

FFY 2020 – FFY 2022

Disadvantaged Business Enterprise Triennial Goal and Methodology



Metropolitan
Transportation
Commission (MTC)

Submitted August 1, 2019



Table of Contents

Introduction	3
Background	3
FTA-Assisted Contracting for FFY 2020 – 2022	3
Goal Methodology	4
Establishment of Local Market Area	5
Step One: Determination of a Base Figure	5
Step Two: Adjusting the Base Figure	6
Public Participation	8
Proposed Overall DBE Goal Breakdown	9
Race-Neutral Implementation Measures	10
APPENDIX A – Consultation Meetings	11
APPENDIX B – Publication	14



OVERALL DBE GOAL AND METHODOLOGY FFY 2020 – 2022

Introduction

The Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) hereby submits the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Triennial Goal and Methodology for Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2020 through 2022.

MTC is the transportation planning, financing and coordinating agency for the nine-county San Francisco Bay Area. As a recipient of FTA funding to subsidize capital and/or operating transit related activities, MTC is required to submit an overall goal for DBE participation over the upcoming three federal fiscal years. **The overall DBE goal of 5% contained herein represents anticipated DBE participation in FTA-assisted activity for FFY 2020 to FFY 2022 to be achieved 4% race (and gender)-neutrally and 1% race (and gender)-consciously.**

Background

The Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) overall goal setting methodology is a requirement set forth in the United States Department of Transportation (USDOT) DBE regulations, 49 Code of Federal Regulation (CFR) Part 26.45. The DBE regulations require USDOT recipients to set an overall goal based on demonstrable evidence of the availability of ready, willing and able DBEs relative to all businesses ready, willing and able to participate on DOT- assisted contracts. The goal must reflect MTC's determination on the level of DBE participation expected absent the effects of discrimination. These regulations define the components that are addressed and incorporated in MTC's DBE Program and were the basis for the selection of compliance elements that were reviewed. MTC's DBE Program was submitted to the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) on June 2018, concur letter was received on July 2, 2018.

FTA-Assisted Contracting for FFY 2020 – 2022

MTC receives various levels of FTA formula funding directly from FTA and indirectly from California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) and other FTA transit grantees. MTC has been the direct recipient of three FTA formula programs, and has subrecipients for each of those programs. These programs include 5339 Bus & Bus Facilities and 5316 Job Access Reverse Commute (JARC).

Fixing America's Surface Transportation (FAST) Act was signed into law in December 2015. The act supports transit funding, including the 5339 Bus & Bus Facilities program, through fiscal year 2020 and reauthorized several FTA programs. Under the Fast Act, state and local government entities that operate fixed route bus service and that are eligible to receive direct grants under 5307 (Urbanized Areas) and 5311 (Rural Areas) programs may be direct recipients of Section 5339 funds, regardless of their designated recipient status. The FAST Act also removed MTC as the direct recipient of 5339 funds and has significantly reduced the number of subrecipients under MTC's oversight. Therefore, these 5339 program funds are not reflected in MTC's FFY 2020 – FFY 2022 FTA-assisted contracting activity.



OVERALL DBE GOAL AND METHODOLOGY FFY 2020 – 2022

The Job Access and Reverse Commute (5316) program has expired; however, MTC has a few remaining 5316 subrecipients that have expendable funds available in federal fiscal year 2019. These funds are programmed to nonprofits and other agencies ineligible as direct recipients. MTC’s FFY 2020 and FFY 2022 FTA-assisted contracting activity does not include new 5316 funding.

MTC is a subrecipient of Urbanized Area (5307) and State of Good Repair (5337) funds from direct FTA grantees for the Clipper Project. These 5307 and 5337 funds account for a large percentage of FTA-assisted projects during the FFY 2020 through FFY 2022 periods. MTC has executed memoranda of understanding with area FTA grantees establishing procedures to ensure FTA contracting activity is captured appropriately in FTA DBE goals and Uniform Reports.

The DBE regulations state that the overall goal should be expressed as a percentage of all FTA funds (excluding the purchase of transit vehicles) that MTC (and subrecipients under MTC’s oversight) will expend in FTA-assisted contracts over the next three federal fiscal years. The dollar amounts in **Table 1** reflect the full contract amount for each project, as opposed to only the FTA funded share, because the FTA funded percentages in MTC contracts are usually uncertain until project solicitation.

Table 1

Project	FFY 20	FFY 21	FFY 22	FFY 20 - 22
Clipper Card Order	\$4,000,000	\$4,000,000	\$3,000,000	\$11,000,000
Clipper Tech Advisor	\$800,000	\$800,000	\$800,000	\$2,400,000
Clipper Capital Project Support	\$200,000	\$200,000	\$200,000	\$600,000
Clipper System Enhancements	\$600,000	\$600,000	\$600,000	\$1,800,000
Clipper Network Communication/Replace	\$3,000,000	\$3,000,000	\$0	\$6,000,000
System Integrator - Card Readers	\$47,790,000	\$22,350,000	\$62,000,000	\$132,140,000
Integration of Existing TVMs and Fare gates	\$4,000,000	\$0	\$0	\$4,000,000
C2 Advisor	\$200,000	\$200,000	\$200,000	\$600,000
Customer Service Center Support	\$1,000,000	\$2,500,000	\$2,000,000	\$5,500,000
C2 Technical Assistance	\$1,750,000	\$1,360,000	\$240,000	\$3,350,000
Regional On-Board Transit Survey	\$600,000	\$600,000	\$600,000.00	\$1,800,000
Subrecipient Activity				
Short Range Transit Plans	\$360,000	\$560,000	\$0.00	\$920,000
Regional Transit Asset Management	\$250,000	\$0	\$0.00	\$250,000
Lifeline Cycle 5 Pilot Project	\$440,000	\$200,000	\$0.00	\$640,000
Total	\$64,990,000	\$36,370,000	\$69,640,000	\$171,000,000

Goal Methodology

DBE regulations require that MTC include with the overall goal submission a description of the methodology used to establish the goal, including the base figure and the evidence with which it was calculated, and the adjustments made to the base figure, if any, and evidence relied upon for



OVERALL DBE GOAL AND METHODOLOGY FFY 2020 – 2022

the adjustments. This section outlines the process utilized to establish the step-one base figure and consideration given to determine if a step-two adjustment of the base figure is necessary.

Establishment of Local Market Area

Figure A



The US Department of Transportation (USDOT) *Tips for Goal Setting* recommends explaining how the local market area was determined. The local market area is the area in which the substantial majority of the contractors and subcontractors with which MTC does business are located and the area in which MTC spends the substantial majority of its contracting dollars. As previously mentioned, MTC is the coordinating agency in the nine-county San Francisco Bay area. The local market area was determined to be the nine counties in the San Francisco Bay area based on MTC and its subrecipients’ contractor location and contract expenditures. **Figure A** illustrates the nine counties in MTC’s local market area. These counties include Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin, Napa, San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara, Solano and Sonoma.

Step One: Determination of a Base Figure

MTC examined various sources identified in the US DOT *Tips for Goal Setting* to measure the relative availability data. MTC determined that the DBE directory and US Census data were the most appropriate sources available to estimate the relative availability of DBEs and non-DBEs in the market area. Weighting of project activity with the applicable North American Industry Classification System (NAICS) code is encouraged by the *US DOT Tips for Goal Setting* to ensure the step one base figure is as accurate as possible. **Table 2** presents contracting opportunities broken down by NAICS codes with the weighted amounts for the FFY 2020-22 projects.

Table 2

NAICS Code	Category of Work	Amount	Category Weight
334118	Computer Terminal and Equip. Mfg.	\$11,000,000	6.43%
48599	Transit and Ground Passenger Transp.	\$1,810,000	1.06%
522320	Financial Transactions Processing	\$1,800,000	1.05%
541330	Engineering Services	\$6,600,000	3.86%
541511	Custom Computer Programming Svcs	\$132,140,000	77.27%
541611	Management Consulting Services	\$15,850,000	9.27%
541910	Marketing Research	\$1,800,000	1.05%
		\$171,000,000	100.00%

The base figure was calculated using the methods prescribed in the US DOT *Tips for Goal Setting*, with ready, willing and able DBEs as the numerator in each work category and all firms (DBEs and non-DBEs) as the denominator. MTC examined the relationship on relative availability and size of projects during the triennial period. Through incorporation of weighting, MTC further refined the data based on relative availability for applicable projects. After establishing weights, MTC



OVERALL DBE GOAL AND METHODOLOGY FFY 2020 – 2022

determined the best sources for DBEs and census data were the California Unified Certification Program (CUCP) and US County Business Patterns, respectively.

Table 3 shows the relative availability of DBEs by NAICS Code.

Table 3
(DBEs) ÷ (All Firms) = Relative Availability

NAICS Code	Category of Work	DBE Availability	All Firms (including DBEs)	Relative Availability
334118	Computer Terminal and Equip. Mfg.	11	56	0.1964
48599	Transit and Ground Passenger Transp.	8	311	0.0257
522320	Financial Transactions Processing	4	146	0.0274
541330	Engineering Services	486	2284	0.2128
541511	Custom Computer Programming Svcs	286	5044	0.0567
541611	Management Consulting Services	1000	2548	0.3925
541910	Marketing Research	83	283	0.2933

The step one weighted base figure is derived by multiplying the category weight by the relative availability as shown in the below equation.

$$\text{Base Figure} = \sum \frac{(\text{Number of DBEs Ready, Willing and Able})}{(\text{Number of All Firms Ready, Willing and Able})} \times \text{weight} \times 100$$

Table 4
The Step One Weighted Base Figure

NAICS Code	Project	Weight	Availability	Weighted Base Figure
334118	Computer Terminal and Equip. Mfg.	0.06433	0.1964	0.01263
48599	Transit and Ground Passenger Transp.	0.01058	0.02572	0.00027
522320	Financial Transactions Processing	0.01053	0.02740	0.00029
541330	Engineering Services	0.03860	0.21278	0.00821
541511	Custom Computer Programming Svcs	0.77275	0.0567	0.04382
541611	Management Consulting Services	0.09269	0.39246	0.03638
541910	Marketing Research	0.01053	0.29329	0.00309
			Total	0.10469
			(*100)	10.4688
			Weighted Base Figure	10.47%

Step Two: Adjusting the Base Figure

Once the base figure is calculated, the DBE regulations require that MTC examine all the evidence available in its jurisdiction to determine what adjustment, if any, is needed to the base figure to arrive at the overall goal. If the evidence does not suggest an adjustment is necessary, then no adjustment shall be made. Several factors must be considered in making a step two adjustment to the base figure. MTC considered the following factors for a step two adjustment:



OVERALL DBE GOAL AND METHODOLOGY FFY 2020 – 2022

- Past participation (the volume of work DBEs have performed in recent years) or other measure of demonstrated capacity; and
- Evidence from disparity studies conducted in the market area (including relevant studies commissioned by other contracting agencies in the market area);

Past participation of DBEs on MTC projects from previous years may not have included all subrecipient activity as suggested by FTA’s guidance. Therefore, MTC does not consider past participation as a relevant factor for a step two adjustment. MTC will develop procedures to ensure that all future subrecipient activity is properly documented and reported.

The *USDOT Tips for Goal Setting* suggests that consideration be given to disparity study data conducted in the market area. A disparity study was commissioned by Caltrans¹ to determine if any disparities existed in its FTA-assisted contracting activities. The disparity study final report was issued on December 14, 2014 and is available to the public on Caltrans’ website. Caltrans’ Department of Rail and Mass Transportation (DRMT) is conducting a disparity study that will provide information to help refine future implementations of the Federal DBE Program. The study is expected to be completed by June 2019, MTC will review the contents of the study and make adjustments as necessary.

The 2014 study provided evidence for a step two adjustment based on an analysis of DBE participation on Caltrans’ FTA-assisted contracts. The study analysis indicated Caltrans had 0.2 percent DBE participation on FTA-assisted contracts. The study further stated, “if Caltrans were to adjust its base figure on DBE participation information from the disparity study, it might consider taking the average of its base figure and the 0.2 percent DBE participation.”

MTC reviewed the contents of the disparity study and considers the information to be relevant based on the similarity of MTC’s FTA-assisted contracting activities to those of Caltrans. Therefore, MTC determined that an adjustment to the base figure was warranted. MTC averaged its step one base figure from Table 4 with the DBE participation from the disparity study analysis to determine the overall DBE goal for FFY 2020 – FFY 2022.

Step One Base Figure	DBE Participation	Overall DBE Goal
10.47%	0.2%	5%

¹ Caltrans 2014 Disparity Study for FTA Contracts, Final Report December 5, 2014, conducted by BBC Research & Consulting.



Public Participation

In establishing an overall goal, MTC must provide for consultation and publication. This includes: (1) consultation with minority, women's and general contractor groups, community organizations, and other officials or organizations that could be expected to have information concerning the availability of disadvantaged and non-disadvantaged businesses, the effects of discrimination on opportunities for DBEs, and MTC's efforts to establish a level playing field for the participation of DBEs; and (2) a published notice announcing MTC's proposed overall goal before submission to FTA. The notice must be posted on MTC's official web site. If the proposed goal changes following review by the FTA, the revised goal must be posted on MTC's official internet web site.

Consultation

The Metropolitan Transportation Commission in collaboration with the Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority presented MTC's DBE methodology at the Disadvantaged and Small Business Summit on March 22, 2019. The Business Outreach Committee (BOC) is a consortium of San Francisco Bay Area Transit and Transportation Agencies. The BOC members, conducted a joint consultation meeting on April 2, 2019. Members of trade associations, chambers of commerce, builders' exchanges, and technical resource groups in the Bay Area were invited to the consultation meeting. Some of the topics discussed at the meeting included: the organizations' experience with DBE certification programs, the number of DBE constituents in their organization, and suggested race-neutral contracting practices. Comments were received and documented from meeting attendees; however, there were no comments that warranted a modification to MTC's goal setting approach. **Appendix A – Consultation Meeting**, includes documentation of the agenda, groups invited, groups attended and comments received during the meeting. The BOC also conducted a public participation meeting later in the day on April 2, 2016 to present the goal setting process and solicit public comment. Documentation regarding the public participation meeting is also part of Appendix A.

Publication

A published notice announcing the proposed overall goal was posted on MTC's website prior to the original August 1, 2019 submittal. **Appendix B – Publication**, contains documentation of the notices published on the MTC website prior to MTC's submission of its DBE Methodology to the Federal Transit Administration on August 1, 2019.

DBE regulations grant recipients the discretion to inform the public that the proposed overall goal and its rationale are available for inspection during normal business hours at their principal office and for a 30-day comment period. The FFY 2020 – FFY 2022 DBE goal and methodology was made available for inspection on MTC's website and comments on the goal methodology will be accepted for a 30-day period. Additionally, MTC will consult with the DBE community and hold a public participation stakeholder meeting within 60 days of the submission of the revised Triennial Goal and Methodology. All comments received during the public participation process will be analyzed by MTC to determine if revisions to the overall goal are warranted.



Proposed Overall DBE Goal Breakdown

The proposed overall FFY 2020-22 DBE Goal for the MTC is 5%, which is one percentage points lower than the previous 6% DBE goal submitted to FTA on March, 2017.

The DBE regulations require a projection of the portions of the overall goal expected to be met through race (and gender)-neutral and race (and gender)-conscious measures. Regulations additionally require that the maximum feasible portion of the overall goal be attained through race (and gender)-neutral measures.

Caltrans is currently conducting a disparity study that was not completed in time to be used to develop this goal methodology. Therefore, MTC has continued to rely upon the 2014 Caltrans Disparity Study for FTA Contracts found evidence of discrimination. The 2014 disparity study determined the disparity index for minority and women-owned business enterprise utilization. A disparity index of 100 indicates parity between utilization and availability for a particular group for a specific set of contracts. A disparity index of less than 100 may indicate a disparity between utilization and availability, and disparities of less than 80 may be considered substantial disparity. Disparity indices are generally equated using the following formula:

$$\frac{\% \text{ actual utilization}}{\% \text{ availability}} \times 100 = \text{disparity index}$$

The 2014 Caltrans disparity study calculated disparity indices for minority and women business-owned groups on FTA-funded contracts². The overall disparity for all groups was 91 ([10.4 utilization ÷ 11.4 availability] X 100), which means these groups received approximately 90 percent of the contract dollars that might be expected to be received based on their availability for those contracts. This leaves an approximate 10% disparity to be eliminated in order to reach parity. MTC will factor this statistical index data from the disparity study to calculate its portion of the overall goal to be met race (and gender)-neutrally. Based on the Caltrans disparity study, MTC will presume that it can meet 90 percent of its overall goal of 5 percent through race (and gender)-neutral measures. Therefore, the DBE goal split equates to 4.5% race neutral and 0.5% race conscious. **The numbers will be rounded to 4% race neutral and 1% race conscious³.**

MTC will re-evaluate its DBE goal calculation for FFY 2020-2022 when Caltrans completes its 2019 disparity study to determine whether its goal should be revised.

² Source: BBC Research & Consulting availability and utilization analyses.

³ DBE regulation §26.45(h) requires that overall goals must provide for participation by all certified DBEs and must not be subdivided into group-specific goals. Program exemptions and waiver provisions are outlined in DBE regulation §26.15. Hispanic and Subcontinent Asian American-owned firms were found to have no disparity in the Caltrans study. MTC will continue to monitor participation of these groups in MTC's race conscious activities and seek a waiver to exclude these groups in accordance with §26.15, if necessary.



Race-Neutral Implementation Measures

MTC will continue to utilize race-neutral methods to facilitate DBE participation by: 1) participating in DBE workshops and outreach efforts, 2) publishing all contracting opportunities on the MTC website (<https://mtc.bonfirehub.com/portal/?tab=openOpportunities>), and 3) reviewing pending solicitations to determine the feasibility of breaking the proposed contract into smaller scopes of work aimed at providing more opportunities for DBE and small business participation. As needed, the DBE Liaison Officer will assist prospective contractors to identify DBEs and SBEs that are ready, willing, and able to subcontract.

The MTC website (<http://mtc.ca.gov/about-mtc/doing-business-mtc/current-contract-vendor-opportunities>) has been made easier to navigate since MTC's last Triennial Goal and Methodology report and includes information on current, upcoming, and recently awarded contracts including awardees and contract amount. The website now allows firms to register online to receive notifications of procurements when they are issued. MTC's DBE program, BOC newsletters, "Tips for Responding to MTC Procurements," notices of upcoming events, and information on projects that receive funding from MTC, but are administered and contracted through other transportation and local agencies in the nine-county Bay Area are also posted on the website.

MTC mails notices of procurements to DBEs, and as a member of the BOC and Caltrans District 4 Calmentor program, MTC actively participates with other agencies in DBE and SBE outreach efforts. Events that MTC planned and/or participated in the last federal fiscal year include:

1. Meet the Primes Networking event on October 10, 2018;
2. Caltrans Calmentor Meeting on October 25, 2018;
3. County of Santa Clara Business Diversity Fair on November 2, 2018;
4. Caltrans Calmentor Meeting on January 24, 2019;
5. Disadvantaged and Small Business Summit on March 22, 2019;
6. Consultation meeting on April 2, 2019;
7. Public Participation Session to provide information on upcoming transportation projects and provide input in the DBE goal-setting process on April 2, 2019;
8. Caltrans Calmentor meeting and annual luncheon on May 3, 2019; and
9. Public Agency Night on May 22, 2019. Public Agency Night on May 22, 2019.

APPENDIX A – Consultation Meetings

BOC Public Participation Meeting
April 2, 2019 2:00 PM - 3:00 PM
AC Transit, Oakland, CA

Initials	Last Name	First Name	E-mail	Job Title	Company	Work Address	City	State	Zip	Phone	Certifications
	Adams	Cathy	cdaconsultinggroup@gmail.com	President	CDA Consulting Group	P.O. Box 23511	Oakland	CA	94623	510 653-4085	LBE
	Alford	Latressa	LatressaAlford@gmail.com	Owner	L Wilson Alford & Associates	68 Ventura Street	Vallejo	CA	94590	707-246-3135	
	Bell	Michele	mbell@americantex.com	Sales	American Textile & Supplu, Inc.	3439 Regatta Boulevard	Richmond	CA	94804	510-701-8370	SBE
	Bonner	Noelle	noelle@bonnercommunications.com	CEO/Principal	Bonner Communications	90 New Montgomery Street	San Francisco	CA	94105	925-705-5109	DBE, WBE, MBE, LBE
	Brown	Nehemiah	info@precision-drywall.com	Operarions	Precision Drywall	184 Mendell St	San Francisco	CA	94124	415-550-8880	LBE
	Camacho	Richard	rcamacho@gemsenvironmental.com	President	GEMS Environmental Management Services, Inc.	1120 Willow Pass Court	Concord	CA	94520	925-671-6822	DBE, SBE, MBE
	Camese	Sarah	comesetrans@att.net	Operation Manager	RCCAMESE TRANSPORTATION	1485 bayshore blvd	San Francisco	CA	94124	415-243-7090	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE, LBE
	Cannon	Edward	edcannon2002@yahoo.com	CEO	CAS Financial & Construction Group Inc	55 Santa Clara St Ste 203A	Oakland	CA	94601	510-586-6474	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Conserva	Mariaelena	mariaelena@earthviewscience.com	Owner	Earthview Science	5921 Fremont Street	Oakland	CA	94608	510-444-8956	DBE, SBE, WBE, LBE
	Cooper	Jack	vidimge@aol.com	Owner/Technician	Video Image Security	1286 Loumena CT, P.O. Box 2475	Manteca	CA	95336	209-679-0995	SBE
	Cortez	Roberto	rc@monarchengineers.com	CEO	Monarch Engineers	425 Virginia Street, Suite B	Vallejo	CA	94590	707-648-9571	DBE, SBE, MBE
	CRANDALL	A.J.	aj@centralequipmentservice.com	Territory Manager	CENTRAL EQUIPMENT SERVICE	345 Commercial St.	San Jose	CA	95112	408-606-8655	SBE
AD	Davenport	Artemise	adavenport@goldengate.org	DBE Program Administrator	Golden Gate Bridge, Highway & Transportation Dist	1011 Andersen Drive	San Rafael	CA	94901	415-257-4581	
DB	Davis	Darold	info@replicant-ad.net	Principal	Replicant AD, Inc.	535 Liberty St Apt 302	El Cerrito	CA	94530	510-872-2936	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE, SB for Public Works by DGS
	Dyson	Karwanna	karwanna1@gmail.com	Media Producer	Big Mouth Productions	20 Dedman Ct	San Francisco	CA	94124	510-491-3703	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE, LBE
	Easom	Jennifer	jenn@weldonworks.com	Owner	Weldon Works, Inc.	PO Box 667	Felton	CA	95018	408-251-1161	DBE, SBE, WBE, Hubzone
✓	Evans-Peguese	Sheila	sheila.evans-peguese@sfmta.com	Contract Compliance Officer	San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency	576 2nd Avenue	San Francisco	CA	94118	415-701-4436	DBE
✓	Flynn	Liam	LiamFlynn@trafficware.com	Business Development Manager	CUBIC Trafficware	522 Gillingham	Sugar Land	CA	77478	321-616-0141	DBE
	Goethe	Gerona	ggoethe@bay-ship.com	Estimating & Contracts Manager	Bay Ship & Yacht Co.	2900 Main Street #2100	Alameda	CA	94501	510-337-9122 x210	SBE
	Gooden	Kimone	kgooden@enomik.com	Managing Director	Enomik Commodities	1271 Washington Ave #517	San Leandro	CA	94577	408-406-8775	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE, LBE
✓	Gularte	Lauren	gularte@watertransit.org	Program Manager/Analyst	WETA/San Francisco Bay Ferry	Pier 9, Suite 111, The Embarcadero	San Francisco	CA	94111	415-364-3188	
	Hernandez	Bernardo	bernardohernandez@hillintl.com	Vice President	Hill International	201 Mission St, Suite 1200	San Francisco	CA	94105	415-505-9098	
	Jackson-Gent	Cathy	cathy@glibalinvestmentcompanies.com	CEO	Global Investment Company	300 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza #254	Oakland	CA	94612	510-835-8300	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE, LBE
	Jones	Dwayne	djones@rdjent.biz	President	RDJ Enterprises	1485 Bayshore Blvd #135	San Francisco	CA	94124	415-467-8404	DBE, MBE, LBE
	Joseph	Robert	kjoseph@stepaheadsolution.com	VP	Step Ahead Solutions, Inc	1377 S Blaney Ave.	San Jose	CA	95129	408-771-9663	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE, LBE
	kennedy	tim	wwcservices@aol.com	president	union service company, inc.	pier 54, suite 107	san francisco	CA	94158	415.908.3651	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
JK	Kong	Julia	julia.kong@reflexdc.com	Managing Partner	Reflex Design Collective	2323 Broadway	Oakland	CA	94612	734-649-6415	DBE
	Layseca	Diana	diana@bestestlab.com	Senior Marketing Specialist	Bess Testlab Inc	2463 Tripaldi Way	Hayward	CA	94545	408-988-0101	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Litzau	Mark	mlitzau@jacobsonjames.com	Principal	Jacobson James & Associates	2815 Mitchell Drive, Suite 120	Walnut Creek	CA	94598	(925) 708-7359	SBE, WBE
EF	Lono	Einar	einarl@integrabim.com	BIM Consultant	IntegraBIM	9260 Alcosta Blvd, Blg C, Ste 28	San Ramon	CA	94583	530-921-8978	SBE
	Lui	Grace	glui@fugro.com	Vice President	FUGRO	1777 Botelho Drive, Ste 262	Walnut Creek	CA	94596	925-949-7136	
	Machado	Eric	machadobrothers@msn.com	Owner	Machado brothers Inc	1005 Spring Hill Rd	Petaluma	CA	94952	707-763-7715	DBE, SBE
	Machado	Craig	machadobrothers@msn.com	Owner	machado Brothers Inc	1005 Spring Hill Rd	Petaluma	CA	94952	707-763-7715	DBE, SBE
MA	Mariani	Jennifer	jmariani@charistech-ec.com	Founder/CEO	Charistech Engineers and Consultants	11764 Castle Court	Dublin	CA	94568	510-415-5150	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE
MA	Martin	Sidney	smartfish52002@yahoo.com	Project. Manager	Tyche Business Solutions	1275 Fairfax Avenue, Suite 203 TB	San Francisco	CA	94124	415-760-6746	SBE, MBE
✓	Martinez	Kristina	kmartinez@cccta.org	Dir of Recruitment & EE Development/DBE Officer	Central Contra Costa Transit Authority	2477 Arnold Industrial Way	Concord	CA	94565	925-680-2031	
	McGhee	James	jamesmcghee@earthlink.net	President/CEO	JLM Management Group	P.O. Box 20911	Piedmont	CA	94620	415-806-1940	DBE, MBE, LBE
	Megevand	Antoine	amegevand@inspectionsservices.net	Estimator / Project Manager	Inspection Services, Inc.	1798 University Avenue	Berkeley	CA	94703	510-900-2100	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE
MM	Micheltorena	Miguel	mmicheltorena@airandlube.com	President	Air & Lube Systems, Inc.	8353 Demetre Ave.	Sacramento	CA	95828	(916) 642-7201	DBE, SBE, MBE
	Minnis	maurice	mminnis@csi-it.com	President	CSI	500 Beale Street, Suite 325	San Francisco	CA	94105	415-298-0321	DBE
	Moini	Mahsati	mmoini@polytechae.com	Director of Interior Design	polytech architects	235 Pine Street	San Francisco	CA	94104	415-926-6710	SBE, WBE, LBE
	Moodie	Dahlia	dahlia@ecoptions.biz	Pres/CEO	Energy Conservation Options	14439 Catalina Street	San Leandro	CA	94577	510-647-8450	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE, LBE
	Pahl	Mothusi	mothusi@ondaka.com	CCO	Ondaka	867 Warfield Ave	Oakland	CA	94610	832-391-8383	DBE, MBE
✓	Pipkin	Kim	kimp@ae3partners.com	Director of Business Development	AE3 Partners	275 Battery Street, 10th Floor	San Francisco	CA	94111	415.233.9991	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Quincy	Tony	tquincy@cot-inc.com	Director of Professional Services	Cross Ocean Technologies, Inc.	1901 Harrison Street, Ste. 1100	Oakland	CA	94612	510-427-5385	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Reed	DENNIS	reedsons7@aol.com	Owner	REED & SONS CONSTRUCTION	2550 APPIAN WAY, SUITE 204	PINOLE	CA	94564	510-757-5636	DBE, MBE
	Reese	Lori	LoriReese10@gmail.com	CEO	LDRB Construction & Planning Mgt	106 Serra Drive	Vallejo	CA	94590	650-269-2328	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE, LBE
	robles	Kim	roblesconcretedesign@gmail.com	Owner President	Robles Concrete Design	1318 5th ave	San Francisco	CA	94122	415-690-8174	
	Ruiz	Anthony	anthony@upsfab.com	Estimating	United Pipe and Steel Fabrication	100 Quantico	Bakersfield	CA	93307	209-229-0735	SBE, MBE
	Ruiz	Hugo	thecolores1970@yahoo.com	President	The Colores Painting Co Inc	250 London Street	San Francisco	CA	94112	4152-353-155	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Sanchez De Alba	Victoria	victoria@dealba.net	President	De Alba Communications	One Polk Street, 2nd Floor	San Francisco	CA	94102	650-270-7810	DBE, SBE, LBE
	Santana	Juan	juan@webjungle.com	CEO	Jungle Communications	1390 Market Street, Suite 200	San Francisco	CA	94102	415-956-2556	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Schaninger	Margaret	mas@infoplusintl.com	President/CEO	Info Plus International	1065 E. Hillsdale Blvd., Suite 255	Foster City	CA	94404	650-403-7871	SBE, WBE
	Short III	John	jshort@cot-inc.com	President / CEO	Cross Ocean Technologies, Inc.	1901 Harrison Street, Ste. 1100	Oakland	CA	94612	510-919-5437	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Souva	Suzanne	suzanne@bonnercommunications.com	Account Manager	Bonner Communications	90 New Montgomery Street	San Francisco	CA	94105	650-241-2953	DBE, WBE, MBE, LBE
SK	Staton	Brooke	brooke@reflexdc.com	Co-Founder, Managing Partner	Reflex Design Collective	2323 Broadway	Oakland	CA	94612	443-695-5355	DBE
ST	Stewart	Sonja	sonjacstewart2005@yahoo.com	CEO / Principal	StarGazer Enterprise	537 34th Street	Oakland	CA	94609	510-575-4322	DBE, SBE, WBE, MBE
	Tavaf	Shari	shari@stradaec.com	President	STRADA EC LLC	940 Dwight way, Suite 16	Berkeley	CA	94710	510-931-9393	SBE, WBE
	Tavafrahti	sharareh	shariatstrada@gmail.com	President	STRADA EC LLC	940 Dwight way, Suite 16	Oakland	CA	94710	510-931-9393	SBE, WBE
	Taylor-McGhee	Belle	belletm@earthlink.net	Vice President	JLM Management Group	P.O. Box 20911	Piedmont	CA	94620	510-326-5776	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Tsao	Jonathan	jtsao@tsaodesign.com	Principal	TSAO Design Group/Architects	160 Pine Street, Suite 650	San Francisco	CA	94111	415 398 5500 X222	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Vanecek	Mike	mike@konectek.io	CEO	Konectek	2950 Buskirk Avenue Suite 300	Walnut Creek	CA	94597	925-290-7850	M/WBE

BOC Public Participation Meeting

April 2, 2019 2:00 PM - 3:00 PM

AC Transit, Oakland, CA

Initials	Last Name	First Name	E-mail	Job Title	Company	Work Address	City	State	Zip	Phone	Certifications
CV	Wallace	Candice	c.m.tsegga@gmail.com	CFO	Social Dynamism	425 28TH ST, Unit 201A	OAKLAND	CA	94609	909-746-6721	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE
	Wilson Alford	Latressa	latressaalford@gmail.com	Owner/Principle	L Wilson Alford, JD	68 Ventura Street	Vallejo	CA	94590	707-246-3135	
	Zewdie	Admas	admas@activewayz.engineering	President	ActiveWayz Engineering	7901 Oakport Street, Suite 4225	Oakland	CA	94621	510-989-2420	DBE, SBE, MBE, LBE

- ① Knuice, Renée rknuice@nuta.ca.gov Admin Tech NUTA 625 Buena Vista St Napa CA 94559 707.259.8780
- LEVY-phillips, Patricia Owner- Transport & Courier 950 Fairmount Ave #215, Oak. 94611 ~ 510-688-5622
- Johnson, Rosa rosa.johnson@stantec.com Stantec 1340 Treat Blvd. #300 WC, CA
- Lowe, Andrea, alowe@adventures.com, President ASquared Ventures 675 Hegenberger # 22B, Oakland 94621
- Hubbard, Kamal, kamal@lassociates.com consultant, Laura Luter & Associates Oakland, CA
- Williams, Patricia Novcal PTAC Patricia@Novcalptac.org 707 332 7825
- Frazier, Sean sean@shmechanicalinc.com SH Mechanical Inc 231 Travis Court, Suisun City 94585 DBE, WMBE, SF, SA
- Jung, Ty actionpad@gmail.com Action Pad Oakland, CA
- Pi Pkin, Kim Kim@ae3partners.com Director of Bus. Dev. 275 Battery Street, Suite 1050 SF, CA 94111
- Butler, Anita, CFO anita@tychebusinesssolutions.com 1275 Fairfax St., Suite 203TB SF, CA 94124 Tyche Business Solutions
- Martin, Sidney CEO sid@tychebusinesssolutions.com Tyche Business Solutions
- Blake, Richard richard@intueor.com Principle Consultant Intueor 7700 Irvine Center Dr. Ste 610, Irvine, CA 92618 (DBE)
- Collins, Phil phil@intueor.com Principle Consultant Intueor " "
- Jono, Binur binur@integrabim.com BIM Consultant Integra BIM 9260 Alcosta Blvd Bldg C, Ste 28 San Ramon, CA 94583
- McCrossan, David david.mccrossan@kks-world.com VP KKS 300 Frank Ogawa Plaza, Ste 105 Oakland, CA 94612
- Tafuya, Dominic dtafuya@vst.engineering VST Engineering Inc. 303. 908. 1448
- Falk, Andrew afalk@inspection-services.net Special Inspector Inspection Services Inc. 1798 University Ave, Berkeley CA 94703 (SBE, DBE, WMBE)
- Johnson, Rosa rosa.johnson@stantec.com Project Coordinator Stantec 1340 Treat Blvd., Ste. 300 Walnut Creek CA 94597
- Marianni, Jennifer jmariani@charistechengineersconsultants.com Charis Tech Engineers & Consultants, LLC Dublin, CA (DBE, SF)
- Flynn, Liam liam.flynn@cubic.com CUBIC 522 Gillingham Sugar Lane, TX 77478 Business Dev. Manager

BOC Public Participation Meeting

April 2, 2019 2:00 PM - 3:00 PM

AC Transit, Oakland, CA

Initials	Last Name	First Name	E-mail	Job Title	Company	Work Address	City	State	Zip	Phone	Certifications
✓	Babcock	Tania	tbabcock@eccta.org	Civil Rights Officer/DBE Liaison Officer	Tri Delta Transit	801 Wilbur Avenue	Antioch	CA	94509	925-754-6622	
✓	Brazil	Liz	liz.brazil@vta.gov	Manager of Business Diversity Programs	VTA	3331 North First Street	San Jose	CA	95134	408-321-5874	
✓	Campos	Luz	lcampos@bayareametro.gov	Compliance & Outreach Specialist	MTC	375 Beale Street, Suite 800	San Francisco	CA	94105	415-778-5390	
✓	Furnary	Mike	mike@westcat.org	Grants & Compliance Manager	WestCat	601 Walter Avenue	Pinole	CA	94564	510-724-5551	
✓	Halley	Phillip	phalley@actransit.org	Contracts Compliance Administrator	AC Transit	1600 Franklin Street	Oakland	CA	94612	51-891-7164	
✓	Medina	Olga	olga.medina@vta.org	Management Analyst	VTA	3331 North First Street	San Jose	CA	95134	408-321-7534	
✓	Moore-Green	Brooklyn	bpmgreen@actransit.org	Associate Management Analyst	AC Transit	1600 Franklin Street	Oakland	CA	94612	510-891-7231	
✓	Senigor	Todd	todd.senigor@sfmta.com	Contracts Compliance Officer	SFMTA	576 2nd Avenue	San Francisco	CA	94118	415-646-2013	
✓	Sin	Hoa	hsin@bart.gov	Programs Manager	BART	300 Lakeside Drive, 16th Floor	Oakland	CA	94612	510-464-7538	
✓	Towner	Joseph	jtowner@bart.gov	Program Manager	BART	300 Lakeside Drive, 16th Floor	Oakland	CA	94612	510-987-5210	
✓	Ybarra	Dennis	dennis@soltransride.com	Program Analyst II	SolTrans	311 Sacramento Street	Vallejo	CA	94590	707-736-6984	

BOC Consultation Meeting
 April 2, 2019, 12:00 p.m. - 1:00 p.m.
 Alameda Contra Costa Transit District
 1600 Franklin Street (Board Room), Oakland, CA 94612

Name	Organization	Contact Number	E-mail
ADAM GEHLERT	VSCE, INC.	510-835-5001	agehlert@vsceinc.com
CHERYL CHAMBERS	VSCE, INC	510-835-5001	cchambers@vsceinc.com
Brooklyn Moore-Green	ACTransit	510-891-7231	bpmgreen@actransit.org
Tania Babcock	Tri Delta Transit	925-754-6622	tbabcock@ecote.org
Mike Furnary	WestCAT	510-724-3331	mike@westcat.org
Sheila Evans-Pegues	SFMTA	415-420-9904	sheila.evans-pegues@sfmta.com
Todd Senigor	SFMTA	415-646-2013	Todd.Senigor@sfmta.com
Olya Medina	VTA	408 321 1534	Olya.medina@vta.org
Dennis Ybarra	SolTrans	207 736 6284	DENNIS@SOLTRANSIDE.COM
Joseph Towers	BART	510-464-5210	JTowers@BART.GOV
LIZ BRAUN	VTA	(510) 464-7819	LIZ.BRAUN@VTA.ORG
Hoa Sin	BART	(510) 464 7538	hsin@bart.gov
Phillip Halley	ACTransit	(510) 891-7164	ContractsCompliance@actransit.org
Lauren Gularte	WETA	415 364 3188	gularte@watertransit.org
Kristina Martinez	CCCTA	925 680 2039	Kmartinez@cccta.org
Renee Kulick	NVTA	707-257-8780	rkulick@nvta.ca.gov
Luz Campos	MTC	415-778-5390	lcampos@bayareametro.gov
Artemise Davenport	GGBHTD	415-257-4581	adavenport@goldengate.org



Business Outreach Committee (BOC)

A Consortium of Bay Area Transit and Transportation Agencies

CONSULTATION MEETING 2019

Tuesday, April 2, 2019

12:00 PM – 1:00 PM

Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District (AC Transit)
1600 Franklin Street, Board Room
Oakland, CA 94612

MINUTES

1. Introduction/Background

- Artemise Davenport (BOC Chair/GGBHTD) began the meeting and gave a brief background of the BOC and the purpose of the consultation meeting.

- BOC member agency introductions:
 - Artemise Davenport, Golden Gate Bridge, Highway & Transportation District (GGBHTD)
 - Brooklyn Moore-Green, Alameda Contra Costa Transit District (AC Transit)
 - Phillip Halley, Alameda Contra Costa Transit District (AC Transit)
 - Tania Babcock, Eastern Contra Costa Transit Authority (Tri-Delta Transit)
 - Mike Furnary, Western Contra Costa Transit Authority (WestCat)
 - Sheila Evans-Peguese, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)
 - Todd Senigor, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)
 - Olga Medina, Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA)
 - Liz Brazil, Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA)
 - Dennis Ybarra, Solano County Transit (SolTrans)
 - Joseph Towner, San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
 - Hoa Sin, San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
 - Renee Kulick, Napa Valley Transportation Authority (NVTA)
 - Lauren Gularte, San Francisco Bay Ferry/Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA)
 - Kristina Martinez, Central Contra Costa Transit Authority (County Connection)
 - Luz Campos, Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC)

- Participant introductions:
 - Adam Gehlert, VSCE, Inc.
 - Cheryl Chambers, VSCE, Inc.

2. Roundtable Discussion

- Proposed Roundtable Discussion Topics
 - What are the major barriers for your members in competing for contracting opportunities?
 - What trades are there a lack/plethora of DBE participation?
 - What types of technical assistance do your members need most?
 - Do you have suggestions for resources and references that the BOC should develop, maintain, and disseminate to your members?
 - How can the Business Outreach Committee assist you in your mission?
- Artemise Davenport (GGBHTD) began the discussion by letting participants know each of the agencies present were in the process of establishing their three-year overall DBE goals for FFY 2020-2022. The BOC is seeking feedback from participants on items such as:
 - Issues within the DBE/SBE community.
 - Challenges to the DBE program.
 - What agencies can do to assist DBE/SBEs.
- Adam Gehlert (VSCE, Inc.) asked how the BOC could better reach contractors since his firm was the only participant in attendance during this session. Ms. Davenport noted that the BOC utilizes a variety of avenues to get information out, including mass e-mail distribution. Individual agencies also have registration options on their respective websites to receive notifications of events, procurements, etc. Mr. Gehlert stated that it would be great to have one main website (at least at the regional level) of all agency contracting opportunities instead of having to register through each individual website.
- Sheila Evans-Peguese (SFMTA) asked VSCE how they get in front of job opportunities before they hit the street. Mr. Gehlert replied that they participate in many networking opportunities and agency events. Liz Brazil (VTA) noted match-making events to build connections with prime contractors. Ms. Davenport also noted that the BOC may consider fine-tuning its annual “Meet the Primes” events to create more 1-on-1 opportunities/interviews for DBEs/SBEs and prime contractors.
- Cheryl Chambers (VSCE, Inc.) stated that DBEs need assistance on financial forms in the procurement process if they have not done it before. Ms. Evans-Peguese asked if it would be helpful for agencies to hold separate sessions to assist in completing all required forms. Ms. Chambers answered yes, indicating all involved departments should be present at those meetings.
- Phillip Halley (AC Transit) asked VSCE what types of financial requirements they have for firms they work with. Mr. Gehlert stated they generally have payment mechanisms in place that are consistent with state law. Agencies asked how others were encouraging their primes to submit bills on time and what types of different payment mechanisms were there to ensure subcontractors were being paid on time and primes were being held accountable. Ms. Brazil noted that one payment mechanism was through the use of an escrow account to ensure subcontractors were being paid on time. This is something agencies can consider during the contract negotiations process.
- Artemise Davenport (GGBHTD) asked if VSCE had any suggestions for resources and how the BOC could assist. Ms. Chambers noted more outreach and partnering up with different organizations (i.e. Conference of Minority Transportation Officials (COMTO)).

- Cheryl Chambers (VSCE) asked what the difference was between both sessions being held. Ms. Davenport explained the first session was geared towards business organizations, chambers of commerce, etc. that may be able to provide feedback on the DBE/SBE communities they work with. The second session is open to the general public and DBE/SBE community where they are able to comment on the goal-setting methodology agencies use to establish their overall goals and/or the DBE Program in general.
- Phillip Halley (AC Transit) asked VSCE how busy their organization was at this time. He noted that AC Transit has had a number of solicitations with a lack of, or no bids. He sought input on different advertising strategies and how other agencies were getting their information out.

ADJOURNMENT



Business Outreach Committee (BOC)

A Consortium of Bay Area Transit and Transportation Agencies

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION MEETING 2019

Establishing Overall Triennial DBE Goal for Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2020-2022

Tuesday, April 2, 2019

2:00 PM – 3:00 PM

Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District (AC Transit)
1600 Franklin Street, Board Room
Oakland, CA 94612

MINUTES

1. Introduction/Background

- Artemise Davenport (BOC Chair/GGBHTD) began the meeting and gave a brief background of the BOC and the purpose of the public participation meeting.
- BOC member agency introductions:
 - Artemise Davenport, Golden Gate Bridge, Highway & Transportation District (GGBHTD)
 - Brooklyn Moore-Green, Alameda Contra Costa Transit District (AC Transit)
 - Phillip Halley, Alameda Contra Costa Transit District (AC Transit)
 - Tania Babcock, Eastern Contra Costa Transit Authority (Tri-Delta Transit)
 - Mike Furnary, Western Contra Costa Transit Authority (WestCat)
 - Sheila Evans-Peguese, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)
 - Todd Senigor, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)
 - Olga Medina, Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA)
 - Liz Brazil, Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA)
 - Dennis Ybarra, Solano County Transit (SolTrans)
 - Joseph Towner, San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
 - Hoa Sin, San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
 - Renee Kulick, Napa Valley Transportation Authority (NVTA)
 - Lauren Gularte, San Francisco Bay Ferry/Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA)
 - Kristina Martinez, Central Contra Costa Transit Authority (County Connection)
 - Luz Campos, Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC)

2. Presentation: DBE Program Triennial Goal-Setting Methodology

- Olga Medina (VTA) provided an overview on the goal-setting methodology used by agencies in establishing their DBE goals. This included identifying contracting opportunities, setting a base figure, and making any adjustments as necessary. The presentation also included each participating agency's proposed goal as of that date.

3. Presentation: Nor-Cal PTAC

- K. Patrice Williams of Norcal Procurement Technical Assistance Center (PTAC) provided an overview of a no-cost service available to DBEs. These support services include bid matching, strategic planning, procurement counseling, and assistance with bid proposals/submittals.

4. Public Comments, Q&A

- Are race-neutral goals being phased out? Are you finding more success in race-conscious goals?
 - Sheila Evans-Peguese stated yes, however, race-conscious must be justified through a narrowly tailored disparity study.
- Artemise Davenport (GGBHTD) noted that these proposed goals are not confirmed as each agency continues to work through their respective departments. Each agency will publish their final proposed goals for thirty (30) days on their individual websites.
- How does WestCat have a 0% proposed goal? This does not look good from an outside perspective
 - Mike Furnary stated that WestCat does not anticipate receiving federal funding to use on its upcoming contracting opportunities. They anticipate using federal dollars for the purchase of vehicles, which is not included in this goal-setting process. Transit Vehicle Manufacturers (TVMs) are required to establish their own DBE goals.
- Is there anywhere on your website(s) where we can see past DBE participation/goal attainment? It would help to see the attainment and how DBE's could help achieve those goals.
 - Proposed goals will be posted on individual agency websites. In addition, most agencies report to their Board of Directors or Committees, the status of goal attainment and DBE participation for the fiscal year.
 - Liz Brazil (VTA) also noted that the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) website lists its top fifty (50) grantees past goals and attainment.
 - Artemise Davenport stated she would create a list to include DBE goals and attainment for each agency in attendance and will post to the Golden Gate Bridge District's website.
- This is a request for all agencies to make a coordinated effort in creating one major report that captures cumulative data related to the DBE program. This may include progress, challenges, participation, payments, etc. There are challenges with DBEs and SBEs being paid on time. The program should help small businesses grow and profit in the State of California.
- What level of tier are DBEs participating on contracts? How can DBEs move from the 5th or 6th tier to the 1st or 2nd tier?
 - Sheila Evans-Peguese (SFMTA) responded that although it is encouraged, it can be a challenge to unbundle contracts.
- I am not a DBE, but a SBE. What resources are available to SBEs?
 - Most agencies have a separate SBE component or program. There are also SBE goals on contracts.
- How do you start looking at teams before a RFP is even put out? Most are already formed beforehand.
 - Artemise Davenport (GGBHTD) responded that the BOC will be looking into creating more opportunities to help DBEs/SBEs build more working relationships through events such as matchmaking, networking, and interviews/1-on-1 with primes.
 - Sheila Evans-Peguese (SFMTA) encouraged reaching out to project managers at the specific agency and to primes in advance. Luz Campos (MTC) noted that MTC has a vendor database used during the procurement process, which will list everyone interested in a specific project. Artemise Davenport mentioned GGBHTD uses the same procurement portal as MTC.

- Our firm is interested in a SFMTA solicitation and have begun the process of reaching out to DBEs. Not all DBEs will call back/respond or are not interested, etc. What can we do?
 - Sheila Evans-Peguese (SFMTA) encouraged reaching out to the agency for assistance. Some DBEs need to update their phone numbers, have moved, etc.

5. **ADDITIONAL NETWORKING & ADJOURNMENT**



OVERALL DBE GOAL AND METHODOLOGY FFY 2020 – 2022

The San Francisco Bay Area’s Business Outreach Committee (BOC) was formed in November 2007, with the mission to help DBE and other small and/or local companies to expand their businesses by developing relationships with transit agency staffs and the contracting community of the San Francisco Bay Area. Its membership has grown to include twenty two agencies including:

1. Alameda County Transportation Commission (ACTC)
2. Alameda Contra Costa Transit District (AC Transit)
3. California High-Speed Rail Authority
4. Central Contra Costa Transit Authority (CCCTA)
5. City of Rio Vista / Delta Breeze
6. Golden Gate Bridge Highway and Transportation District (GGBHTD)
7. Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority (LAVTA)
8. Marin Transit
9. Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC)
10. Napa Valley Transportation Authority (NVTA)
11. San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
12. San Francisco County Transportation Authority (SFCTA)
13. San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA)
14. San Mateo County Transit District (SamTrans)
15. Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA)
16. Santa Cruz Metro (SCMTD)
17. Santa Rosa City Bus (SRCITY)
18. Solano County Transit (SolTrans)
19. Sonoma-Marin Area RAIL Transit District (SMART)
20. Transbay Joint Powers Authority (TJPA)
21. Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA)
22. Western Contra Costa Transit Authority (WESTCAT)

The BOC sent approximately 20,916 email invitations to a consultation meeting and public participation session held on April 2, 2019, at AC Transit Board Room. Invitations to the consultant meeting were sent to 160 community organizations and small business resources centers. Invitations to the public participation session were sent to 20,916 firms in the CUCP DBE listing, minority and women businesses, DOT grantees, and consultants/contractors registered in MTC’s vendor database.

Of the 1 firm that attended the consultation meeting and 24 firms that attended the public participation meeting, many commenters emphasized the need for more outreach to the DBE community, and the need for notification about upcoming procurement activities. Other issues mentioned by commenters included:

- How goals are set;
- Validity of CUCP database;
- DBE workshops for program overview and certification process;
- Lack of consequences for agencies not meeting DBE goals;
- Assistance/training for DBE firms on required forms in the procurement process;
- Transparency of actual DBE/SBE utilization;
- Length of time needed to obtain DBE certification;
- Prime contractors having pre-identified DBE/SBE subcontractors making it extremely difficult to get work;



OVERALL DBE GOAL AND METHODOLOGY FFY 2020 – 2022

- Suppliers being considered dealers, thus allowing only a portion of participation to count towards DBE goals;
- Central database or place where firms can find out about, and sign up for contracting opportunities for all the regional transportation agencies;
- Difficulty in identifying and establishing a working relationship with the prime contractors bidding on federally funded projects; and
- How to find out about upcoming contracting opportunities before bid issuance.

