MAKING PROCESS PERHAPS FOR THE BOARD, THE COUNCIL  
3 ALLOCATES MONEY TO ADHERE TO THE VISION AND FINALLY EXAMINE  
4 THE GLOBAL CASE STUDIES OF REGIONAL GOVERNANCE TAKE A LOOK AT  
5 THE CITIES THAT ESTABLISHED IN TORONTO OR ZURICH, AND SEE  
6 WHAT THEIR TRIALS AND TRIBULATIONS WERE AND HOW THEY ACHIEVED  
7 THAT GOAL.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND OUR LAST SPEAKER IN THE ZOOM  
10 SPACE WILL BE PETER STRAUSS.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. THIS IS PETER STRAUSS. I'M  
13 ON THE BOARD OF SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS AND PART OF  
14 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I WANT TO THANK CHAIR  
15 SPERING FOR CONVENING THIS. THIS IS AN IMPORTANT WAY TO FIND  
16 A SOLUTION. BUT WE SPENT MUCH OF THIS MORNING TALKING ABOUT  
17 AND LISTENING TO COMMENTS ABOUT THE FISCAL CLIFF. AND MUCH OF  
18 THAT, YOU KNOW, I FEAR IS JUST PREACHING TO THE CONVERTED.  
19 THOSE OF US, ESPECIALLY ON THE PRIMARILY AFFECTED SYSTEMS  
20 REALIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF THAT. WHAT WE NEED TO DO AS PART OF  
21 THIS PROCESS IS COME TO A SOLUTION FOR THE BAY AREA IS TO DO  
22 MORE LISTENING TO THOSE OF US WHO DID NOT SUPPORT 1031, AND  
23 WHO HAD RESERVATIONS. I REALLY APPRECIATED THE PARTICIPATION  
24 AND HEARING FROM JIM WUNDERMAN, AND THE COMMITTEE ON JOBS. IT  
25 WAS GOOD TO HEAR THEIR COMMENTS. BUT SANTA CLARA WAS



JUNE 24, 2024

1 PARTICULARLY LARGELY SILENCED THIS MORNING AND SANTA CLARA IS  
2 KEY TO THIS WE HAVE HEARD A LOT ABOUT THE WORDS RETURN TO  
3 SOURCE BUT THAT'S HOPEFULLY JUST AWE MEANS TO AN END WE NEED  
4 TO UNDERSTAND BETTER WHAT SANTA CLARA FEELS THEIR NEEDS ARE  
5 FOR WHERE THEY WANT TO SEE FUNDS EXPENDED SO THAT WE CAN TRY  
6 TO ACCOMMODATE THEM SO WE CAN REACH CONSENSUS. NOT JUST  
7 TALKING ABOUT FISCAL CLIFF. IF WE WANT TO PUT A MEASURE  
8 TOGETHER THAT DOES NOT INCLUDE SANTA CLARA'S PARTICIPATION WE  
9 REALLY NEED TO UNDERSTAND SANTA CLARA, SAN MATEO COUNTIES  
10 BETTER LISTEN TO THOSE WHO DO NOT SUPPORT ABOUT THEIR ISSUES  
11 AND LEARN WHAT WE CAN DO TO BETTER ACCOMMODATE THEM.

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** NO ONE LEFT IN THE SPACE FOR PUBLIC  
14 COMMENT.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** BOB POWERS, MANAGER OF BART, DID YOU HAVE  
17 OBSERVATION US WANTED TO SHARE WITH US THIS MORNING?  
18 [LAUGHTER] AND IT'S BRIEF. BRIEF COMMENTS. BUT I THINK IT  
19 WOULD BE INTERESTING FOR THIS COMMITTEE TO HEAR WHAT YOUR  
20 OBSERVATION IS, WHAT YOU ARE HEARING TODAY.

21

22 **ROBERT POWERS:** CHAIR SPERING AND COMMISSIONERS. A COUPLE OF  
23 THINGS I WOULD SAY. I APPRECIATED A COUPLE OF TERMS THAT WERE  
24 USED HERE, AND I THINK JIM WUNDERMAN, YOU KNOW, HE AND I HAVE  
25 GONE AROUND AND AROUND ON A LOT OF DIFFERENT TOPICS, WHETHER





JUNE 24, 2024

1 IT'S SAFETY AND SECURITY, OR FARE GATES, JUST DIFFERENT  
2 PERSPECTIVE, ALWAYS WANTING THE SAME OUTCOME, BUT HIS TERM  
3 ABOUT HOW COMPLEX THIS IS, COMMISSIONER SPERING, AND PEDROZA,  
4 IS REALLY, AS I SIT BACK THERE AND I LISTEN, IT'S, LIKE, IT IS  
5 VERY COMPLEX, BUT COMPLEMENTARY TO THAT IS THE URGENCY FOR US  
6 TO DO SOMETHING. AND I'M SPEAKING US, MEANING -- MAYBE I'LL  
7 JUST USE ME AS AN EXAMPLE. AT BART, I WAS JUST HAVING A  
8 DISCUSSION. I HAVE 540 WORKING DAYS UNTIL MY FISCAL CLIFF, 540  
9 WORKING DAYS, THAT'S ONE JULY BEGINNING OF THIS FISCAL YEAR,  
10 TWO YEARS, THAT'S YOU KNOW, 360 TIMES 540 WORKING DAYS UNTIL  
11 MY FISCAL CLIFF COMES, AND IF YOU DO SOMETHING ABOUT SERVICE,  
12 HOURS OF OPERATION, I HAVE TO DO SOMETHING ABOUT STAFFING, I  
13 HAVE TO BACK UP FROM THAT, AND TO ALFREDO PEDROZA, WHAT YOU  
14 SAID ABOUT THE URGENCY OF DOING SOMETHING -- OR NONE MAYBE  
15 COMMISSIONER SPERING SAID IT, YEAH, JIMMIE GET IT'S VERY  
16 COMPLEX, BUT DOING NOTHING PUTS -- I'LL TELL YA, TO WHAT  
17 STUART COHEN SAID, I'M WELL ON MY WAY, I CANNOT WAIT AROUND,  
18 IF I WORKED FOR ANY OF YOU WOULD SAY POWERS, WHAT'S YOUR PLAN  
19 B, PLAN C, I GUARANTEE YOU I'M ALREADY THINKING ABOUT PLAN B  
20 AND C, BECAUSE IT'S MY JOB. I WAS OUT IN THE SYSTEM WE HAD A  
21 BUG SHUT DOWN THIS WEEKEND ON THE K LINE AND THERE WAS 130 MEN  
22 AND WOMEN FROM SEIU, ATU, ASK ME, BPD, THE OA AND THE MA. 12-  
23 HOUR SHIFTS. WE HAD THE WHOLE THING RIPPED UP. WE WERE BACK  
24 INTO SERVICE. AND THEY ASKED ME THEY ALL KNOW I KNOW HOW TO  
25 DESIGN STUFF AND THEY SEE ME OUT THERE I'M OUT THERE TRYING TO



JUNE 24, 2024

1 BE HELPFUL AND THEY'RE LIKE HEY ARE WE GETTING LAID OFF? ARE  
2 WE GOING TO HAVE A JOB. AND I'LL TELL YOU WHAT I TOLD THEM, I  
3 SAID YES YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE A JOB. YOU'RE NOT GETTING LAID  
4 OFF TO. YOUR POINT COMMISSIONER SPERING, THE URGENCY OF DOING  
5 SOMETHING IS RIGHT NOW. AND JIMMIE GET THAT'S COMPLEX. I GET  
6 IT. MY WHOLE DAY IS COMPLEX AND YOU'RE WHOLE DAY IS COMPLEX  
7 BUT WE GOTTA DO SOMETHING NOW. I WANT GOING TO SAY PUBLIC  
8 COMMENT JIM BECAUSE I WAS PROCESSING HERE A LITTLE BIT. BUT I  
9 THINK YOU SENSE THE URGENCY HERE IN MY VOICE, IN MY AGGRESSION  
10 AND MY TONE.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. NEXT TIME, STAFF, START THE  
13 CLOCK WHEN WE STARTS SPEAKING. [LAUGHTER] I NOTICED YOU  
14 DIDN'T HAVE IT RUNNING THERE. THANKS BOB. IT'S GOOD THIS  
15 COMMITTEE HERE UNDERSTANDS THAT PERSPECTIVE AND WHAT IS THE  
16 OPERATOR IS FACING. OKAY. SO WHAT IS OUR NEXT STEPS? I WANT  
17 TO ENCOURAGE ALL THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS, IF YOU HAVE OPTIONS OR  
18 SOMETHING YOU WANT STAFF TO ANALYZE YOU WANT BROUGHT BACK TO  
19 US. AND NEXT MEETING YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE REVENUE PROJECTIONS.  
20 IS THAT CORRECT? IF YOU ARE GOING TO DO REVENUE PROJECTIONS  
21 DON'T TIE THEM TO ANYTHING JUST WHAT EACH ONE WILL GENERATE.  
22 WILL YOU LOOK AT THAT AS THREE COUNTY OPTION THEY WOULD  
23 GENERATE? 5 AND 9. THEN WE CAN GET, A SENSE OF GENERATING  
24 ENOUGH TO DEAL WITH THIS CRISIS. ANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS HAVE  
25 ANY COMMENTS THIS IS OPPORTUNITY TO DIRECT STAFF TO BRING BACK



JUNE 24, 2024

1 TO US. THIS IS THE TIME. YOU HAVE HEARD A LOT OF COMMENTS  
2 HOPEFUL ONE YOU WILL INCORPORATE THOSE IN, I DON'T WANT TO  
3 REPEAT THAT SO AND WHO DO WE CONTACT IN BETWEEN MEETINGS TO  
4 FEED INFORMATION INTO THE PROCESS?

5

6 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** BEING WE TAKE A POLL TO BRING THAT BACK?

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ABSOLUTELY.

9

10 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** IT'S BEST IF WE SEND AN E-MAIL TO EVERYONE THE  
11 BEST CONTACT INFORMATION WE'LL FOLLOW UP WITH THAT IT'S  
12 PROBABLY GOING TO BE STUART OR SOMEBODY ON THE MTC TEAM.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS THAT YOU CAN  
15 GIVE STAFF BEFORE THE MEETING SO THEY CAN BE PREPARED TO GIVE  
16 YOU A DETAILED ANSWERING THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL TOO. AS YOU  
17 ALL HEARD WE'RE ON A SHORT TIMELINE. YOU HAVE HEARD FROM BOB  
18 ON THE CRISIS, FOR NOT ONLY HIM, BUT EVEN SOLTRANS IN MY  
19 COUNTY WHO IS A SMALL OPERATOR IS FACING THIS FISCAL CLIFF AND  
20 THEY SERVE A LOT OF TRANSIT DEPENDENT PEOPLE. SO COMMITTEE  
21 MEMBERS, IS EVERYBODY COMFORTABLE WITH OUR NEXT STEP? OKAY.  
22 ALL RIGHTY. WITH THAT, STUART, DO YOU HAVE ANY CLOSING  
23 COMMENTS? OKAY. WITH THAT, THE MEETING IS ADJOURNED.

24 [ADJOURNED]

25



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*